Gauging the Impacts of Post-Disaster Arts and Culture Initiatives in Christchurch

A Literature Review

Prepared for Manatū Taonga - Ministry of Culture and Heritage
by Life and Vacant Spaces Charitable Trust, Christchurch
AUTHORS' STATEMENT:
This literature review was produced by Matthew Lesniak, an intern with Life in Vacant Spaces, with guidance and editorial support from our organisation. We tried to introduce Matt to the full breadth of arts and culture activity and history within Christchurch, and to ensure a thorough literature review. Nevertheless, it is certain that our knowledge and our networks are much stronger in the realm of temporary post-quake interventions than elsewhere. If there are any omissions or biases in this literature review, they are certainly not intentional. Though the Ministry for Culture and Heritage has to call this review ‘final’ and proceed from that point, we at LIVS like the idea of maintaining this as a living document as best we can. Please contact us – info@livs.org.nz – with any relevant studies we may have missed that were conducted/published prior to December 2015.

DISCLAIMER
The findings of the individual studies in the literature review are the opinion of the study authors, and are not those of the Ministry for Culture and Heritage or Life in Vacant Spaces. The Ministry does not accept any responsibility or liability whatsoever, whether in contract, tort, equity or otherwise, for any action taken, or reliance placed, as a result of reading any part, or all, of the information in this document or for any error, inadequacy, deficiency, flaw in or omission from the information provided in this document or its contents.
Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 5

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS FROM THE EXISTING RESEARCH ........................................... 6

CONCLUSIONS, REFLECTIONS AND OBSERVATIONS UPON THE COLLECTED RESEARCH ................................................................. 9

REVIEWS OF THE EXISTING RESEARCH ......................................................................... 12

SECTION A: STUDIES THAT HAVE PARTICULAR RELEVANCE TO CULTURAL BENEFITS ........................................................................ 12

Sell, David. “CAN Music in repair” ......................................................................................... 12
Ledanff, Susanne. “Cityscapes of Destruction and Rebuilding: Cinematographic Images of Berlin in the Nineties (Hubertus Siegert’s Film Berlin Babylon) and Art Practices in the City of Christchurch after the Earthquakes 2010/11.” ........................................................................ 14
Mazer, Sharon et al. “Reflections on Theatre and Performance in the (Post-) Earthquake Zone” ................................................................. 17
The Press. “Arts, finding solace in creativity” ........................................................................... 22
Oliver, Melanie. “Developing the Arts Ecology of Christchurch” ................................................... 25
Parker, George. “A new city through the arts” ........................................................................... 27
Amore, Alberto. “Regeneration from the rubble: Culture and creative urban renewal in post-earthquake Christchurch, New Zealand” ........................................................................ 29
Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management. “Community Resilience: Case studies from the Canterbury earthquakes” ........................................................................ 32
Tavares, Silvia et al. “Sustainability, microclimate and culture in post-earthquake Christchurch” ........................................................................ 34

SECTION B: STUDIES THAT HAVE PARTICULAR RELEVANCE TO SOCIAL BENEFITS ........................................................................ 37

Brejzek, Thea and Peter Falkenberg. “After the Rupture: Restoration or revolution” .................. 37
Fisher, Kevin. “Seismic Energy and Symbolic Exchange” .......................................................... 39
French, Blair. “Public practice post-disaster: SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial” ......................... 41
Wilson, Elizabeth. “Engaging youth on their own terms? An actor-network theory account of hip-hop in youth work” ....................................................................................... 46
Joyce, Zita et al. “ADA Mesh Cities: Network, Space and Memory in the Transitional City” .......... 49
Thomson, Christopher. “Digital technologies and material culture in post-earthquake Christchurch” .......... 51
Shermine, Kwok Shi Min. “Christchurch, City in Transition: A Study of Post Disaster Transitional Landscapes” ............................................................... 53
Montgomery, Roy. “Greening the Rubble in Christchurch: civic ecological reclamation efforts during a crisis event” ....................................................................................... 55
Wesener, Andreas. “Temporary urbanism and urban sustainability after a natural disaster: transitional community-initiated open spaces in Christchurch, New Zealand” ........................................................................ 58
Swaffield, Simon. “Place, Culture and Landscape after the Christchurch Earthquake” .......... 61
Valiance, Suzanne. “Urban Resilience: Bouncing Back, Coping, Thriving” ................................. 63
Wilson, Geoff A. “Community resilience, social memory and the post-2010 Christchurch (New Zealand) earthquakes” ........................................................................ 66

SECTION C: STUDIES THAT HAVE PARTICULAR RELEVANCE TO HEALTH BENEFITS ........................................................................ 69

Bidwell, Susan. “Evaluation of the Rockers of Ages Choirs” ...................................................... 69
Egan, Candice J and Mark C. Quigley. “Dancing earthquake science assists recovery from the Christchurch earthquakes” ........................................................................ 73
Joyce, Zita. “RadioQuake: Getting back ‘on air’ after the Christchurch earthquakes” ................. 76
Louise Thornley et al. “Building community resilience: Learning from the Canterbury earthquakes” ........................................................................ 79
Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority. “Canterbury Wellbeing Index June 2015” ........... 82
Bidwell, Susan. “The arts in health: evidence from the international evidence” ......................... 84

SECTION D: STUDIES THAT HAVE PARTICULAR RELEVANCE TO ECONOMIC BENEFITS ........................................................................ 88

Cooper, Craig. “Christchurch Venue Overview and Assessment Report” .................................... 91
Allan, Corey et al. “Value and culture: An economic framework” ............................................. 95
Mowlah, Andrew et al. “The value of arts and culture to people and society: an evidence review” ........................................................................ 98
BOP Consulting. “Measuring the economic benefits of arts and culture” ................................ 100
Introduction

The objective of the literature review is to gather and assess existing research on the impacts post-disaster arts and culture have had on social, economic, health and cultural wellbeing in Christchurch. This literature review is interested, in a broad sense, in any artistic and creative activities that have emerged in Christchurch after the 2010 and 2011 earthquakes – whether they have been implemented by newly formed organisations or are post-disaster activities of long-standing organisations. For the purpose of this study, ‘arts and culture initiatives’ excludes any heritage, sports and recreation activities and projects.

In an initial collation phase, studies were collected whose titles and abstracts indicated they might be relevant to this evaluation. The studies in that collation phase were organised and prioritised by their particular pertinence to the focus of this review. The authors and convenors of this review jointly selected which of the collated studies would be fully evaluated herein.

In addition to the formal studies, we sought any relevant data that local arts organisations had been keeping about their own activities. This includes information such as audience numbers, ticket sales, grants received, and participation with other local organisations or community institutions – particularly where there exists comparative pre-disaster data. The availability of this data relied on the organisations’ own resources and capacities to gather and produce this information, so the data is limited and sporadic, and has not been extensively utilised.

The studies and organisational data in the literature review have been categorised thematically, based upon their particular relevance to social, cultural, economic, or health impacts. This study hopes to identify some gaps in the existing research, and to help the Ministry for Culture and Heritage commission further research.
Summary of Findings from the Existing Research

The objective of this literature review is to assess existing research that has evaluated post-disaster creative and artistic programmes in Christchurch with respect to how they have impacted social, cultural, health and economic wellbeing in the community. The scope includes post-disaster activities of long-standing organisations, as well as newly created post-quake organisations and initiatives. The collection of materials looked at for this literature review comprises scholarly articles, conference proceedings, independent publications, wellbeing surveys, impact assessments and some uninterpreted raw data.

This process began by finding and collating any potentially relevant materials in an annotated bibliography. Pertinent sources were gathered with the help of local academics, community organisation members, Christchurch City Council, Creative New Zealand and Manatū Taonga Ministry for Culture and Heritage. With the assistance of Creative New Zealand, a large number of Christchurch arts organisations were approached directly and asked to provide any relevant materials or data they had, and any existing research they knew of. This bibliography was reviewed by the authors and Ministry for Culture and Heritage to select the materials for inclusion in this literature review. The selected studies have been included based upon their contribution to our understanding of the social, cultural, economic and health impacts of post-disaster artistic and creative responses.

This section of the literature review provides a summary of the strongest and most repeated findings encountered in the existing research.

1. **There have been perceived physical and mental health benefits for those participating in Christchurch’s post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives:** Numerous studies in this literature review argue that Christchurch’s post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives – both traditional art forms and ones that are more experimental and hard to classify – have provided participants and initiators with physical and mental health benefits. Traditional forms of art (for example participation in a choir or dance group) were primarily found to provide participants with mental health benefits such as reduction of stress and increased self-confidence. The more experimental projects that featured in the research (such as urban regeneration projects created by Gap Filler) were found to have fostered a sense of social cohesion and community empowerment. (*See especially Susan Bidwell; Canterbury Wellbeing Index; Candice J. Egan; Shernine Kwok; Andrew Mowlah; Louise Thornley et al.; Andreas Wesener; and Elizabeth Wilson.*)

2. **Arts and culture can help preserve and/or reinvent social memory, which contributes to post-disaster resilience and urban identity:** Several studies in the literature review have found that the loss of social memory – of urban landscapes, of architectural heritage and of previous community involvement and engagement in the city – has serious detrimental effects to the wellbeing of community members. They find that arts and culture can be key tools in preserving, recovering and creating new social memory, with positive impacts on community members’ abilities to be resilient and appropriately engage and participate in the emerging post-disaster city. (*See especially Thea Brejzek; Kevin Fisher; Zita Joyce [ADA Mesh Cities]; The Press; Simon Swaffield; Christopher Thomson; and Geoff A. Wilson.*)
3. **Having a collaborative and all-inclusive arts infrastructure is important for full recovery:** A variety of authors argue for the importance of having the appropriate resources and infrastructure to support a collective arts ecology. According to certain studies, a healthy arts infrastructure is one that enables both small-scale experimental initiatives and larger traditional and institutional programmes to co-exist and collaborate, performing very different functions within the overall arts ecology. The authors explain how a healthy arts infrastructure can strengthen the social, cultural and economic life of Christchurch, and involve the widest range of participants. (See especially Melanie Oliver; Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management; George Parker; The Press; and Elke Weesjes.)

4. **Community groups often played vital roles in their neighbourhood’s resilience and wellbeing:** Several studies argue that despite a lack of efficient support and responses from official recovery authorities, community groups and members were able to take initiative and create innovative forms of leadership and local governance to provide necessary services and amenities in their communities immediately after the earthquakes. Studies argue that in addition to the natural disaster, some “man-made disasters” – including certain political decisions from recovery authorities – have hindered a smooth recovery process. The result was that many community-led initiatives not only replaced official recovery authorities in the provision of services and amenities, but also contributed to social connectedness and mental and physical wellbeing. Arts and culture organisations often did not directly feature in these findings, though it can sometimes be inferred that arts and culture contributes to overall community social capital and therefore to this ability for communities to be resilient. (See especially Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management; Roy Montgomery; Simon Swaffield; Louise Thornley et al.; and Suzanne Vallance.)

5. **The presence of pre-existing community infrastructure contributes to stronger post-disaster community resilience:** The majority of the studies regarding community resilience argued that the presence of pre-disaster community infrastructure, such as active community groups and local governance models, significantly facilitates post-disaster community resilience. The existence of these kinds of structures allows for efficient grassroots responses that are essential for post-disaster recovery and resilience. Again, the benefits of neighbourhood arts and culture initiatives are more inferred than explicit in these studies. (See especially Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management; Louise Thornley et al.; Suzanne Vallance; Elizabeth Wilson; and Geoff Wilson.)

6. **Many individuals and cultural organisations have been eager to contribute to the emerging urban identity of post-disaster Christchurch:** The post-disaster resilience of Cantabrians has come largely in the form of citizens finding ways to contribute to the emerging landscape and identity of Christchurch. Numerous individuals have contributed through community service and volunteering; creating community organisations; initiating entrepreneurial projects; and contributing to public consultation forums, among other innovative and resilient responses. Arts and culture initiatives feature prominently as some of the primary ways citizens felt able to participate in the creation of a new city identity. Studies in this literature review argue that these post-disaster approaches have become a part of the new urban identity of Christchurch, and that Christchurch is now seen as an exemplary ‘transitional city’. (See especially Alberto Amore; Thea Brejzek; Blair French; Shermine Kwok; Susanne Ledanff; Simon Swaffield; and Silvia Tavares et al.)
7. **Traditional arts organisations have demonstrated adaptive capacities and resilient efforts:** Despite a lack of resources, loss of venues and personal traumatic experiences among staff, long-standing artistic and creative organisations displayed countless examples of adaptation and resilience. Authors in this literature review explain how musical organisations, art galleries, dance companies and orchestras continued to perform and produce events in alternative venues with fewer resources and staff – often experiencing benefits due to enforced co-location or collaboration. While this in itself does not prove their wider benefits to the community, it does indicate that arts and culture organisations may be among the most versatile and adaptable after disaster, and that communities with a strong arts and culture sector may be more resilient. (*See especially Alberto Amore; Candice J. Egan; Zita Joyce [Radio Quake]; Sharon Mazer; Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management; David Sell; The Press; Suzanne Vallance; and Elizabeth Wilson.*)

8. **Arts and culture initiatives should be included in the official recovery process in Christchurch:** Several studies in this literature review argue that the government’s Christchurch Central Recovery Plan does not adequately provide support or facilities for a multitude of arts organisations. The authors criticise the plan for only valuing traditional and well-entrenched arts and performance spaces, while alternative art forms are not recognised or accommodated by the proposed venues and precincts in the official plans. The studies also argue that the perspectives of the arts community would provide innovative approaches for the official rebuild planning processes: that rebuilding a city is an inherently creative process that would benefit from the perspective of artists and others who are proficient and experienced at trying new things. (*See especially Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority; Melanie Oliver; George Parker; The Press; and Louise Thornley et al.*)

9. **The provision of appropriate venues is vital for the prosperous and sustainable development of the arts and culture sector:** A few of the studies in this literature review discuss the importance of planning for a range of appropriate venues that cater to various artistic and creative institutions, events and programmes. The authors explain the need of many organisations to relocate venues, and the impact this had on the production and performance of certain activities. To properly provide the services and activities of their initiatives, many organisations need venues and spaces with quite specific amenities and capacities. (*See especially Craig Cooper; Andrew Moore; Morris Hargreaves McIntyre; Melanie Oliver; and Elizabeth Wilson.*)

10. **There is a perception that artistic and creative initiatives are impractical or superfluous in a post-disaster context:** While many residents were grateful for, engaged in and benefited from post-disaster arts and culture activities, some residents and authorities doubt the value, importance or necessity of these initiatives. Several studies present the public opinion that focus should be on more important services and amenities and that arts and culture should be de-prioritised post-disaster. Not everyone supported the allocation of public taxes towards creative temporary urban regeneration projects and other artistic and creative activities. Generally the researchers who presented this public opinion did not agree with it – but see it as an obstacle for a thriving arts and culture sector post-disaster. (*See Especially Morris Hargreaves McIntyre; Louise Thornley et al.; and Andreas Wesener.*)
Conclusions, Reflections and Observations upon the Collected Research

In addition to the key findings from the studies included in this literature review, some important trends and absences can be observed among the existing research that may influence the direction or need for future commissioned research.

- The relevant studies that were found are often indirectly relevant; most do not directly seek to gauge the benefits of post-disaster arts practices, but may touch upon that topic from the perspective of urban regeneration, community building, sociology, human geography and so on. Few studies actually focused on how specific artistic and creative initiatives impacted community wellbeing; rather, they were often evaluating a particular arts initiative from another disciplinary perspective, with only indirect evidence that there was a positive impact on community wellbeing. Future research could more directly assess and present the community impacts of arts and culture post-disaster.

- Most of the existing research focuses primarily on new creative practices founded since the earthquakes, many of which cannot be categorised under traditional art forms. There has been minimal research into the post-disaster impacts of traditional arts and long-standing arts and culture organisations. However, numerous studies also evaluate the resilience of pre-existing traditional arts organisations and institutions and their ability to adapt to post-disaster circumstances. Overall, there was significantly more coverage of temporary creative urban regeneration projects and major central city initiatives than traditional art forms and smaller suburban arts practices. Further research could investigate the impacts of more traditional art practices, especially those produced by smaller and localised organisations.

- The findings from these studies regarding the benefits of post-disaster artistic and creative activities are not necessarily indicative of the wider community wellbeing of Christchurch. Participation in these post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives is often limited to certain geographical communities or (more often) communities of interest, and the benefits may not directly reach broad and diverse communities. Further research could be conducted into the flow-on benefits to communities indirectly engaged in these arts and culture activities, and/or into how better to engage them.

- While the majority of these studies gently and indirectly suggest the positive impacts of specific arts and culture initiatives in Christchurch, there is exhaustive international literature that argues strongly for the social, cultural, economic, educational and health impacts of arts and culture activities and programmes. A major difficulty lies in measuring the economic impacts of artistic and creative initiatives, which is often essential for securing funding. Although new and more accessible post-disaster policies for distributing funds to creative initiatives have been created (e.g. CCC’s Transitional City Projects Fund and CNZ’s Earthquake Recovery Grants), these sorts of funds may not be applicable to foster a diverse range of activities and/or organisations, and may not be sustainable in the longer term. Another area for future research could be evaluating international models of alternative funding criteria for post-disaster (and increasingly ‘post-post-disaster’) arts and culture initiatives.
Most of the authors of the studies included in this literature review do not come from arts and culture backgrounds or perspectives. Professors or students of geography, sociology, landscape architecture, geological sciences and social sciences have conducted many of the studies. While some of the authors have (academic) theatre, music or visual art backgrounds, there is a notable lack of arts and culture researchers and practitioners evaluating the benefits of arts and culture practices.

There seems to be a significant interest and trend to do with issues of public involvement in the design of cities. Many of the studies in this review focus primarily on urban design and community engagement, and indirectly touch upon the impacts of certain types of public and participatory arts and culture practices. Further research could address these public and participatory arts practices from an arts perspective, and/or investigate the significant blurring of these two disciplines. (The 2015 Turner Prize winners Assemble, a collective who use art, design and architecture to create projects in tandem with communities, is further evidence of this trend.)

When we sought organisational data from arts organisations themselves, many seemed to lack this information or the resources to produce this information. Instead, bodies such as Creative New Zealand and the Ministry for Culture and Heritage are often the ones evaluating the economic and social impacts of arts organisations and initiatives. Perhaps especially in the post-disaster situation, many organisations were focused on their core activities with less documentation, data collection and reflection than under normal circumstances. Furthermore, the materials and information gathered by these organisations generally only indirectly measured their organisations’ impacts on community wellbeing. The impacts of arts and cultural activities are difficult to measure and this is expressed in several studies (see especially “Measuring the economic benefits of arts and culture” by BOP Consulting). There may be further opportunities to support artistic and creative organisations and individuals to self-evaluate and provide more information regarding the overall community impacts of their programmes. (See especially the Christchurch Art Gallery’s ‘year in review’ for a documentation framework that includes data regarding gallery publications, exhibitions, number of attendees, inward and outward loans, awards and prizes, partnerships and invited public lectures and industry workshops).

Despite some major public artworks such as Lonnie Hutchinson’s I Like Your Form and the massive Te Matatini Kapa Haka Festival in Christchurch in 2015, we could find little material or specific data on the impact of Māori and Pasifika arts. The study “Building community resilience: learning from the Canterbury earthquakes” by Louise Thornley et al. discusses resilient approaches of marae communities, but does not examine any particular artistic or creative initiatives. The value of Māori and Pasifika arts and culture traditions and activities must be evaluated with further detail.

The bulk of the research has been published by salaried academics or postgraduate students. Some of the most poignant research, however, has been produced by independent publishers with niche interests and/or by voluntary independent researchers not affiliated with an academic institution or cultural organisation. We can infer that a lot of relevant research has not been conducted or published because the (independent, unaffiliated) researchers are not compensated to publish. Further research or resourcing could go towards developing and/or supporting relevant arts and culture publishing enterprises.
• The majority of the studies were conducted using qualitative methodologies such as in-depth interviews and (more often) participant observation and theoretical analysis. Only a few studies used quantitative methodologies such as surveys or questionnaires. This indicates the difficulty in providing quantitative evidence of the benefits of arts and culture initiatives. Further studies could develop a quantitative methodology that appropriately and holistically measures the benefits of arts and culture activities. (Susan Bidwell's study “The arts in health – evidence from the international evidence” provides numerous examples of studies that measure the arts both qualitatively and quantitatively.)

These conclusions and observations are in no way comprehensive. Many more gaps could be identified in the existing collected research, and many other inferences could be drawn from this collection. The authors hope that this can be a living document that grows; gets interpreted and reinterpreted by others; and is useful to other researchers and arts and culture organisations and funders.
REVIEWS OF THE EXISTING RESEARCH

SECTION A: Studies that have particular relevance to Cultural Benefits

Sell, David. “CAN Music in repair”

Brief Analysis

• **Time period covered by the study:** The study was meant to be a long-term research project that would have been completed in March 2011, but was postponed due to the September 2010 earthquake. The original CAN Music began in 2010 as a database of music education organisations in Christchurch. The original database was abandoned in mid-2011 and this conference paper comes from the 2011 and 2012 Australia and New Zealand Association for Research in Music Education (ANZARME) Conference.

• **Methodology Used:** A database of musical organisations in Christchurch, interviews with selected leaders of musical organisations, followed by more detailed profiles of the impact on the community of three musical organisations in the city.

• **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The database is made up of musical organisations, listed in three categories: Performance (choir, band and orchestra, but also ethnic/cultural, ensembles, and combined arts); Educational; and Other (clubs, churches, therapy, professional, festivals, and recreational). The three representative organisations that were chosen for further analysis were the Christchurch School of Music, the Champion Centre, and CHART.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the study is on the resilience of the musical organisations of Christchurch in a post-disaster context. The original study was meant to analyse three different musical organisations that contributed to the musical growth and activity in the city, and the impact on the city of these organisations.

• **Particular relevance:** This conference paper summary has particular relevance to cultural and social impacts, specifically regarding a range of musical organisations following the earthquakes. The summary highlights the resilience of these musical organisations in post-disaster Christchurch.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** The study is directly related to the benefits of musical activities that have adapted and recovered from the Christchurch earthquakes. The study aims to evaluate how musical organisations have coped with a disaster at a time where the community was in need for cultural activity, whilst musical organisations had fewer resources.
Study Description
This conference paper explains how CAN Music, a long-term research project on musical organisations in Christchurch, was postponed due to the Christchurch earthquakes. The study continued post-disaster; however, it shifted its focus to adhere to the post-disaster context in Christchurch. The original study included a database of musical organisations in Christchurch, and chose a representative sample size of three organisations to analyse how musical organisations impacted the community.

For the newer version of the paper, a second database was constructed with the aim of recording how musical organisations had coped through and after the earthquakes. The paper is concerned with what happened to the studios and offices, music libraries, instruments, and rehearsal spaces of nearly thirty musical organisations and many more individuals who worked, taught, and made music there. The paper seeks to identify elements of change in the musical lives of the city.

Key Findings
The paper uses the case of the Christchurch School of Music (CSM) to highlight certain aspects of loss among the musical community post-disaster. Through interviews with the School’s President and Musical Director, multiple factors emerged that sum up the problems facing music organisations as a result of the earthquakes, and their handling of the outcomes. A comparison of the earlier CAN Music database and the new CAN Music in repair database reveal the upheaval caused by the loss of facilities, the effect of personal loss, issues with leadership continuity and consistency, decreases in student enrolment, and a loss of morale among staff.

Despite these losses and difficulties, the author notes that: “Like the city itself, as the CSM recovers from such a huge setback, confidence returns, and sights are directed forward again. An impatience to ‘get on with it’ emerges, and as confidence returns, goals and ideas for development are felt to become attainable” (pg. 4). Among these difficulties there is a consensus that emerging possibilities will arise and that the musical community will continue to adapt and be resilient.

Provenance
David Sell was a senior lecturer in music at the University of Canterbury. In his twenty-eight years on the full-time staff at UC he rose to reader/associate professor, served two terms as Dean of Music and Fine Arts, and was eight years Head of the School of Music. Since retiring, he has continued as a part-time lecturer, specialising in music education.

CAN Music in repair analyses three different musical organisations in Christchurch to comprehend the ability of musical organisations to cope in a post-disaster context. The original study had already interviewed and examined these organisations; therefore, the data in the paper had some comparative information to refer to. This comparative evidence is limited but certainly provided additional support to the arguments made. The number of musical organisations that could be contacted for the database had also reduced, and this comparison also shows the losses and difficulties of musical organisations in Christchurch post-disaster.

Objectivity
The study uses a large sample size of musical organisations in Christchurch to evaluate the impacts of musical activities on the community and to highlight the difficulties that these organisations have dealt with since the Christchurch earthquakes. The paper also includes supporting arguments on the benefits of music teaching and education for the wider community. An appendix within the paper includes other University of Canterbury earthquake-generated and related studies.
Persuasiveness
The arguments in this study are supported by other recent studies, and a database collated by the author. The study also uses three different musical organisations to typify the resilience of musical organisations in Christchurch after the earthquakes. The original study had to be postponed due the circumstances of the earthquakes, and the preceding edition of the study has still not been completely published. This review is according to a conference paper draft that was provided to us by the author. It is important to note that the paper draft is incomplete, and additional information regarding the database and other musical organisations would be valuable.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
The study examines the efforts of the musical community to cope with the earthquakes. A lack of resources and institutions contributed to the difficulties that musical organisations had to deal with post-earthquakes. The paper uses a database of musical organisations that was collated by the author to evaluate the resilience of the musical activity and life of Christchurch post-earthquakes. The author argues that the resilient efforts of musical organisations (specifically the CSM) have contributed to an increase of confidence among those organisations, and new goals and ideas for development are once again felt to be achievable. The study focuses on the resilience of a few musical organisations; however, the author does not argue that the benefits of these efforts are representative of the overall cultural wellbeing of the Christchurch community.

Ledanff, Susanne. “Cityscapes of Destruction and Rebuilding: Cinematographic Images of Berlin in the Nineties (Hubertus Siegert’s Film Berlin Babylon) and Art Practices in the City of Christchurch after the Earthquakes 2010/11.”


Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** The study compares two periods of cities rebuilding themselves in two different contexts: Berlin, Germany, after the fall of the Berlin Wall and post-2010 and 2011 earthquakes Christchurch, New Zealand. The study specifically analyses Hubertus Siegert’s film Berlin Babylon (2001) and Free Theatre Christchurch’s performance of Canterbury Tales (2013).

- **Methodology used:** Comparative case study, and correlated literature.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** Although the study mentions several post-quake cultural organisations and arts organisations in Christchurch, the study focuses on the Free Theatre and their production of Canterbury Tales (2013).

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** Regarding the local Christchurch case study, the paper analyses Free Theatre’s production of Canterbury Tales, performed at the second Festival of Transitional Architecture on 25-28 October 2013. The Free Theatre emerged as an independent entity in 1979 at the University of Canterbury, and had multiple contributions to post-earthquakes artistic responses.
• **Particular relevance:** This conference paper has particular relevance to the cultural impacts of post-disaster cinematic and theatrical productions, and explores current artistic interpretations of the cityscape of the inner city of Christchurch. The paper cites the Free Theatre’s *Canterbury Tales* performance as one of the many creative responses to the transitional city of Christchurch after the earthquakes.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This conference paper focuses specifically on an artistic activity that was performed in response to the earthquakes. The paper argues that this artistic response (Free Theatre’s *Canterbury Tales* performance) represents the overall chaos and difficulties of the reconstruction phase in Christchurch, acting as a post-modern urban image production.

**Study Description**
This conference paper is from the Mediated City Conference at Woodbury University in 2014. The paper compares two case studies – Hubertus Siegert’s film *Berlin Babylon* (2001) and Free Theatre’s performance of *Canterbury Tales* (2013) – to analyse different artistic responses in a rebuild context. The author highlights the different contexts, one being the rebuild of a city after a socio-political movement, the other being a post-disaster transitional context. The paper is a comparative case study “dealing with artistic responses to abrupt city transformations or natural disasters” (pg. 5).

The paper explains how these two cities reacted in a creative manner to a “transitional cityscape of uncanny Otherness” – periods of transition that required creativity and arts to represent the physical changes and ambitions of rebuild projects. In the author’s own words, “It is my claim that the arts make a difference in stepping into the collective experience of the return of an archaic city Otherness” (pg. 4). The author argues that in both cases the arts play a particular role in post-modern urban image creation during a rebuilding phase.

**Key Findings**
Ledanff structures the paper by supporting her argument through both case studies. Specifically she argues that both cities “are symptomatic of two different phases of postmodern urban image creation in the way they relate to postmodern consumerist and event culture in terms of the ‘society of spectacle’ (Guy Debord) or a festivalisation of urban culture” (pg. 1).

In regards to Hubertus Siegert’s film *Berlin Babylon* (2001), the author notes the film is a metaphor for the mythical tale of the building of the Tower of Babylon in The Genesis. The film also has more literal meanings in it, which aim to represent the reconstruction of Berlin’s city centre, a city that was dealing with a healing process due to its destruction, wounds, and voids. Ledanff says this film served as a sort of city branding method: “This Otherness could be used by city marketing; it contributed to the party mood at festivals, but *Berlin Babylon* brings out the emotional ambiguities of the uncanny as an “uneasy space between the physical city and the imaginary” (pg. 3).

Free Theatre Christchurch’s *Canterbury Tales* example is also argued to be a representation of the post-earthquakes environment in Christchurch. The performance is seen as a “multilayered, mythological imagination of the city” that contributes to a better understanding of the transitional “Otherness” that started soon after the earthquakes. For Ledanff, the performance represents the various “urbanistic-artistic experimentation(s) in post-quake Christchurch” (pg. 6). She notes that: “One aspect of the up-to-date postmodernity in Christchurch’s rebuild is that the plans for the inner city and the current temporary uses of space profit very much from the ideas of a city revival in
terms of an artsy city as a desirable urban lifestyle quality” (pg. 4). In other words, the author argues that the cultural activities that have emerged post-disaster are represented through the Canterbury Tales performance and have contributed to a new urban identity.

Provenance
Susanne Ledanff was previously Associate Professor and Subject Coordinator in German, at the University of Canterbury’s College of Arts. Before coming to Canterbury, Susanne was Assistant Professor at the Technical University Berlin, and Lecturer at the Obafemi Awolowo University, Nigeria. Ledanff’s research interests include Goethe reception, Classical Period, new Berlin literature after 1989, German literature, and Contemporary German culture.

Ledanff cites several other authors who also argue the cultural and political implications of “urban imagery”, including Michel de Certeau and James Donald. In Imagining the Modern City, James Donald specifically speaks about the challenges of modern day urban life, and how creativity and imagination has shaped cities and their urban environment through the creation of public spaces, architecture, public art forms, etc. Michel de Certeau also frequently talks about how the common man can reclaim autonomy from economic and political forces through artistic creation. These theories support Ledanff’s argument that Hubertus Siegert's Berlin Babylon film and the Free Theatre’s Canterbury Tales performance are representative of artists reclaiming their spaces in a post-destruction environment of political, social, and economic chaos.

Objectivity
The paper does not include evidence contrary to its own arguments. The author notes that studies regarding these situations of post-disaster urban experimentation are a bit limited, and Ledanff suggests a potential study regarding “a comparative project dealing with artistic responses to abrupt city transformations or natural disasters” (pg. 5). The author’s arguments about post-modernist urban image creation and post-disaster urban experimentation are not contested in the study. The convergence of philosophical concepts that relate to classical artistic periods with urban regeneration methods may or may not be relevant. Additionally, most of the authors cited are included as supporting arguments.

Persuasiveness
The author’s arguments about post-modernist urban image creation and post-disaster urban experimentation are relevant in the case studies used. In both cases, the cities (Berlin and Christchurch) have dealt with a significant phase of destruction and loss of social and physical memory, and the use of artistic experimentation has contributed to the new image of the rebuilding cities. Ledanff argues that transitional creative initiatives like those of Gap Filler, the Free Theatre, and others have recreated Christchurch’s city image in a post-disaster context. The need for experimentation and innovation in a period of “transitional Otherness” was and is felt here in Christchurch, and has been dealt with through artistic and creative experimentation.

One weakness of the study is the ambiguous use of the term “Otherness”. The author brings the phrase of a “transitional cityscape of Otherness”, and does not define this concept, although it is reasonably comprehensible through the context. The concept, however, is not fully supported or explained. This may be due to the limitations of what could be included in the length of the conference paper. Otherwise this concept is relevant regarding the different contexts discussed in the paper.
Value in relation to community wellbeing
The study argues how creative experimentation in a post-disaster context can contribute to resilience from destruction and chaos. The paper also explains how these artistic initiatives are creating a fresh new perception and image of a city, and how they change the post-modern urban image creation of that city. According to the study, this is especially true in Christchurch, where post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives have played a role in the city’s tourism sector, Christchurch City Council’s transitional policies, urban regeneration organisations, and other important contributions to city making and rebuilding.

Mazer, Sharon et al. “Reflections on Theatre and Performance in the (Post-) Earthquake Zone”

Brief Analysis
Time period covered by the study: This study covers different performance-based activities and rituals that took place post-earthquake. Examples include the gathering held in Hagley Park in direct response to the earthquakes in which Prince William, the Mayor, the Bishop, and a few singers were present; the Arts Centre’s A Shortcut to Happiness on 10 December 2011; the Loons’ Macbeth performance in August 2011; and Victor Rodger’s Aftershocks: Struggle and Dust in C-Town. These are just a few examples of the performances held in response to the earthquakes, and the study covers additional examples.


- Organisations / events covered by the study: The study covers already existing theatre and performance programmes such as the Arts Centre and Free Theatre, but also newer organisations such as FESTA and Gap Filler. The study focuses on several other post-disaster theatre and performance activities.

- When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? The focus of the study is on post-disaster theatrical and performance based activities in Christchurch. Long standing theatre programmes and producers held some of these activities, while others were organised by new post-disaster organisations.

- Particular relevance: This study has particular relevance to the cultural impacts of several theatre and performance based activities and programmes – official and unofficial – that were created in response to the earthquakes. Different preliminary perspectives explain how these activities contribute to community resilience and in creating a new Christchurch identity.

- Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This study is directly related to how post-disaster cultural activities contribute to community wellbeing and resilience.
Study Description
This study analyses the responses of the theatre and performance sectors of Christchurch post-earthquakes. The study contemplates what is required for a resilient theatre and performance sector in a post-disaster zone. Through various examples of post-disaster traditional theatre performances and more contemporary performances held in public spaces, the study examines these transitional activities. The different contributors to this paper wonder how the city’s destruction has impacted cultural activities, and in turn how these activities have contributed to new conversations and discussions about community and urban experimentation. The author notes “the collapse of the city’s buildings has opened up a liminal space for ongoing experimentation with and debate about the potential of theatre and performance to create new ideas about community and citizenship” (pg. 70). The objective of the essays and play excerpts in this study is to stimulate conversations about theatrical experimentation and its role in community resilience and city making.

Key Findings
This study includes two play excerpts and additional preliminary perspectives from or about contributors to post-disaster cultural activities. There is a play excerpt from Victor Rodger’s Aftershocks: Struggle and Dust in C-Town and Still Lives (performed by A Different Light) by Tony McCaffrey, Glen Burrows, Ben Morris, and Isaac Tait. Additional essays included are an evaluation of Still Lives – A Different Light by Emma Willis; a discussion by Ryan Reynolds about performative invitations to public spaces; Simon Troon’s explanation of the contributions to the preservation of architectural heritage by the iconic Christchurch Wizard; and George Parker’s discussion on embracing impermanence and the transitional movements in post-disaster Christchurch. A few key points from each excerpt and essay include:

• The play excerpt from Aftershocks: Struggle and Dust in C-Town critiques the priorities of certain recovery authorities in contrast to some of the more pressing issues of lack of public infrastructure and amenities (e.g. Gerry Brownlee’s concern over the Cathedral rather than the city’s sewage / toilets).

• Simon Troon explains how The Wizard can save our souls: “The Wizard has consistently engaged with the city in this way, contesting the meanings of public spaces by developing performative responses to particular social events. The Wizard conjures colonial imperialism without acknowledging its many cruelties, but his capacity to imagine an alternative Christchurch and then enact it demonstrates the power of performance post-disaster and against established hierarchies” (pg. 77).

• Ryan Reynolds suggests the importance of performative invitations: “A literal invitation, a sign on a street corner asking people to dance or swap a book, is in our view far less effective than a performative invitation, a re- framing of space that encourages, and makes comfortable, otherwise aberrant behaviours. The earthquakes in Christchurch have both intensified our restrictive and repressive society, and invited the possibility and desire to change that radically” (pg. 79).

• Emma Willis evaluates Still Lives – A Different Light: “Still Lives’ use of metaphor drew from the social model of disability, which proposes that individuals are not inherently disabled, but rather find themselves disabled by the attitudes, allocation of resources, and so on of prevailing cultures. In this sense, the metaphor of disabled city was used both to critique old social norms and to make claims for new ones” (pg. 85).
George Parker embraces impermanence in Christchurch and other cities worldwide: “There is every possibility that Christchurch can become known as a creative and intellectual capital of the transitional. It could even become a permanent way of operating: not just an empty marketing gimmick but a very pragmatic and progressive response to global challenges as well as the particular, immediate challenges faced by a city where the ground continues to move” (pg. 85).

The author explains that each of the contributor’s perspectives represent individual efforts to construct narratives that allow a temporary restoration of order. According to the author, these narratives are not only cathartic, but also pragmatic as they provide records for post-disaster experiences and activities.

Provenance
Sharon Mazer was an Associate Professor at University of Canterbury’s School of Theatre and Film Studies. She is now an Associate Professor of Theatre and Performance Studies at AUT University. Other contributors to this collection of essays include Ryan Reynolds (co-founder of Gap Filler and Life in Vacant Spaces), George Parker (manager and occasional producer and actor with Free Theatre Christchurch), and Victor Rodgers (playwright and scriptwriter of Samoan heritage). Each of these contributors plays a significant role in a certain post-disaster cultural activity in Christchurch.

The essay includes relevant theatre performances that occurred in Christchurch post-earthquakes, as well as other experimental cultural activities that can be considered performance based. The incorporation of both traditional forms of theatre and more experimental performative activities creates a comprehensive evaluation of theatre and performance in post-disaster Christchurch. This being said, the authors are able to analyse the impacts of the current cultural activities of Christchurch, and their role in the future of Christchurch’s cultural sector.

Objectivity
This paper includes preliminary perspectives from multiple professionals involved in post-disaster performance-based activities in Christchurch. The approach of the paper is to include multidisciplinary opinions of what constitutes theatre- and performance-based activities in Christchurch. The diversity of perspectives in the paper gives an alternative interpretation to theatre and performance activities. The interpretations made in this paper about what can be included in theatre and performance activities may challenge conventional understandings of what theatre and performance is.

Persuasiveness
This essay differentiates different forms of post-disaster performance-based activities in Christchurch. Whether this is The Wizard protesting in public spaces about architectural heritage, or transitional collaborative festivals like FESTA, or even more traditional theatre performances with post-disaster plots, the essay evaluates the theatre- and performance-based activities that have occurred since the earthquakes. Although these sorts of activities may not generally be associated with one another, the essay is able to explain why they are similar in a post-disaster context in Christchurch. Innovative and interdisciplinary collaboration has been an exemplary approach of post-disaster recovery in Christchurch, and the inclusion of different types of performance-based activities in this paper represents these post-disaster approaches. The selected contributions are, however, short in length and do not necessarily have supporting evidence.
Value in relation to community wellbeing

The contributors in this paper do not directly state the impacts of artistic and creative initiatives towards community wellbeing; however, they do suggest their implications for a return to a sense of pre-disaster normalcy. This paper specifically identifies multiple theatre and performance based activities, and their resilience in a post-disaster context. The paper examines the ability for pre-existing cultural activities to adapt to a lack of resources and implement new activities according to what has been available (or not) after the earthquakes in Christchurch. The paper also evaluates alternative performance-based activities and how they have impacted the cultural sector with innovative post-disaster activities.


Brief Analysis
• **Time period covered by the study:** The study analyses the classical musical life of Christchurch from the September 2010 earthquake up until May 2013.

• **Methodology Used:** First-hand reports (published in daily newspapers and from releases prepared by the musical organisations concerned), participant observation, and direct interviews (with the exception of several interviews that were conducted by telephone or email).

• **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The study researches a wide range of long-standing and emerging classical music organisations based in Christchurch, with both national and local profiles. The study focuses on the orchestral scene, the opera scene, the choral scene, the School of Music at the University of Canterbury, independent music academies, and registered music teachers.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** A significant number of the organisations examined in this study are long-standing organisations; however, the study also examines organisations and performances initiated after the earthquakes.

• **Particular relevance:** This study has direct relevance to the social, cultural, and health impacts of the post-disaster classical music scene in Christchurch. Particular chapters in the study evaluate the role of music therapy in post-disaster environments, and how music can provide emotional relief in times of stress.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is related to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives of both long-standing and emerging organisations, institutions, and individuals. The study evaluates the resilience of classical music organisations and recognises the importance of music in maintaining a sense of normality for people.
Study Description
This study provides an extensive review of the classical music life of post-disaster Christchurch. The author analyses a wide range of classical music organisations, and conducts numerous direct interviews with individuals engaged in these organisations. The study specifically analyses these classical music organisations according to the loss of performance venues, use of alternative venues, and the financial and personal effects of the earthquakes upon these organisations and individuals involved in these organisations. The study also evaluates how a disaster can provide inspiration for innovation and creativity, and examines the emerging classical musical initiatives that were created in response to the earthquakes. Finally, the study argues that some political and bureaucratic decisions made post-disaster are having an effect on the recovery of the musical scene in Christchurch.

Key Findings
As noted above, the study evaluates the barriers that musical organisations had to overcome in response to the damage caused by the earthquakes. Organisations, both at the national and local level, experienced specifically a loss of performance venues; inaccessibility of music libraries and administrative records; loss of instruments, musical production resources, financial and personal effects; and administrative and organisational changes. This significant list of barriers made it difficult for musical organisations to continue their activities, and many resorted to site sharing and alternating timetables.

The author also studies the School of Music at the University of Canterbury. Some difficulties experienced include a shortage of performance spaces (both on and off campus), reorganisation of courses and teaching timetables, loss of instruments and research material use of temporary offices and classrooms, and decreases in student enrolment numbers. The earthquakes did, however, allow the “University School of Music to assume a leading role in the restoration of this (re-establishment of musical organisations) most important art form” (pg. 166). For the majority of the students and professors in the School of Music, the earthquake contributed to significantly more inconveniences than benefits.

The post-disaster governmental policies (both local and central) are also evaluated in the study, especially regarding the City Council’s building restoration policy (which created significant disruptions for small businesses) and the indecisiveness around the restoration of the Town Hall (which impacts specifically symphony orchestras and large choral societies). Despite all these barriers and inconveniences, the study argues that there is a perception “among members of the public to whom the author has spoken that, regardless of the organisational difficulties involved in scheduling concert performances, there have been more concerts in Christchurch in 2012 and early 2013, than there were prior to the earthquakes” (pg. 295). The study also recognises the importance of music therapy in post-disaster environments, and the use of music to assist people in managing their lives. The author explains that in order for future and continual resilience amongst musical organisations readiness is essential and suggests the digitisation of musical libraries and administrative and financial records.
Provenance
This study is a thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a Master of Arts in the School of Music, at University of Canterbury. The supervisors of this thesis were Elaine Dobson (ex-Senior Lecturer in Ethnomusicology and Composition, School of Music) and Dr. Jonathan Le Cocq (Pro-Vice Chancellor in the College of Arts). The study provides extensive supporting evidence through correlated literature, participant observation, questionnaires, and in-depth interviews. The author also used first-hand reports from releases prepared by the musical organisations concerned and publications from local newspapers. The re-transcriptions of the interviews are well organised and included within one of the appendixes.

Objectivity
The author has an informed perspective on the classical music scene in Christchurch. Moore chooses to evaluate numerous musical organisations from a variety of genres including the choral scene, the orchestral scene, and the opera scene. The author also chooses to evaluate organisations at both the national and local level, including the School of Music at University of Canterbury and independent music academies. Given the author’s personal experience within the classical music scene of Christchurch, he is able to differentiate the different scales of classical musical organisations in Christchurch.

Persuasiveness
The author has previous experience within the classical music scene in Christchurch as a practising musician (choir singer). Therefore, Moore has been associated with choral and operatic scenes of Christchurch’s musical life, as well as the School of Music at the University of Canterbury. Moore explains that “A lifetime of singing in small choirs, often with only one or two voices to a part, has meant that, in the voice-related areas covered in this thesis, the approach to research has been from the point of view of a participant observer – an insider. Even so, my observations were always discussed with the interviewee to ensure accuracy” (pg. 9). Moore’s insider perspective, alongside in-depth interviews with relevant actors within the classical music scene of Christchurch, gives us a well-developed analysis of the classical musical organisations in Christchurch.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has direct relevance to how classical musical organisations have been impacted by the 2010 and 2011 earthquakes. Specifically the study examines the resilience of these organisations, as well as the importance of producing and accessing music in post-disaster stressful environments. The study argues that classical music organisations and their activities have contributed therapeutic health benefits. In addition to the evidence provided about the health impacts of classical music organisations, the study also provides an informative and well-organised classification of these organisations.

The Press. “Arts, finding solace in creativity”

Brief Analysis
• Time period covered by the study: This chapter comes from A City Recovers: Christchurch two years after the quakes, a book published by The Press. The book covers the state of Christchurch two years after the earthquakes. The book was published in 2013.
• **Methodology Used:** Unavailable

• **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This chapter covers multiple arts and cultural organisations that have existed before the earthquakes and that have emerged in response to the earthquakes. Some of the organisations included are the Christchurch Art Gallery, Christchurch Arts Festival, SCAPE Biennale of Art in Public Space, Body Festival of Dance and Physical Theatre, and Arts Voice.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of this study is on both post-disaster initiatives and ongoing activities.

• **Particular relevance:** This chapter has particular relevance to the social and cultural impacts of arts and culture organisations. This chapter explains how the arts have the potential to play a major role in the mental and physical recovery from the earthquakes.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This chapter focuses on the resilience of arts and culture activities and organisations post-disaster. It analyses the efforts of emerging and pre-existing organisations to perpetuate and strengthen the arts community post-disaster.

**Study Description**

This chapter from *A City Recovers: Christchurch two years after the quakes*, is entitled “Arts, Finding Solace in Creativity*. A City Recovers: Christchurch two years after the quakes* is an in-depth analysis of the social, economic, and demographic changes and the implications for Christchurch two years after the earthquakes. This particular chapter reviews the cultural activities that continued post-disaster, despite a lack of studio and performance spaces. The author notes that “In small and large ways, individually and collectively, Christchurch’s arts community reacted to an unfolding human disaster with innovation and resilience, proving beyond any doubt that the arts have played – and will continue to play – a pivotal role in the city’s recovery (pg. 300)*. This chapter gives numerous examples of various arts organisations that continued to provide cultural services and events to the people of Christchurch, and the importance of these resilient efforts for the social and economic capital of the city.

**Key Findings**

This chapter gives an in-depth overview of numerous cultural and arts organisations and activities that remained resilient post-disaster. The chapter analyses theatre, symphony, music and dance performances, exhibition spaces, lobby groups, and other contemporary urban artistic initiatives. The book evaluates the resilience of these organisations, and their role in perpetuating the arts and culture sector of Christchurch. Some examples include:

• **Creative New Zealand:** The book examines their role in forming an earthquake emergency response fund to help fund creative ventures, subsidising ticket prices, and providing economic security to artists and organisations.

• **Isaac Theatre Royal:** The preservation of the Isaac Theatre Royal was essential in maintaining the social memory and heritage of an important cultural site. The theatre’s general manager, Neil Cox, recognised the importance of rebuilding the Theatre with the original design and architecture to preserve pre-disaster heritage (which was significantly lost).
• Christchurch Symphony Orchestra: “Despite the human and physical dislocation caused by the earthquakes, the CSO did not lose any of its 60 or so players during the following tumultuous two and half years” (pg. 298).

• Arts Voice Christchurch: Their role as a lobby group for arts organisations is emphasised, for launching a 2012/13 summer season of entertainment and arts, organising debates and community forums among arts organisations, and assuring that the arts and artists of Christchurch remain prominent in the city.

• Resilience of other organisations such as Christchurch Art Gallery (serving as the Civil Defence headquarters), Christchurch Arts Festival, SCAPE Biennale of Art in Public Space, Body Festival of Dance and Physical Theatre.

Provenance
A City Recovers: Christchurch two years after the quakes was published by Random House New Zealand for The Press two years after the initial earthquake. The chapters in the book are written by various Press journalists, and the selected chapter was written by Christopher Moore. Christopher Moore is the Arts Editor for The Press and has been reporting on the local arts scene pre- and post-disaster. The examples given in this book come from The Press’s team of experienced reporters and provides professional insight on the state of Christchurch two years after the earthquakes.

Objectivity
The examples of arts organisations cited in this chapter include both pre-existing and emerging organisations and also large-scale institutions and grassroots initiatives. The chapter seems to support the perspectives of the arts community that they must be a prominent aspect of the rebuild strategy. The author notes that “They (the arts) were an integral partner and the authorities involved in the process, notably the Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority (CERA), ignored this fact at their peril” (pg. 287). Additionally, the chapter analyses the importance of groups like Arts Voice, who suggest a “co-ordinated and collaborative approach by the arts community and related industry and business” (pg. 293). The general consensus of this chapter is that the arts have the potential to play a major role in the recovery of the earthquakes.

Persuasiveness
The arguments of this chapter derive from professional insight of The Press journalists and reporters. The Press’s team of journalists and reporters have legitimate material and sources to retrieve in order to provide extensive evidence through text and photography. There are, however, no references from supporting or contrary sources. Christopher Moore provides a comprehensive analysis of the arts community and the organisations and activities that are a part of this community. By discussing a majority of the prominent actors in the arts community, the author gives an informative perspective as to how the arts community can have a significant influence on the rebuild.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This chapter from A City Recovers: Christchurch two years after the quakes gives an in-depth overview of the arts community two years after the earthquakes. The context has certainly changed; however, most of the actors and organisations discussed in this chapter are still pertinent. The chapter discusses how creating a diverse and collaborative arts and culture sector in
Christchurch can entice national and international innovation that will ultimately strengthen the social life of Christchurch. This chapter explains the importance for the local and national authorities to invest in developing an arts vision, policy and strategy, and insists that the arts have a primary role in the rebuild.

Oliver, Melanie. “Developing the Arts Ecology of Christchurch”

Brief Analysis

• Time period covered by the study: The paper covers the time period directly after the earthquakes up until its publication in September 2014. The study analyses the government’s Christchurch Central Recovery Plan (CCRP), which was published in July 2012, and its progress up until September 2014.

• Organisations / events covered by the study: The paper focuses on the arts ecology of Christchurch, which comprises all of the arts organisations in Christchurch, and specifically mentions the following: The Court Theatre, Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, Music Centre of Christchurch, Arts Centre of Christchurch, The Physics Room, and the Jonathan Smart Gallery, among others. The author includes both already existing institutions and newly emerging smaller arts organisations.

• When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? The focus of the paper is how to include newly created innovative post-earthquakes initiatives and already existing institutions into a comprehensive arts strategy. Therefore, the focus of the study includes both post-earthquake initiatives and ongoing arts institutions.

• Particular Relevance: This paper has particular relevance to the cultural, social, and economic benefits of promoting a healthy arts infrastructure. The study highlights the importance of an interconnected arts infrastructure in Christchurch, which could contribute to the economic success of cultural and artistic organisations. The author explains how this cultural capital is also important for long-term social capital, and contributes to an increase in community spirit and collective action.

• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This paper is directly related to the benefits of post-earthquake arts and culture activities. It argues that smaller arts organisations and individuals have contributed to an emerging collaborative arts infrastructure in Christchurch, but are not included in the Government’s recovery plan.

Study Description

This paper is part of Once in a Lifetime: City-Building after Disaster in Christchurch, a collection of essays that critique the Government’s recovery plan. The paper gives an informative perception of the arts ecology of Christchurch, and explains how this arts infrastructure was (or was not) included in the CCRP. The author argues that the CCRP does not have a comprehensive arts plan, and that it is only focused on large-scale venues and institutions. The narrow vision set out in the CCRP misses opportunities for collaboration and creating new arts networks.
The author notes that the “lack of consideration for how a range of different arts organisations may operate more collaboratively into the future misses the opportunity to create a more innovative and effective arts ecology for the city” (Oliver 346). The author proposes a more flexible plan that consults a range of stakeholders and a mix of conventional performing arts institutions with smaller independent organisations. The author strongly encourages an interactive and collaborative arts ecology, one that values a diversity of organisations and institutions.

Key Findings
The paper analyses the strengths and weaknesses of the CCRP in regards to the arts infrastructure of Christchurch. The author notes that the CCRP proposes four major arts institutions into the central city: Te Puna Ahurea Cultural Centre, the Performing Arts Precinct, the Christchurch Art Gallery, and the Arts Centre of Christchurch. The author argues that while these institutions are important in terms of celebrating Ngāi Tahu, Māori and Polynesian arts and culture and profitable traditional forms of art and performance, they may not support alternative contemporary arts and performance practices.

According to the author, the CCRP lacks diversity and excludes many smaller organisations that have had significant contributions to the city and its arts infrastructure. As Oliver says, “Large institutions are obviously important to consider since they involve significant financial investment, but there seems to be a lack of understanding around the arts ecology of a city, and how artists and smaller arts organisations also play a critical role in a healthy arts infrastructure” (Oliver 347). This makes it difficult to generate a coherent plan that encourages institutions and organisations to share information and work in complementary ways.

Provenance
Melanie Oliver is currently the director for a contemporary art space in Christchurch called The Physics Room. Oliver has held recent posts as Assistant Curator at both Artspace Sydney (2011) and the Govett Brewster Art Gallery in New Plymouth (2007 – 2009). In addition, Oliver has worked independently as a writer and curator, developing projects such as Social Interface at Ramp Gallery (2012), Justene Williams and Sean Grattan, St Paul St Gallery (2012) and most recently has co-curated a project with Laura Preston for the 2012 Liverpool Biennial.

The essay does not include external evidence and references; however, Oliver’s knowledge of the arts ecology of Christchurch stems from her experience as director of The Physics Room (along with other credentials involving arts organisations). The Physics Room was developed in 1996 and is a prominent contemporary art gallery in Christchurch. The gallery works with art practitioners to seek links between the arts and other areas of cultural production in order to contribute to wider social and political issues. These objectives are reflected within the paper’s argument to create an all-inclusive arts infrastructure in Christchurch.

Objectivity
The paper does not include any arguments contrary to its own. The arguments in this paper lack objectivity and represent personal opinions of the author. The author (who is also the director of the Physics Room) encourages an arts ecology that is comprehensive and requires the CCRP to include smaller organisations such as the Physics Room into its plan. Although the benefits of having a diverse and collaborative arts infrastructure are made clear, the lack of objectivity is still important to note
Persuasiveness
The author’s arguments are persuasive and pertinent. The author gives an informative analysis of the CCRP and highlights its weaknesses. Oliver argues for the need for an interconnected arts ecology that creates networks between existing large-scale institutions and newer independent organisations. She notes that the CCRP does not have a holistic overview of the arts scene in Christchurch, and that this narrow vision will benefit only a few traditional arts institutions. The focus on large-scale venues will exclude a variety of smaller organisations. The author explains the importance of a having a collaborative and dynamic arts infrastructure, and argues that this will be very difficult to achieve under the current visions of the CCRP. Oliver’s understanding and credentials in the arts sector provide a legitimate and informed argument as to what the arts infrastructure of Christchurch should comprise.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This paper explains what a healthy arts infrastructure in Christchurch could look like, and the author deems this kind of system important for the cultural capital of the city. Additionally, Oliver argues that having a strong cultural capital and arts sector contributes to the economic development and social capital of the city. The paper gives examples of how various arts organisations have promoted the importance of a dynamic arts infrastructure. It also argues that the planned response for regenerating the arts ecology is exclusive and has a limited reach within the arts ecology of Christchurch.

The author argues that the current disregard of certain organisations in the official recovery process can have negative impacts on the arts ecology. The author explains how experimental and grassroots artistic initiatives can contribute to the cultural wellbeing of the city by engaging in a collaborative and dynamic arts ecology alongside more traditional institutions.

Parker, George. “A new city through the arts”

Brief Analysis
• **Time period covered by the study:** This essay discusses the Christchurch City Council’s Central City Plan (CCP) and the government’s Christchurch Central Recovery Plan (CCRP), and the proposed Performing Arts Precinct. It also discusses the arts community’s response directly following the 22 February 2011 earthquake.

• **Organisations/events covered by the study:** This essay focuses on the creation of Arts Voice, an arts advocacy group that emerged quickly after the 22 February earthquake. It also analyses the CCP and the CCRP, specifically the Performing Arts Precinct.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of this essay is on post-earthquakes initiatives including an organisation created called Arts Voice and the CCRP.

• **Particular relevance:** This essay has particular relevance to the cultural impacts of the post-earthquakes arts community. The essay argues the importance of having an adaptive and collaborative arts infrastructure.
• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This essay is directly related to the benefits of certain artistic initiatives created in response to the earthquakes. The essay explains the formation of Arts Voice, and its role in Christchurch’s arts community. It also analyses the arts infrastructure of post-earthquakes Christchurch, and how the arts can contribute to the city’s development.

Study Description
This essay is part of the collection of essays in Once in a Lifetime: City building after disaster in Christchurch. It explains how immediately after the earthquakes discussions emerged about changing the perspective that people had around the arts. The author notes that there was “a desire to move beyond the silo mentality of pre-quake Christchurch, where the arts were segregated to a part of the city for a middle class, middle-aged art crowd, and where arts organisations all worked in isolation” (pg. 339). According to the author, after the quakes but before the Government’s recovery plan, there was already a communal and collaborative approach between organisations, and the arts community became an example of a sector working together to recover and find new ways to operate.

Arts Voice was created by Creative New Zealand with these ideals in mind. It is an arts advocacy group for the arts community that represents some of the major arts organisations and institutions in the city through a steering group, which is comprised of several arts organisations. Arts Voice held different forums and meetings to discuss how artists might play a role in the new emerging city. When the Christchurch City Council offered organisations and individuals the opportunity to contribute to the CCP, Arts Voice proposed that the city be considered from an artistic point of view. The essay explains the contributions made by Arts Voice post-disaster, especially the organisation’s role in promoting an inclusive urban design policy that includes the participation of multiple actors.

Key Findings
This essay argues that the post-disaster responses from different cultural communities varied significantly to the proposals in the CCRP. The author argues that the CCRP plan does not allow for a collaborative approach to grow, but instead creates an environment that perpetuates the existing perceptions of the arts that were mentioned above. The paper explains the importance of organisations such as Arts Voice, which have contributed to a positive perception around the arts. For example, the organisation proposed that “not only might artists play a leading role in engaging the community in the creation of the city emerging, but they should also offer planners ideas for the city’s development, informed by the creative process with which artists have a great deal of experience” (pg. 339). The author argues that these sorts of ideals, which have been promoted by arts organisations post-disaster, have not been widely recognised in the CCRP.

Additionally, the paper explains that the perception of the arts being a luxury for the middle class, or something that is “nice to have”, creates an environment where the arts are not seen to be an integral feature of the city. The essay goes on to say that once the CCRP was implemented, the approach to the development of the arts sector became inflexible and non-responsive. The author argues that the approach taken by several arts organisations of an adaptable urban design that includes significant contributions from the arts community was replaced with a top-down Performing Arts Precinct.
Provenance
George Parker is the manager and occasional producer and actor of Free Theatre Christchurch. He has also been a lecturer in Theatre and Film Studies at the University of Canterbury, was one of the original elected members of Arts Voice Christchurch, is a trustee for the Arts Circus Trust, and was one of initiators of FESTA (Festival of Transitional Architecture) and a member of its project team. His PhD thesis explored solo performance in New Zealand and he has published on this and other subjects relating to contemporary performance.

Parker proposes that the arts community “seek out the radical, emancipatory potential that seriously engaged art can play in shaping the form and content of an engaging twenty-first century city...” (pg. 341). Parker’s argument that arts should be an integral part of the city’s rebuild is similar to the view of other authors in this review. For example, Melanie Oliver argues for the need for a collaborative arts infrastructure in Christchurch in Developing the Arts Ecology of Christchurch.

Objectivity
The author does not provide any contrary arguments. The essay explains the arts infrastructure of Christchurch predominantly from the point of view of Arts Voice. The arguments in the essay compare the perspectives of Arts Voice and participants in different community forums to the CCRP Performing Arts Precinct and other artistic plans in the CCRP.

Persuasiveness
The author of this study has significantly contributed to the arts community of Christchurch both pre and post-disaster. Parker’s participation is mostly with Free Theatre Christchurch and selected arts and education organisations. The author’s criticism of the CCRP therefore comes from a perspective of local knowledge that resembles other persons that have been involved in this community both pre and post-disaster. The essay comes from Once in a Lifetime: City-building after Disaster in Christchurch, a book that includes a collection of essays. This particular essay does not include any supporting or contrary evidence.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
The essay explains the importance of a collaborative arts community and of integrating this community into the rebuild plans of Christchurch. The essay also explains how Arts Voice, an arts advocacy group created in direct response to the earthquakes, contributed to giving the arts community of Christchurch an official voice in the planning of the city rebuild. The author stresses the importance of integration among arts organisations and how, during multiple Arts Voice community forums, key recurring themes such as co-location, diversity, innovation, and engagement were proposed. The study indirectly suggests that organisations such as Arts Voice have contributed to the cultural wellbeing of post-disaster Christchurch by their promotion of ideals that may potentially strengthen the cultural sector.

Amore, Alberto. “Regeneration from the rubble. Culture and creative urban renewal in post-earthquake Christchurch, New Zealand”

Brief Analysis
• Time period covered by the study: This study covers activities and events that occurred post-disaster in Christchurch up until mid-2014.
• **Methodology Used:** Review of international and local exemplary case studies, and correlated literature.

• **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This study gives examples of various pre-existing cultural organisations and post-disaster grassroots initiatives. Some examples include the Centre of Contemporary Art, the Arts Centre, Isaac Theatre Royal, ABC Gallery, Gap Filler, and FESTA.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of this study is on post-disaster initiatives and also examples of resilient pre-existing organisations.

• **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the cultural impacts of long-standing and emerging artistic and creative organisations. The study analyses the resilience of cultural organisations post-disaster and specifically how the creative sector of Christchurch can contribute to economic development and urban identity.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is related to the benefits of the post-disaster cultural sector in Christchurch, and how this sector contributes to economic development and urban identity.

**Study Description**
The main focus of the study is how cultural regeneration can be a mechanism for urban recovery from natural disasters. The study analyses the culture-led regeneration strategies implemented and proposed since the aftermath of the 2010 and 2011 earthquakes in Christchurch. The author emphasises the importance of cultural and creative arts for the restoration of urban identity and economic activation. The study provides examples of cultural regeneration in European and North American countries, and argues that “practices of culture-led and creative-led regeneration as means for post-disaster urban re-development and re-identity is currently overlooked” (pg. 4). Therefore, this study aims to provide examples of how cultural regeneration can improve urban economic development and identity in post-disaster Christchurch.

**Key Findings**
This study examines cultural regeneration initiatives in European, Australian, and North American cities, and aims to compare these examples to the creative initiatives in post-disaster Christchurch. The author cites examples of knowledge-based intensive services, or the clustering of “creative communities within the same area in order to reinforce innovation, economic development, and social capital of deprived neighbourhoods” (pg. 2). In regards to Christchurch, the author recognises multiple local examples of culture-led regeneration initiatives in post-disaster Christchurch. Amore says, however, that the “authorities responsible for the rebuilding of the city seem not to acknowledge the vision of the creative community” (pg. 9). The author recommends stronger collaboration among stakeholders in the creative arts community and planning authorities that will strengthen the urban identity as well as the social, cultural, and economic capital of Christchurch.
Provenance
Alberto Amore is a Ph.D. student at the School of Business and Economics at the University of Canterbury. He has a Masters in Planning and Development Studies from the Università degli Studi di Milano-Bicocca, Italy. This paper has not yet been published but will be published in the conference proceedings of a seminar held in 2014 by the University of Lisbon (Portugal) that discussed metropolitan urban planning and regeneration. This seminar was the “Seminario Internacional de Planeamento Cultural Urbano em Areas Metropolitanas” from the 6th-7th November 2014.

This study contains references from an extensive list of correlated literature. These references explain how cultural regeneration has contributed to urban identity and urban recovery in European and North American countries. The author notes that “Empirical evidence from different urban contexts clearly shows that the arts and the cultural industries can restore or create new identities ‘in an eclectic urban society conscious of not only the traditions, but also of other cultures and lifestyles’” (pg. 3). Findings from the studies in regards to the local context come from a larger doctoral research study undertaking in Christchurch called Christchurch heritage: a celebration of lost buildings and streetscapes, headed by Bruce Ansley.

Objectivity
Although the author provides extensive evidence that culture-led regeneration has benefits for urban recovery and economic development, the study also explains the limitations of many of these initiatives. The author notes that the efforts of public authorities to foster culture-led regeneration initiatives are rather pragmatic and lack long-term research, investments, and support of these projects. Additionally, the support of mega-events cultural precincts by public authorities may create barriers to spontaneous cultural activities and ultimately hinders economic revival and cultural development. Another contrary argument is that flagship cultural projects, which are considered to provide economic development, may generate employment opportunities only to particular areas such as service and hospitality sectors. The author also recognises that the impact of culture-led regeneration initiatives on urban identity change is not an immediate process, and it requires constant time and support to re-create a sense of cultural urban identity.

Persuasiveness
The author of this study provides an exhaustive review of correlated literature and essential contrary arguments. Although the author recognises there is a lack of research discussing culture and creative-led regeneration initiatives in a post-disaster context, the study effectively analyses the scope of culture-led regeneration projects in Christchurch. The study provides examples of both large-scale institutional initiatives such as the CCDU’s Te Puna Ahurea Cultural Centre, and more grassroots initiatives such as the ABC Gallery, which was launched by local artists to provide a space for the arts community. This study is, however, a conference proceedings paper contribution, and further research may perhaps require additional research sources other than correlated literature.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has particular relevance to how culture-led regeneration initiatives can contribute to economic development and a stronger cultural urban identity. The paper suggests the need for a collaborative cultural sector that consists of a mix of institutional anchor projects and grassroots initiatives. This collective cultural sector could potentially contribute to quicker economic activation and restoration of urban identity through culture-led regeneration from multiple actors. The author argues that the restoration of cultural urban identity is necessary to attract creative capital that will significantly contribute to the spatial recovery of the city.
Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management. “Community Resilience: Case studies from the Canterbury earthquakes”

Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study**: This article discusses the immediate responses of communities after the 2010 and 2011 earthquakes.

- **Methodology Used**: Participant observations and analysis.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: The article focuses on several post-disaster community responses, including the Sumner Hub, Student Volunteer Army, Lyttelton’s community, New Brighton’s community, Grace Vineyard Church, and CanCERN.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?**: The majority of the communities discussed in this article are long-standing communities and structures. However, the responses of these communities are regarding a post-disaster context.

- **Particular relevance**: This study has particular relevance to the social and health impacts of post-disaster community responses. The study gives particular examples of post-disaster community responses from various communities within Christchurch.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?**: This study is related to post-disaster community responses that the study argues have had impacts on community resilience. The study emphasises the importance of pre-existing community infrastructure and cohesiveness in order to achieve maximum post-disaster resilience.

Study Description

This article evaluates post-disaster community responses as told by principal community members themselves. The individuals contributing to the article are individuals who contributed significantly to innovative and adaptive post-disaster community initiatives. The editors note, “Although each community’s experience was different, a common pattern of organic community response could be identified“ (pg. 6). The accounts of these community members reveal innovative and creative responses by individuals to provide their communities with the amenities, necessities, and support needed in a post-disaster environment. A common theme among these community responses was the formation of local self-help groups that often evolved into community-led action groups.

Key Findings

This article provides examples of post-disaster community-led responses, specifically from Sumner Hub, Student Volunteer Army, Lyttelton’s community, New Brighton's community, Grace Vineyard Church, and CanCERN. The article emphasises the constructive role of community-led responses, and the importance of their efforts especially when official governance structures have difficulties to provide the necessary services in a post-disaster environment.
The majority of the community members that contributed to this article argue that their role was significant due to the knowledge of their communities’ needs. As noted in one of the article contributions, “Top-down managerial and even logistics frameworks fail to mobilise and incorporate the knowledge, access, resources, coordination, and commitment of the broadest sectors of local communities” (pg. 36). As government leaders struggled to provide necessary amenities and services to communities, many community-led responses referred to in this article (i.e. Sumner Hub, Student Volunteer Army, Lyttelton Timebank and Lyttelton Community House) used their local knowledge and support to provide these necessities to their communities themselves.

This is what the article calls innovative forms of “disaster leadership”, when “individuals, groups, and combinations of groups emerge as new leaders to influence the direction of response and recovery operations” (pg. 37). These new forms of governance involve innovative and creative approaches to decision-making and disaster response, and are argued to be essential for post-disaster recovery and resilience. According to several contributors, these grassroots approaches were not always supported by the stagnant approaches of official recovery authorities, which created disrespect for local and central authorities among some communities. Additionally, the author argues that, as important as these self-management and self-activation approaches were in terms of community resilience and individual wellbeing, pre-existing community infrastructure and networks significantly facilitate these responses (e.g. Lyttelton Timebank).

Provenance
The study was conducted by the Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management, in partnership with Massey University, the University of Tasmania, and a Christchurch based social research group, Opinions Market Research. TEPHRA is published by the Ministry of Civil Defence and Emergency Management to raise awareness and understanding of the major hazards faced in New Zealand, and address issues relevant to managing these hazards. The article includes contributions from prominent community members who were directly involved in particular post-disaster community responses. This article includes accounts from these individual contributions, but does not provide any additional supporting evidence.

Objectivity
Although the study does not provide significant contrary or supporting evidence, it does include the accounts from prominent individuals who contributed to specific post-disaster community-led responses. Additionally, these approaches were compared to the issues discussed by the Multinational Resilience Policy Group. This policy leadership group, which was formed in 2009 by senior policy leaders from several countries, examines the issue of post-disaster community resilience, especially in terms of state-civil society relationships, social capital, and social trust-leadership. The framework and suggestions from the Multinational Resilience Policy Group coincide with the approaches of several of the community-led responses from these Christchurch case studies.

Persuasiveness
This article provides the accounts of post-disaster community-led responses from prominent individuals that contributed to and managed these responses. These approaches are considered to be innovative responses to disaster recovery and leadership, according to the Multinational Resilience Policy Group and the editors of the TEPHRA issue. As noted in the article, “the contributions to this edition of Tephra indicate how the official approach to communities in the response during an emergency, and with initiatives that are intended to generate community
resilience before an emergency, can be more effective if they are based on an understanding of the dynamics that occur in communities” (pg. 4). The study was conducted by several universities, policy groups, and research groups, providing relevant external contributions and advisory decisions.

**Value in relation to community wellbeing**

This article does not have direct relevance to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. It does, however, discuss several post-disaster innovative community-led responses, some of which may be considered to be creative initiatives (but not in a traditional artistic way). The innovation that is highlighted in this article is specifically regarding grassroots leadership and governance approaches that contributed to faster community resilience and individual wellbeing after the earthquakes. As the article states, “Resilience involves transformation of the role of citizen and grassroots organisations from that of stakeholders, who are able at best to advise governments, to full equity partners” (pg. 39). Although these community-led responses cannot generally be considered as artistic initiatives, they are examples of innovative initiatives and approaches produced and managed by community members to facilitate community resilience, recovery, and wellbeing.

_Tavares, Silvia et al. “Sustainability, microclimate and culture in post-earthquake Christchurch”_  

**Brief Analysis**

- **Time period covered by the study**: This study analyses the usage and preferences of certain urban settings in Christchurch post-disaster.

- **Methodology Used**: Participant observation, 61 in-depth interviews and (micro) climatic data collected with a portable weather station in the case study sites.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: The study analyses four different urban settings: Rotherham Street, Windmill Centre, Cashel Mall, and South Colombo Street.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The study chooses four different urban environments, which the authors label as “Established Urban Settings” and “Emerging Urban Settings”. The four case studies are examples of two urban environments that existed before the earthquakes, and two settings that were created post-disaster.

- **Particular relevance**: This study has particular relevance to the social impacts of urban spaces. The study analyses how certain regional identities in Christchurch affect the usage of different urban spaces. The authors argue that these identities could be incorporated into the urban landscape of Christchurch and improve liveability, social cohesion, and sustainability.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is more directly related to placemaking and the concept of urban comfort. The study analyses how urban culture and the design of spaces influences people’s activities and perceptions.
Study Description
This study focuses on how certain urban spaces in Christchurch are used and by which type of demographic. The study specifically evaluates how the microclimate in different urban environments contributes to urban comfort. By urban comfort, the authors mean the “collective socio-cultural response to microclimate in an urban environment as a result of its regional identity”. The authors emphasise the importance of urban comfort in the economic and social regeneration of Christchurch: with more satisfaction of the rebuilt urban environment, there is an increase of liveability and ultimately sustainability in the city. The study evaluates the preferences and activities of different users in two different types of spaces – “urban retreat spaces“ and “urban social spaces“.

Key Findings
For each of the four case studies, the authors evaluated the types of users, main climatic variables, and space use patterns of each space. The authors interviewed users of each space and identified their age, lifestyle, and preferred activities (within and outside of each space). Most of the users interviewed identified with a regional identity of outdoor culture, and this had an effect on their preferred type of space. “Urban Retreat Spaces” – defined by a more peaceful and quiet retreat space – were the most popular type of preferred urban environment among participants. This was related to the regional identity of outdoor culture, and the desire to have a peaceful setting even when in the urban environment. There was a consensus among participants that “a combination of a vibrant central city and peaceful surroundings for living were identified as an ideal quality of the urban environment”. The study ultimately emphasises the importance of the need for a green and natural look in the urban landscape design strategies to respond to the preferences of the regional cultural identity of the outdoors.

Provenance
The authors of this study have contributed to several research studies for Lincoln University. Simon Swaffield is a Professor of Landscape Architecture at the School of Landscape Architecture at Lincoln University, and Emma Stewart is the Senior Lecturer in Tourism and Parks in the Department of Tourism, Sport and Society at Lincoln University.

This study analyses microclimatic landscape design and how it contributes to urban comfort. The study provides references for both of these theories, and notes that modifying microclimates through design is essential for creating comfortable outdoor urban spaces. The results from the case studies came from a multitude of in-depth interviews and participant observations. Microclimatic data was also collected from a portable weather station in the case study sites.

Objectivity
The authors of this study use two different types of urban spaces to support their argument. The use of “Urban Retreat Spaces” and “Urban Social Spaces” in the study provides different types of public spaces in terms of peacefulness or rather the presence of other people and an availability of multiple activities. Also, the evaluation of already existing spaces and newly emerging sites contributes to a comprehensive evaluation of public urban spaces in Christchurch. The demographics of the interviewees were varied, and the study also considers the different lifestyles of each participant.
Persuasiveness
The study considers a primary regional identity of Christchurch, the outdoor culture of Canterbury residents and tourists. This regional identity was important to many of the interviewees and ultimately affected their feeling of comfort in certain urban spaces. Therefore, the study argues that considering the preferences of the users of public urban spaces is important when developing urban landscape design strategies. The use of comprehensive methodologies provides an effective argument to how microclimate and regional identity can affect urban landscape design strategies.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has particular relevance to placemaking and specifically to how urban landscape design strategies can be influenced by local microclimate and regional identity. The study recommends that regional identities and evaluations of local microclimate be incorporated into the rebuild of the urban landscapes in Christchurch. Although the study does not focus on any particular artistic or cultural activities, it analyses how a particular regional cultural identity – outdoor culture – could be used to create a more liveable and sustainable city. The study does not necessarily focus on artistic and creative initiatives; however, it indirectly suggests that urban spaces comprise experimental and creative elements that ultimately influence urban identity and sustainability in post-disaster Christchurch.
SECTION B: Studies that have particular relevance to Social Benefits


Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** The study evaluates a specific post-disaster performance, *The Canterbury Tales*, which premiered in the central city on 27 October 2013.

- **Methodology Used:** Correlated literature, participant observation of the performance.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The study focuses on the *Canterbury Tales* performance of the Free Theatre Christchurch theatre collective, but also analyses the collaboration between Free Theatre Christchurch and Department of Theatre and Film Studies at the University of Canterbury and from the Interior and Spatial Design Program of the University of Technology, Sydney.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The activities covered in the study were held in October 2013; however, Free Theatre Christchurch is a long-standing theatre collective.

- **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the social impacts of *The Canterbury Tales* performance. Specifically, the study examines how *The Canterbury Tales* created a sense of urgency for creative experimentation and challenged the status quo.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is directly related to how a post-disaster artistic initiative (Free Theatre Christchurch’s *The Canterbury Tales*) had social impacts on participants and attendees of the performance.

Study Description

This study evaluates the social and health impacts of Free Theatre Christchurch’s *The Canterbury Tales* performance. It is written by Thea Brejzek (leader of the team of University of Technology, Sydney students who contributed to the performance) and Peter Falkenberg, the founder and Artistic Director of the Free Theatre. “Designed as a carnivalesque celebration of community in the face of natural, and human-made, disaster, *Canterbury Tales* featured a procession of giant puppets and masked performers that led participants in a performative exploration of the destroyed city centre” (pg. 22). The study explores how this performance allowed citizens and participants of the performance to experience feelings of communality and positivity during a time of natural and human-made disaster.

Key Findings

This paper includes contributions from both authors: Falkenberg relates *The Canterbury Tales* performance to the philosophies of Mikhail Bakhtin and Walter Benjamin, while Brejzek considers “how performance in an earthquake zone can spatialize the transgressive potential of social, cultural and political ruptures” (pg. 22). Brejzek also focuses on a particular installation within the performance, *Eye of the Storm*, which was a contribution from her and a group of University of Technology, Sydney students. This interactive installation was situated on the Worcester Street...
Bridge, and incorporated tarpaulin banners upon which community members had written accounts of their post-disaster experiences. Brejzek explains the role of this installation during the performance: “Rather than simply cross the bridge on the night of Canterbury Tales, this new, temporary bridge design was meant to make Christchurch residents and visitors linger, to speak with one another, and to share something: a memory, an experience, an object, maybe” (pg. 27). The objective of this installation was to create a sense of communality, and to allow citizens to express their post-disaster experiences and make them felt shared by the rest of the community.

Falkenberg, on the other hand, relates the performance to specific philosophical theories of Mikhail Bakhtin and Walter Benjamin. According to Falkenberg, the performance was Bakhtinian, in its carnivalesque ability to inspire utopian creativity and communality: “Bakhtin discusses the ‘particular significance’ of the ‘suspension of all hierarchical precedence’ to the spirit of carnival: ‘People were, so to speak, reborn for new, purely human relations. These truly human relations were not only a fruit of imagination or abstract thought; they were experienced. The utopian ideal and the realistic merged in this carnival experience, unique of its kind” (pg. 25). At the same time, Falkenberg argues that the performance had Benjaminian aspects to it, meaning that the performance helps us create the representation of the “real state of emergency”.

More specifically, the authors argue that The Canterbury Tales performance allowed for residents to feel a shared sense of community spirit, which ultimately increases community resilience. The authors explain that “the sense of communitas arising post-disaster can serve to activate a countercultural movement” (pg. 26). The study argues that the performance was a performative occasion for citizens to articulate and express their shared experiences, and an experience in its own that contributed to social cohesion and community resilience.

**Provenance**

Peter Falkenberg is the founder and Artistic Director of the Free Theatre Christchurch (est. 1979), a professional theatre collective based in Christchurch. As the country's longest running producer of experimental theatre, the company offers a unique experience for artists and audiences not catered for by local commercial theatres or the amateur theatres that imitate them. Thea Brejzek is a Professor for Spatial Theory and Director of the Interior and Spatial Design Program in the School of Design of the University of Technology, Sydney. Both of the authors also contributed to the creation and production of The Canterbury Tales performance. In addition to supporting evidence regarding post-disaster theatrical performances, the study utilizes the project notes of the Eye of the Storm installation, which provided the authors with notes on the contributions of the residents in the performance. Falkenberg uses the philosophical theories of Mikhail Bakhtin and Walter Benjamin to conceptualise the performance.

**Objectivity**

The authors of the study had significant contributions to The Canterbury Tales performance, and this undoubtedly has an impact of their views of the performance. On the one hand it provides an informative and internal perspective of the production and motives of the performance. On the other hand, the study may lack an objective perspective, and provides no substantial contrary evidence.

**Persuasiveness**

As noted above, the authors’ contributions to the production of The Canterbury Tales provides us with an informative perspective of the performance. The correlation of the performance to the theories of Mikhail Bakhtin and Walter Benjamin may or may not be relevant, but provides a conceptualised analysis of the performance.
Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has direct relevance to the social impacts of *The Canterbury Tales* performance. The study argues that the performance provided participants and attendees with feelings of communality, social cohesion, and community resilience. The creation of the *Eye of the Storm* installation especially allowed community members to articulate their post-disaster experiences during the performance, which the authors argued was a cathartic and emotional event. The authors argue that *The Canterbury Tales* represented the community's passionate efforts to conserve the social memory and architectural heritage of pre-disaster Christchurch. Finally, the study suggests that *The Canterbury Tales* had an educational role by informing the participants and the attendees about the capitalistic motives behind the actors in charge of the rebuild, and the willingness of those in charge to destroy the remnants of colonial tradition.

Fisher, Kevin. “Seismic Energy and Symbolic Exchange”

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study:** This book includes a collection of essays that analyse the role of filming and cinema in post-disaster contexts from numerous different post-disaster situations. This particular essay focuses on *When a City Falls*, which documents the 2010 and 2011 Christchurch earthquakes and was produced 24 November 2011.

- **Methodology Used:** The essay includes a selection of statements and interviews with filmmakers alongside a diverse sample of essays by film scholars and theorists of various critical and cultural backgrounds.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This book provides contributions that examine several different films, with particular focus on Gerard Smyth’s *When a City Falls*.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** Gerard Smyth’s *When a City Falls* was filmed during the aftermath of both the September 2010 and February 2011 earthquakes.

- **Particular relevance:** The essay chosen from *Film on the Faultline* for this review has particular relevance to the social impacts of the *When a City Falls* film, especially its representation of symbolic exchange.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This essay is directly related to the impacts of the *When a City Falls* film, which was produced in direct response to the September 2010 and February 2011 earthquakes.

Study Description
This essay is from *Film on the Faultline*, a collection of essays examining films that “cover a wide range of genres and styles (horror, melodrama, art cinema, essay film, documentary, animation, autobiography and, of course, the disaster film)” including “films from all over the world (Iran, Italy, Greece, China, Japan, Korea, Chile, the United States, Australia and New Zealand)” (pg.11). For the purpose of this literature review, only the chapter “Seismic Energy and Symbolic Exchange” regarding Gerard Smyth’s *When a City Falls* will be discussed. This collection of essays aims to
represent film theory as a branch of seismic research, and focuses on the limits and possibilities of cinema as a mode of representation and expression. This particular essay, written by Kevin Fisher, focuses on the film’s ability to represent symbolic exchange in a post-disaster context.

Key Findings
The selected chapter from *Film on the Faultline* evaluates the post-disaster film *When a City Falls*, directed by Gerard Smyth. This film is a non-narrated documentary that reveals the immediate experiences of Cantabrians during and after the earthquakes. The film includes amateur photography from numerous sources and citizens such as video camcorders and mobile cellphone cameras. As the author explains, “the camera is Smyth’s constant companion as the film is spatiotemporally structured around the rhythms of coming and going from his house and returning to familiar sites and people [...] The integration of amateur video footage from multiple sources promotes the sense of a self-documenting social record of events” (pg. 165). Since Smyth filmed the documentary in this manner, and did not narrate the film, Fisher argues that the film becomes depoliticised and “the film succumbs to the temptation of nostalgic retreat to the utilitarianism of an idealized pre-neo-liberal, pre-hyperreal New Zealand” (pg. 170). Additionally, the essay consistently refers to Jean Baudrillard, specifically about the film’s capacity to represent symbolic and social exchange.

Fisher argues, “*When a City Falls* becomes ensnared in precisely this trap as the symbolic exchange unleashed by the earthquakes is diverted by the film into nostalgia for a ‘real’ world defined by the reassertion of the equivalence of exchange value and use value characteristic of classical political economy” (pg. 175). This symbolic exchange has been expressed through a determination of local Cantabrians to be innovative, resilient, and re-instil New Zealand identity. The editor notes that the film has a “nostalgic appeal to notions of local and national identity (Kiwi ingenuity, resourcefulness, and resilience), community, and civic pride that exist in an ideological space divorced from the global effects of those same neo-liberal ideals that prevail in contemporary New Zealand” (pg. 14) The author also argues that the film deliberately includes footage from Cantabrians of all different backgrounds and demographics, to represent the non-discriminatory forces of the earthquakes and connectedness among Cantabrians who reunited and supported one another after all experiencing the same devastations.

Provenance
The editor of *Film on the Faultline*, Alan Wright, aims to think about the disasters that occurred in Christchurch and elsewhere and put these experiences into a critical context. The director of *When a City Falls*, Gerard Smyth, is a local Cantabrian and has a history of producing and directing documentaries about New Zealand. The contributor of the essay about *When a City Falls*, Kevin Fisher, is a Senior Lecturer of Media, Film and Communication at the University of Otago. Fisher uses theorists such as Jean Baudrillard to analyse and critique *When a City Falls*.

Objectivity
Alan Wright explains that *Film on the Faultline* is his “own attempt to think about what happened to us in Christchurch and to place it within a critical context. While the book exists as an academic product, it was written quite consciously from a position outside or beyond the constraints of what might be considered standard professional/professorial practice. I hope that it will be received in the same spirit” (pg. 17). The contributors of the essays in the book come from diverse film scholars from various cultural backgrounds. Kevin Fisher uses various theories and evidence to argue that *When a City Falls* depoliticises the realities of post-disaster Christchurch.
Persuasiveness
The essays in *Film on the Faultline* are written by experienced filmmakers and/or researchers in film studies. The essays seek to argue that film can be used as a method of seismic research, and as an object of critical study and creative practice. The chapter regarding *When a City Falls* cites Jean Baudrillard and critics of Baudrillard to explain symbolic exchange and relate this theory to the film. The focus of the essay seems to be more on the particular theoretical constructs employed in the analysis than on gauging the real-world impacts of the film being analysed. However, there is a general and convincing point made about the formal qualities of *When a City Falls* and how they tend towards the film having and communicating a healing and uniting function rather than a critical, politically engaged one.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
*Film on the Faultline* aims to discuss the ability of cinema and film to critically and analytically represent post-disaster environments, or to withdraw from critical engagement. The selected chapter “Seismic Energy and Symbolic Exchange in *When a City Falls*” argues that *When a City Falls* represents the social connectedness that occurred post-disaster. Through images that display people from multiple cultures and backgrounds experiencing the same disaster, the film (Fisher argues) reasserts the symbolic exchange characteristic of classical political economy. This essay does not argue that the film *When a City Falls* itself has contributed to community wellbeing, but argues that the themes and scenes of the film represent local and national Kiwi identity, social connectedness, and community resilience – perhaps at the expense of political engagement and analysis.

French, Blair. “Public practice post-disaster: SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial”

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study:** This article focuses on the SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial that took place 27 September to 9 November 2013.

- **Methodology Used:** Interviews and discussions with participating artists.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This article focuses on SCAPE Public Art, an arts organisation that has existed for more than 15 years, providing free-to-view contemporary public art in Christchurch.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the article is on a specific festival that occurred post-disaster, although SCAPE Public Art is a long-standing organisation.

- **Particular relevance:** This article has particular relevance to the social and cultural impacts of public art installations and particularly of one post-disaster SCAPE Public Art Biennial.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This article is related to the benefits of SCAPE Public Art’s public art installations and biennial festivals, particularly the Biennial that occurred after the earthquakes in 2013.
Study Description
This article is a chapter in the quarterly magazine *Contemporary Visual Art and Culture Broadsheet*, a journal published by the Contemporary Art Centre of South Australia. Blair French, curator of SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial, interviews several participating artists regarding the role of public art in post-disaster contexts. The article provides a “brief background to the challenges of developing temporary public art projects in the post-disaster environment of Christchurch, then asks some of the participating artists to reflect on their responses to these challenges” (pg. 180). French asks the artists how public art can impact post-disaster Christchurch and possibly represent and/or influence the changing landscapes (political, cultural, social, and physical). The objective for these artists was to make relevant art works that recognised these transitions, while at the same time acknowledging the trauma of the earthquakes.

Key Findings
This article includes discussions between Blair French (curator of SCAPE 7) and several participating artists of that particular Biennial. French asks several questions regarding public art installations in post-disaster environments, including the following:

- Given the devastating events of the series of Christchurch earthquakes, the rapidity of change in the urban environment and the myriad forces – political, economic, regulatory, social – generating such change, what do you feel have been the particular challenges facing you in developing a work within this context (pg. 181)?

- Could you perhaps make any comments on your first impressions of the city post earthquakes when you made site visits in relation to thinking about producing art projects within that environment, and for those already living and working in the city, comment on the issues that seemed most immediate to you in thinking about working as an artist within public space in the city (pg. 182)?

- Has any sense of accelerated change impacted on the development of your project and in particular how you approach its temporality (pg. 184)?

- It was posed in relation to art in public space practices generally, but seems to have a particular urgency when considered in regard to the question of art’s role in the urban ‘recovery’ process in Christchurch: how can art maintain its civic potency without succumbing to the will of authority (pg. 184)?

The participating artists each had particular perspectives on these questions; however, a few similarities were noticeable. Firstly, a few of the participating artists noted their concern for the availability of cheap arts spaces after the reconstruction of certain precincts and new developments. One of the artists, Rob Hood, notes that “The new city is going to be sanitised – no cheap studios, rents will go up and there is a complete sterilising of the centre” (pg. 183). Several artists also expressed their attempts to provide art installations that provide citizens with a space to mentally disengage from the traumas of post-disaster experiences.

One of the main concerns was that public art installations would be considered to be equivalent to some of the post-disaster temporary urban regeneration projects. David Cross notes, “On the one hand, this is an ideal context for temporary public art in that there are significant parallel energies that are operating in the city to create ephemeral traces, new places of activity and engagement, etc. But on the flipside there is a potential for the artworks to be lost in this groundswell of
reinvention and to be seen simply as cultural drivers of urban economic renewal” (pg. 184). Several artists are concerned with how their artworks may be perceived as being a part of something contrary to their original objectives, although they note that art also necessitates administrative structures (such as curatorial and commissioning bodies) to succeed.

Provenance
This article is part of Contemporary Visual Art and Culture Broadsheet Volume 42.3, a magazine that features international texts and essays on international contemporary art, exhibitions, fairs and events. Blair French has been an Assistant Director (Curatorial and Digital) at the Museum of Contemporary Art Australia. Additionally he was the curatorial convenor for the 6th (2010-2012) SCAPE Public Art Christchurch Biennial and the curator of the 7th (2013) SCAPE Public Art Christchurch Biennial. The article provides the perspectives of several of the participating artists of the 7th SCAPE Public Art Christchurch Biennial regarding their opinions on public art installations within a post-disaster transitional landscape.

Objectivity
This article provides the perspectives of participating artists of SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial regarding the role of public art installations in a post-disaster environment. The article does not provide any additional perspectives from anyone outside of the public art scene. The participating artists do, however, provide differing perspectives of the role of public art installations in post-disaster Christchurch. Some of the contributing artists are local Cantabrians, while others are from different cities in New Zealand or international artists invited to contribute to the biennial festival.

Persuasiveness
The participating artists that contribute to the article provide relevant perspectives about the role of public art installations and art in general in post-disaster transitional Christchurch. Jem Noble notes “Art is an assemblage of shifting material, social, economic and imaginative practices that contribute to the production of place (how it is used, narrated, contested, ignored, connected, bounded and opened), of publics (communities of engagement, inclusion and exclusion) and individuals (embodied conjunctions of multiple forces such as physical, social, biological, subjective and commercial ones)” (pg. 185). Her perspective reflects the views of other contributors, especially as they explain how their artworks provide healing spaces within evolving and ephemeral post-disaster landscapes.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This article has particular relevance to the social and cultural impacts of SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial, the Biennial Festival of SCAPE Public Art Christchurch. The article explains how SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial was purposefully curated to take into consideration the post-disaster context and the temporal landscapes. The goal of the artists was to draw attention to the strength of community resilience and participation, inspire discussions around how the city will be rebuilt and inhabited, and present works that “fire the imagination of viewers and create moments of beauty, magic and hope” (pg. 181). The article does not specifically argue that public art installations in a post-disaster landscape can contribute to community wellbeing, but offers the perspectives of the artists involved in SCAPE 7 Christchurch Biennial that aimed to do so. The artists express their motivation for creating spaces of humour, healing, critique, and hope, and their determination to inspire discussions regarding the role of public art installations and arts in general in the rebuilding of Christchurch.

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study:** This article was released in the November 2015 issue of Homelessness and Disasters, and covers events that have occurred post-disaster up until the end of 2015.

- **Methodology Used:** Correlated literature from online newspaper sources, organisations' websites, scholarly articles, and official governmental surveys.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The article cites numerous examples of grassroots arts movements, including Gap Filler, Christchurch Stands Tall, Christchurch Art Gallery’s Outer Spaces programme, Peter Majendie’s *Reflection of Loss of Lives, Livelihoods and Living in Neighbourhood* installation, and Antony Gormley’s public art installations.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The projects and installations mentioned in the article are all post-disaster creative responses, but some of them were produced by long-standing organisations.

- **Particular relevance:** This article has particular relevance to the social and health impacts of post-disaster art based initiatives. More specifically, the article suggests that these initiatives have repaired Christchurch’s physical wounds, as well as effectively helped communities recover from psychological trauma.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This article is directly related to how post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives have contributed to social and health impacts of the Christchurch community.

Study Description
This article comes from a volume of *Natural Hazards Observer*, a journal dedicated to homelessness and natural disasters. Another article in this issue is also dedicated to post-disaster Christchurch, but is more focused on social science research methodology and the benefits of research collaborations. This article is rather focused on how post-disaster art-based initiatives have contributed to both the physical reconstruction of Christchurch and to the mental wellbeing of Cantabrians. The author introduces the article by saying “These artworks, like colorful BandAids, have not only covered up Christchurch’s physical wounds, they have also very effectively helped communities come together and recover from psychological trauma” (pg. 22). The article cites numerous examples of these artistic and creative initiatives and explains how they have contributed to social and mental wellbeing.

The article also analyses the community recovery process according to the Chief Science Advisor to the Prime Minister, Peter Gluckman. Gluckman explains the importance of community engagement initiatives, to ensure that residents are coping with their lives and livelihoods and to facilitate mental and physical recovery. In May 2011, Gluckman released a “comprehensive and
effective psychosocial recovery program that emphasized resilience, community participation, and wellbeing...“ (pg. 23). The author of the article cites these approaches as the official initiatives to facilitate community engagement.

Key Findings
Part of the key findings is the analysis of the official approaches to facilitate community engagement as told by Peter Gluckman. According to Gluckman, forms of engagement were somewhat limited to informing communities of decisions being made by the government (decisions related to land rezoning), while other efforts actively sought community input to inform government decision (Christchurch Earthquake Memorial).

The study focuses however on the role of art in recovery, and cites numerous art based initiatives that according to the author have facilitated community engagement and recovery. The article states that “The art based initiatives discussed in this article have made – and continue to make – an important contribution to social wellbeing and community development” (pg. 26). The author also argues that these grassroots artists and community-based organisations have created spaces that foster revival and innovation and encourage residents to emotionally heal.

Provenance
The mission of the Natural Hazards Centre is to advance and communicate knowledge on hazards mitigation and disaster preparedness, response, and recovery. The Natural Hazards Centre is funded through a National Science Foundation grant and supplemented by contributions from a consortium of federal agencies and non-profit organisations dedicated to reducing vulnerability to disasters. This article was written by the editor of the Natural Hazards Observer journal, in collaboration with Jane Morgan. Jane Morgan is the General Manager of Social and Cultural Outcomes at CERA.

The article includes evidence from several newspaper articles, information from organisations' websites, and official governmental surveys or documents (such as the CERA Wellbeing Survey and the Psychosocial Consequences of the Canterbury Earthquakes, A Briefing Paper, from the Office of the Prime Minister's Science Advisory Committee). The supporting evidence in the article is generally up to date and relevant, with the exception of a few case examples that have already expired (the author is aware of this and notes these facts).

Objectivity
The article provides little evidence contrary to its own arguments. The article does, however, provide the perspective of the government’s official community engagement strategy, alongside the strategies of grassroots artists and organisations. The article compares the official community engagement initiatives of the Prime Minister’s Science Advisory Committee and CERA (Community in Mind strategy) to the more grassroots initiatives. Several studies in this literature review provide the perspectives of local arts organisations or individuals that contribute to these organisations. Jane Morgan provides the perspective of an employee of CERA regarding community engagement and recovery; however, her contributions are not clear.

Persuasiveness
This article provides the perspective of an employee involved in the official recovery-planning agency, CERA, although her contributions are not made clear. This is a valuable perspective within a literature review that provides perspectives mainly from academics or individuals involved in grassroots or community organisations. Furthermore, many of the arguments made in the article
seem to lack any quantitative or qualitative evidence, and the arguments derive mostly from the information of the websites of the organisations mentioned in the article.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This article argues that post-disaster art-based initiatives have contributed to cathartic emotions, a general sense of wellbeing, community engagement, and social cohesion. The article also argues that due to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives, there is a greater awareness around the arts and especially the arts’ ability to contribute to the social and economic wellbeing of the city. As the author concludes, “These grassroots efforts, strengthened by government support, illustrate how people can restore social and emotional terra firma after disaster, even to the Shaky Isles” (pg. 26). Although the article strongly relates to the questions posed in the literature review, the lack of quantitative and qualitative data must be noted.

Wilson, Elizabeth. “Engaging youth on their own terms? An actor-network theory account of hip-hop in youth work”

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study:** The fieldwork for this study was conducted between October 2009 and December 2011.

- **Methodology Used:** Actor-network theory, participant observation, in-depth interviews, analysis of the assemblage, and use of particular documents.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This study examines the activities of certain youth trusts in Christchurch, all of which remain anonymous. The study focuses particularly on one of these youth trusts, which the author names Youth Trust E (YTE).

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The youth trusts examined in this study are long-standing groups that existed pre-disaster, though the study examines the approaches of these trusts in a post-disaster context.

- **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the social impacts of hip-hop youth work activities. The study argues that these activities contribute to individual and community empowerment and development, innovation, social cohesion across generations, and mental health and therapeutic benefits.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is not directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the earthquakes. It does, however, evaluate the resilient efforts of certain youth trusts and their ability to provide creative services to the youth that may contribute to certain social, economic, and health impacts.

Study Description
This is an ethnographic study that uses Actor-network theory (ANT) to provide detailed descriptions of hip-hop youth work activities in Christchurch. The fieldwork that was undertaken between October 2009 and December 2011 included participant observation in a range of sites of
hip-hop youth work activity, examining the assemblage and use of documents, and formal interviews with 22 participants, including youth workers, young people, and youth trust administrators. The study evaluates when and how hip-hop was edited or censored during youth work activities; hip-hop stigmas and how they are overcome to engage youth; and how youth trusts build relationships in order to receive funding and resources. The study also “challenges traditional media and literature representations that simplify and thus either stigmatise or celebrate hip-hop. As such, this study opens up possibilities to consider the opportunities, as well as the complexities, of assembling hip-hop in youth work sites of practice” (pg. 12). The use of ANT allows the author to evaluate both the human and non-human actors that are involved in the network of hip-hop youth work activities in Christchurch.

Key Findings
The author of this study aims to reveal the positive aspects of hip-hop youth work activities in Christchurch. She cites supporting evidence that “frame hip-hop as a means to engage youth in education, health promotion, therapeutic, as well as community and youth development activities, despite the abovementioned controversy” (pg. 33). Other arguments state that hip-hop can be used as a “tool to cross cultural and generational barriers, to engage with youth, and to help youth explore important issues in their lives (Alvarex, 2012; Elligan, 2004; Kobin and Tyson, 2006; Tillie-Allen, 2005; Tyson, 2002)” (pg. 35). There are also significant stigmas against the influence of hip-hop culture and activities on youth, and it is sometimes considered to be harmful to both individuals and communities due to the references to gang violence, drug abuse, and misogyny (amongst other negative aspects). The study reveals these realities in the context of youth trusts in Christchurch.

The study demonstrates how youth trust workers are able to negotiate with youth and government funders to represent the positive aspects of hip-hop culture and activities. To encourage youth to engage in hip-hop positively, youth workers have to edit the negative aspects of hip-hop out of their activities, while retaining the aspects that still represent the interests and preferences of the youth involved. This means sometimes encouraging youth to engage in more “conscious rap”, which may contradict the youths’ interests in more contemporary “commercial rap”. The youth workers use non-human actors such as musical production equipment, dance studios, and respected apparel to inspire and engage youth.

In regards to government funders and developing partnerships, youth trust workers must translate their hip-hop-youth work activities to these actors in order to receive funding and resources. The author notes: “Some administrators described encountering these difficulties in ‘rigid’ government ministry funding frameworks. Youth organisations’ problems with translating youth work relationship and recreation activities into quantifiable measurements have been documented elsewhere (see Bruce et al., 2009; McLaughlin, 2000; Rodd and Stewart, 2009; Spence, 2008). Furthermore, as Crimmens et al. (2004) point out, part of the challenge often lies in putting in place evaluation methods, as these practices require further resources. The need to enlist computers, research companies, and additional staff time poses a challenge for community based organisations working within the confines of limited resources” (pg. 223). The study reveals that despite these rigid frameworks, youth workers develop innovative techniques to translate their hip-hop-youth work activities as being positive activities with beneficial impacts to the youths engaging with the activities.
Ultimately the study analyses a specific youth trust, YTE, and its resilience and innovative approaches in a post-disaster environment. The study reveals the alternative techniques YTE had to implement, especially regarding developing new partnerships. The author explains that “the substitution of actors within YTE’s post-quake assemblages produced new assemblages that continued the enactment of YTE’s hip-hop youth work activities in new forms. For example, YTE could define itself as working with more at risk young people as it collaborated with organisations in contact with different youth demographics. New actors enrolled into the network allowed both new possibilities and constraints, the nature of which depended on how they interacted with actors within a particular hip-hop network” (pg. 296). The author argues that despite these organisational changes, YTE and other youth trusts were able to continually provide their hip-hop-youth work activities to the youths involved, services that arguably provide social, economic, and health benefits to these youths.

Provenance
This study is a doctoral thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Human Services at the University of Canterbury. The study provides extensive supporting evidence from literature regarding the benefits and consequences of hip-hop’s influence on the youth. The author argues that the majority of these studies “have not considered the production of hip-hop activities within youth work settings”, and she addresses this gap in the literature in this study (pg. 44). The methodology used includes thorough fieldwork through participant observation and in-depth interviews. The author uses ANT, which allows her to evaluate both human and non-human actors involved in the hip-hop-youth work activities in Christchurch.

Objectivity
The author has a specific objective in this study, which is to reveal the positive aspects of hip-hop youth work activities in Christchurch. She admits that “Based on this inspiration, my encounters with hip-hop as good influenced the focus of this research. I read many articles that constructed hip-hop as a means for positively engaging and intervening with youth (Alves Peres, Alves Peres, da Silveira, and Paiva, 2002; Elligan, 2004; Ginwright, 2002; Saw, Tamati, and Waiti, 2004; Tyson, 2002). I had a desire to produce an account of hip-hop that could broaden understandings of hip-hop and thus challenge simplistic negative hip-hop stereotypes” (pg. 24). Therefore the author clearly admits her objective and bias and how this may affect her research. The study does, however, also provide extensive arguments and evidence that demonstrates the negative impacts of hip-hop activities and culture on youth.

Persuasiveness
The author’s personal experience in youth work and as a hip-hop dancer facilitated the research methodology and proved to be advantageous. In addition, a study that uses ANT methodology requires constant participant observation. The author notes that “Following the actors and positioning them as experts saw me travel to sites and document hip-hop-youth work activities I may not have otherwise. Having been subject to their relationship building practices myself, I was more alert to the similarities and differences in interressement assemblages across youth work sites” (pg. 82). The use of ANT provides a broader perspective of hip-hop youth work networks in Christchurch, which evaluates both human and non-human actors involved in the web or relationships.
Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has indirect relevance to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. The study specifically evaluates the networks of human and non-human actors involved in the hip-hop youth work activities in Christchurch. It also examines the social, economic, and health benefits of engaging in hip-hop youth work activities. The study analyses the resilience and innovation of youth trusts in a post-disaster context, and suggests that the ability of these youth trusts to continually provide their services post-disaster enables the youths participating to benefit from those services. Finally, there may be lessons regarding the capacity of youth trusts to develop appropriate translations of their activities ultimately to help them receive funding, despite cautious funders that are hesitant to finance activities correlated with hip-hop-youth work activities.

Joyce, Zita et al. “ADA Mesh Cities: Network, Space and Memory in the Transitional City”

Brief Analysis
• **Time period covered by the study:** The paper focuses on ADA Mesh Cities Christchurch, which was a series of events held over 2013-14, addressing the role of media arts in the city.

• **Methodology Used:** Written document of a wide-ranging panel discussion.

• **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This paper is the summary of the ADA Mesh Cities Christchurch series. Aotearoa Digital Arts (ADA) is a network of media artists, writers, teachers, and audiences, and a charitable trust focused on supporting media arts in Aotearoa New Zealand.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the study is on post-disaster initiatives, specifically the role that post-disaster media and digital arts have contributed to social memory of spaces in Christchurch.

• **Particular relevance:** This paper has particular relevance to the social impacts of media and digital arts, specifically with preserving and reinventing social memory. The panellists reflect upon the contemporary use of spaces, and the importance of remembering and reimagining the city through digital arts and urban landscapes.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This paper focuses on media and digital arts that have been displayed post-disaster in Christchurch. The panellists in the paper ask how media and digital artists contribute to the way that we might re-imagine a city post-disaster?

Study Description
This paper is a summary of a panel discussion hosted by Aotearoa Digital Arts at ISEA 2013. It addresses the ways in which media artists around Aotearoa New Zealand are responding to the implications of the 2010 and 2011 Canterbury earthquakes. The panel discussion brought together artists from around the country to reflect on the impact of the Christchurch earthquakes on media art practice in Aotearoa New Zealand. The panellists discuss the impact that a disaster and
specifically fear has on short-term memory, which can alter memories of place. The summary focuses on panellists who discuss the importance of media and digital arts in remembering certain spaces in pre-disaster Christchurch, and the importance that has on social memory.

**Key Findings**

The panellists in this paper each had their own reflections and examples to give on how media and digital arts contribute to memory of place and space in Christchurch. According to the study, the benefits of digital media are that it works as an ever-increasing archive in which information is easily accessible. For example the contributors explain the importance of digital cartography tools to localise community gardens or cultural projects such as street art murals.

The importance of technical language is noted as well, and a panellist notes that Christchurch citizens are more familiar with their space due to specific language used post-disaster. For example, “everyone knows what liquefaction is, and everyone now knows about the geological structure of the city and the decisions made about building a city on an unstable alluvial plain” (pg. 2). These realisations allow citizens to think about their city with informative and innovative perspectives.

Another important point is the citizens’ new awareness of the transitionality of cities and the impermanence that defines contemporary cities. A panellist explains that the earthquakes “created space for artists to respond to the physical, political, and social implications of this new awareness of transitionality” (pg. 4). This panellist acknowledges that creative projects such as those of Gap Filler have contributed to increased discussions around this theme by allowing citizens to experience cultural works and gathering places in public spaces, instead of in possibly exclusive traditional venues such as galleries. Ultimately, the importance of media and digital arts is to “create responsive social works that connect with people’s experiences of these things” (pg. 4). According to the panellists, the role of media arts in Christchurch has been to identify, archive, and localise these post-disaster cultural activities, in order to promote engaging conversations among citizens.

**Provenance**

ADA Mesh Cities Christchurch was a series of events held over 2013-14 addressing the role of media arts in the city. These events explored key issues such as urban space, social engagement, memory, and speculative futures. Over the two-year project the ADA Network hosted two major symposia and a series of workshops and speaking tours in various locations throughout New Zealand. A prevailing theme among the Mesh Cities Christchurch events is the role of media arts in the rebuild of the city.

The arguments made in this summary come from the results of the series of events of ADA Mesh Cities. ADA develops public understanding of digital art through its online forum, through publications and exhibitions, and by touring speakers, holding master classes and symposia. The views of the panellists therefore come from a variety of different sources with various methodologies. The arguments and methodologies of each panellist are varied; however, they are able to remain focused on the role that media and digital arts plays in remembering place and space in post-disaster Christchurch.
Objectivity
ADA is a national organisation that has multiple partnerships with organisations throughout Aotearoa New Zealand. The network’s goal is to contribute to the development of media and digital arts. Multiple perspectives are presented in this conference paper summary. The diversity of the panellists in this summary represents the scope of the organisation, and the paper takes the perspectives from different panellists to contribute to a comprehensive reflection of the role of media and digital arts in New Zealand.

Persuasiveness
This paper summarises the events of the ADA Mesh Cities events in Christchurch by selecting the perspectives of various panellists. The inclusion of multiple reflections allows for numerous examples to prove the general argument around the role of media and digital arts in New Zealand. The panellists are based throughout New Zealand (Christchurch, Auckland, Dunedin) and each considers the importance of media and digital arts in the transitions of each contemporary city. The professions of each of the panellists remain unclear; however, their reflections contribute to discussions about networks, space, and memory in contemporary New Zealand cities.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This paper has particular relevance to how post-disaster media and digital arts contribute to the social memory of past spaces in Christchurch. The author argues that the role of media and digital arts is to create “networked practices that resonate in the spaces and time between remembering the past, and imagining the future” (pg. 4). The paper explains how the artistic initiatives of media and digital artists may reinforce negative or positive memories of certain spaces, but can also ultimately create new discussions around impermanence and creativity in contemporary cities. The authors do not explicitly argue the beneficial impacts of such creative work, but the particular benefits of reinforcing social memory post-disaster are strongly implied by the nature of the arguments.

Thomson, Christopher. “Digital technologies and material culture in post-earthquake Christchurch”

Brief Analysis
- Time period covered by the study: This conference paper focuses on certain digital media projects that have been created post-disaster.

- Methodology Used: Correlated literature from supporting sources and databases.

- Organisations / events covered by the study: This paper focuses on several post-disaster digital media projects including CityViewAR, SoundSky, and the CEISMIC database.

- When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? The projects covered in this paper were all created post-disaster.

- Particular relevance: This paper focuses on the social impacts of certain post-disaster digital media projects and data-driven applications.
• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This paper is related to placemaking and urban design, especially how digital media and data-driven applications can contribute to the revitalisation of Christchurch's urban centre.

Study Description
This conference paper reviews certain digital media projects and data-driven applications that were created in response to the earthquakes. More specifically, the paper examines CityViewAR, SoundSky, and the CEISMIC database. The study evaluates the connections between digital media, networked computing, and the shaping of urban material cultures. The author argues that certain post-disaster digital media projects and data-driven applications can contribute to the re-imagining and revitalising of Christchurch’s urban centre. The study also examines the capacity of these particular database forms to offer different ways to access and interact with physical and historical content of urban spaces in Christchurch.

Key Findings
This conference paper contribution evaluates three particular digital media projects / data-driven applications that were created in response to the earthquakes. The paper examines how these projects are capable of re-imagining the urban landscapes of Christchurch, while at the same time preserving elements of social memory through digital media technologies. The author notes that “the database form has been prominent in Christchurch because it is better suited to representing spatially dispersed, multiple, and emergent patterns of experience that have arisen in the fluid post-quake situation” (pg. 4). The paper uses supporting evidence to explain how these digital media technologies are considered cultural forms: “In short, Manovich argues that distinct from narrative, which is the representation of events, the database is an exemplary cultural form, one that ‘represents the world as a list of items which it refuses to order’” (pg. 4). According to the supporting evidence and the author's arguments, the paper suggests that collections, encyclopaedias, dictionaries, spreadsheets, database-driven websites, and applications fit under these particular cultural forms.

The paper examines the impacts of certain digital media technologies and data-driven applications, including CityViewAR’s High Street Stories, SoundSky, and the CEISMIC database. These technologies allow their users to experience visual and audio memories of certain events, people, and places through a variety of narratives. Additionally, these technologies provide users with multiple perspectives of certain urban landscapes, which the author argues allows people to engage with a place and its history despite its physical history. These perspectives may have their consequences, however, and the author notes that “Though the goal is to add to experience, the danger is that the information itself stands in for the object (just as data selves take priority over physical selves)” (pg. 6). Overall, the paper argues that these digital media technologies and data-driven applications provide the ability to re-imagine urban landscapes and preserve social memory from various interpretations and perspectives.

Provenance
Christopher Thomson coordinates the Digital Humanities programme at the School of Humanities at University of Canterbury. The author provides supporting evidence and references regarding digital media technologies and their capacity to re-imagine urban spaces. The paper also includes certain references to how digital media technologies and data-driven applications can be considered cultural forms.
Objectivity
The paper examines three relevant examples of post-disaster digital media technologies and data-driven applications. The author also explains the consequences, as well as positive aspects of these digital technologies, in terms of how they contribute to preserving social memory. The paper suggests that these technologies can provide multiple perspectives of lost heritage and urban landscapes. The author emphasises however that these interpretations may also “adopt points of view like the ‘fly through’ or ‘fly over’, that doesn’t correspond to a mundane human perspective” (pg. 9). The study does not omit the negative aspects of the digital technologies examined.

Persuasiveness
This paper provides supporting evidence that corresponds to certain post-disaster digital media technologies and data-driven applications in Christchurch. The author argues that these technologies can be considered to be cultural forms that contribute to emerging perceptions of urban landscapes.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This paper has particular relevance to the social impacts of post-disaster digital media technologies and data-driven applications in Christchurch. The paper argues that these are cultural forms of technology that provide alternative interpretations of social memory and ultimately can facilitate the re-imagination of urban landscapes. This paper is similar to another paper in this literature (see especially “ADA Mesh Cities” by Zita Joyce), which argues that digital media and arts can preserve the social memory of urban landscapes more easily than traditional narratives. The author cites three particular examples of digital technologies that have helped preserve social memory and also inspire adaptive interpretations of post-disaster urban landscapes.

Shermine, Kwok Shi Min. “Christchurch, City in Transition: A Study of Post Disaster Transitional Landscapes”

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study**: This study covers the post-disaster political and cultural landscape of Christchurch up until late 2013.

- **Methodology Used**: Fifteen semi-structured in-depth interviews, participant observation, and literature review.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: The author provides a broad vision of post-disaster Christchurch that analyses multi-disciplinary creative organisations (Gap Filler and FESTA), art galleries (Jonathan Smart Gallery, Room Four, Chambers 241) local authorities (CCC), Ngāi Tahu, Creative NZ, and the Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority (CERA).

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?**: The study examines both pre-existing organisations (e.g. Creative NZ and Ngāi Tahu) and post-disaster cultural and political initiatives (Gap Filler, CERA etc.)
• **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the cultural, social, and economic impacts of the post-disaster responses of the actors involved in the “transitional phase” of Christchurch. It analyses how the resilience of the post-disaster Christchurch community has contributed to emerging identities, collaboration, and innovations.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study focuses on both post-disaster arts and culture initiatives, as well as community resilience. It argues that the artistic and creative efforts of community organisations and individuals after the earthquakes have contributed to social cohesion and urban resilience.

**Study Description**

This study analyses the post-disaster cultural and political landscapes of Christchurch. It focuses on the importance of Christchurch being an example for modern democratic post-disaster cities. The author explains that because Christchurch has nurtured its “transitional phase”, it can become a model for other contemporary democratic cities dealing with post-disaster issues. The study analyses the interim period between disaster and recovery in Christchurch, and argues that an understanding of this period is important and the knowledge learned can be transferred elsewhere.

The paper specifically analyses the community cohesion and urban resilience of post-disaster initiatives in Christchurch. It argues that the “transitional city” of Christchurch has been created through community cohesion, and that these efforts ultimately foster a strong urban resilience. It must be noted, however, that the author also argues that the emerging landscapes and identities in post-disaster Christchurch have also developed due to contestations and disagreements within the Christchurch community.

**Key Findings**

The author argues primarily that post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives have contributed to community cohesion and urban resilience. Specifically, the study explains how the “transitional phase” of Christchurch has been capitalised, and the residents and authorities of Christchurch have been able to market the transitional experience. This has contributed to a rebranding of Christchurch as a “Pop-up City”, and has had economic benefits, especially within the tourism sector.

The author also explains the role and benefits of emerging artistic and creative initiatives: “Both the transitional and niche arts scene have been a tremendous cohesive force, bringing the community together at new social meeting places, and to celebrate creative expression” (pg. 54). According to the author, the post-disaster initiatives belonging to the arts and culture sector have significantly increased social cohesion within the community.

The importance of both architectural heritage and cultural heritage is emphasised in the study. The study explains the important role of Ngāi Tahu in the Christchurch Central Recovery Plan, and the importance of preserving pre-colonial Māori existence and traditions. As the author explains, “Given the amount of consideration towards indigenous perspectives in the Redevelopment Blueprint, there is great potential for indigenous heritage sites to be restored, or at least acknowledged and commemorated” (pg. 61). The author explains that the earthquakes give indigenous inhabitants the chance to reclaim Māori heritage and sacred sites that were previously disregarded by central urban planning projects. According to the study, the role of Ngāi Tahu in the
Christchurch Central Recovery Plan increases the remembrance and recognition of Māori heritage sites.

Provenance
Kwok Shi Min Shermine submitted this paper to the Department of Geography at the National University of Singapore as part of a requirement for the Honours Degree of Bachelors of Social Science. Shermine recognises that her position as a foreign Honours student put her in a position of neutrality and occasionally facilitated her research through substantial contextual knowledge and opinions from her interviewees.

The study includes substantial references that support its arguments about community cohesion, contested landscapes, reshaping political landscapes and urban resilience. The interviews conducted include a variety of interviewees from multi-disciplinary positions including art galleries, community organisations, Ngāi Tahu, Christchurch City Council, and Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority. The author also utilises numerous newspaper articles and information from organisations' websites as supporting evidence.

Objectivity
The author recognises her position as a foreign Honours student to be beneficial but also explains that it had some implications for her methodology. Shermine explained that certain methodological constraints occurred during her primary fieldwork, especially her capacity to interview each of her anticipated interviewees. Additionally the author explains that she was not able to conduct interviews among all the representative demographics in Christchurch, notably the Asian population. Despite the awareness of these constraints, the author provides few references that provide arguments contrary to her own.

Persuasiveness
The arguments of this study are supported by numerous references and in-depth interviews from professionals within Christchurch. The author utilises this local knowledge and experience to support her arguments regarding community cohesion within post-disaster Christchurch. The use of media releases and information from organisations' websites may however provide irrelevant information, and the author omits certain contextual information. Nonetheless, the author provides substantial support evidence and relevant information through numerous in-depth interviews.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study analyses the post-disaster community cohesion and urban resilience of the Christchurch community. The author argues that despite contestations among different actors involved in the rebuild (from the grassroots level to the institutional level), individuals and organisations within the Christchurch community have taken ownership of the redevelopment of their city. The study suggests that the post-disaster landscape has allowed for collaboration and creativity that has fostered wider acceptance of new ideas and other cultures and cohesion around political and cultural decisions. Therefore, the study argues that post-disaster creative and artistic initiatives have contributed to social cohesion, emerging identities, and politically engaged activism.

Montgomery, Roy. “Greening the Rubble in Christchurch: civic ecological reclamation efforts during a crisis event”
Brief Analysis

- Time period covered by the study: This article examines the first eighteen months of Greening the Rubble (GtR), from their pilot project launched on December 19, 2010, until August 2011.

- Methodology Used: Correlated literature, from online newspaper sources, organisations’ websites, scholarly articles, and official governmental surveys.

- Organisations / events covered by the study: This article focuses specifically on Greening the Rubble.

- When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? Greening the Rubble is a post-disaster initiative that launched several weeks after the September 2010 earthquake.

- Particular relevance: This article has particular relevance to the social and ecological benefits of Greening the Rubble. The study explains the importance of the cultural and ecological reclamation of underutilised sites by individuals and community groups.

- Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This study is related to the social and ecological benefits of Greening the Rubble, a post-disaster grassroots initiative that focuses on rubble-greening and urban ecology.

Study Description

This article focuses on the civic ecological reclamation efforts of Greening the Rubble, specifically examining the approaches taken by Greening the Rubble after the first eighteen months after the September 2010 earthquakes. The author briefly describes the history of urban ecological reclamation approaches and movements. Additionally, the author focuses on the lessons learned from the Greening the Rubble movement post-disaster. The article concludes with recommendations for future structural and policy decisions for Greening the Rubble.

Key Findings

The article commences with a brief history of urban reclamation approaches and movements including “diggers”, “peoples parks”, “green guerrillas”, “retrogreening” and “guerrilla gardening”. The author argues that these ecological reclamation efforts were generally grass-roots political activism approaches for “making better and/or more environmentally friendly use of neglected or poorly designed urban space” (pg. 4). These movements also sought to “demonstrate the virtue of thinking about horticultural amenity in any given urban space, not just formally designated parks or gardens” (pg. 5). The article compares the approaches of Greening the Rubble to these antecedent movements and charts the first eighteen months of the organisation.

The study particularly focuses on the pilot project of Greening the Rubble, “Victoria Green”, which was soft-launched on December 19, 2010. The author also describes the significance of Canterbury Regional Biodiversity Co-ordinator Dr Wayne McCallum in the creation of the organisation. The author notes, “In a letter to the Editor of The Press in late September he [McCallum] coined the phrase ‘greening the rubble’. McCallum used these words to describe both the symbolic and material redemption of damaged sites by the temporary installation of native plants and/or cultural events” (pg. 7). The study also explains that Greening the Rubble has benefitted from word of mouth, consistent news media coverage, and web-based communication and social media.
Volunteers, “Offers of sites, donations of plants and construction materials, volunteer labour, paid labour and sponsorship by corporate bodies” have also significantly contributed to the success of GtR (pg. 12).

Provenance
Roy Montgomery is a Senior Lecturer in Environmental Management at Lincoln University, New Zealand. Since this publication, Roy Montgomery was also one of the Trustees for the Greening the Rubble charitable trust. The author uses primarily information from organisations’ websites, the Christchurch City Council and CERA websites, and correlated literature regarding international antecedents for urban ecological reclamation. The study also provides a brief history of Australasian initiatives in ecological reclamation. The author does not provide any further methodologies, such as interviews, participant observations, quantitative surveys, or questionnaires.

Objectivity
The study does not provide any contrary perspectives, but does include international literature and benchmark examples of urban ecological reclamation. The study also provides a history of urban reclamation in New Zealand and Christchurch pre-disaster. The author notes the shortcomings of these initiatives or policies: “Sometimes they involve the conversion of vacant sites into standardised public amenity parks with large grassed areas which may or may not include locally eco-sourced or locally appropriate native plantings” (pg. 6). The study does explain how ecologists have recognised and advocated for the temporary plantings or regeneration of vacant spaces in urban areas.

Persuasiveness
The author provides an informative history of the reclamation of urban spaces for the use of cultural or ecological purposes. However, the development of Greening the Rubble since the publication of this article has changed the pertinence of the study. Specifically, since this study was published Greening the Rubble has become a charitable trust. The suggestions that are given in the conclusions of this study are pertinent, and several of the suggestions have actually occurred within the organisational structure of Greening the Rubble. The correlation between these suggestions and the changes made within the structure of Greening the Rubble are not clear, and it cannot be assumed that these suggestions influenced the changes made within the organisation.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has indirect relevance to the benefits of a post-disaster artistic and creative initiative. The study examines the approaches of Greening the Rubble following the earthquakes, and argues that Greening the Rubble has contributed to the social and ecological wellbeing of the city. The voluntary efforts and additional support from numerous institutions and institutions that have contributed to the pilot projects of Greening the Rubble are arguably examples of social cohesion and community engagement efforts that are centred on Greening the Rubble. Greening the Rubble continues to green urban spaces, create educational spaces that promote the reintroduction of native plants into the city, and receive volunteers and support from different community groups and individuals.
Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** The study covers two specific case studies of “community-initiated open spaces” in Christchurch: the Pallet Pavilion (which was located at the old Crowne Plaza Hotel site from October 2012 – April 2014), and Greening the Rubble’s “relocatable park” (which was in Riccarton from 2012-2013, and eventually moved from one vacant site to a few others). The study also analyses other “community-initiated open spaces” that have been created after the earthquakes up until the end of the research period in 2015.

- **Methodology used:** Review of international and local exemplary case studies, and correlated literature.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The study focuses on several post-disaster creative urban regeneration organisations including Gap Filler, Greening the Rubble, Life in Vacant Spaces, and FESTA. It includes details about how these organisations are related to the Christchurch City Council and the Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority. The study also focuses on several European case studies such as the Système Friche Théâtre in Marseille, France.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the study is on post-disaster “community-initiated open spaces (CIOS)” in Christchurch, although it does compare these temporarily activated vacant sites to previous European case studies. These comparative case studies are not necessarily post-disaster examples (they are rather cases of temporary spaces that emerge from areas with high rates of economic downfall).

- **Particular relevance:** The study has particular relevance to the social impacts of “community-initiated open spaces”, and how they contribute to fostering community empowerment, and creating and strengthening social capital, experimentation, and innovation. It is important to note that these “community-initiated open spaces” generally may not be considered to be artistic or creative initiatives, although many do incorporate experimental and creative elements.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is more closely related to community resilience and placemaking. It analyses the anticipated benefits of temporary urban spaces in post-earthquake Christchurch and discusses their positive impact on urban sustainability and community resilience after the disaster.
Study Description
The study looks at “transitional community-initiated open spaces” (a term coined by the author) in Christchurch, and analyses how they have influenced temporary urbanism in comparison with case studies in non-disaster environments. The paper “discusses the relevance of temporary uses of vacant urban spaces for urban sustainability in relationship to concepts of community resilience and raises questions about possible long-term values.” (pg. 1)

The paper addresses an apparent gap in research based on temporary post-disaster urbanism in the form of (public) open spaces by analysing temporary uses of vacant sites after the 2010 and 2011 earthquakes in Christchurch, New Zealand. The paper uses the term ‘transitional community-initiated open spaces’ (CIOS) to “describe temporarily used vacant urban sites produced by particular communities in post-earthquake Christchurch.” (pg. 6)

The paper examines two kinds of temporary urbanism related to different disturbances of urban development: the first kind is based on substantial socio-economic changes that result in oversupply of vacant sites, and the second kind are the types linked to a major natural disaster.

Key Findings
The author describes CIOS as “temporarily used vacant urban sites produced by particular communities in post-earthquake Christchurch” (pg. 6). As noted above many people may not classify these as artistic and creative initiatives; however, most of them incorporate experimental forms of architecture, art, and performance. The paper highlights four ways in which CIOSs contribute to community resilience:

- Creating opportunities for positive emotions and experiences: “Community-led action that transforms disaster-affected spaces may provide opportunities for positive emotions (Tidball and Krasny 2014, 10). In informal conversations with the author, community members reported that even passive passers-by without direct involvement in community-led activities may experience positive emotions solely by noticing that ordinary people are recreating and rebuilding structures within a destroyed urban landscape” (pg. 10).

- Experimentation and innovation: “Temporary projects in vacant urban spaces provide opportunities for becoming engaged in creative experiments and ‘testing grounds’, for example by exploring alternative visions of future urban development. In informal conversations, community members expressed their experienced joy being able to participate in unprecedented experimental open space projects” (pg. 10).

- Creating and strengthening social capital: “CIOS become public open spaces (on mostly privately owned land) that provide a stage for social encounters, for example through volunteer work; they are platforms for creating and strengthening social capital (Syben 2012, 30)” (pg. 11).

- Fostering community empowerment: Community empowerment has been described “as the highest identified level of public participation” based on a process “where the community has developed the capacity and tools to make purposive decisions about their environment and perceives that these decisions have been implemented as the desired actions and outcomes (Blake 2013, 13)” (pg. 11).
Wesener also explains the differences between temporary uses of vacant spaces in post-disaster situations versus in situations of economic decline: “The postdisaster context that has shaped the production of transitional CIOS distinguishes temporary uses of vacant spaces in Christchurch from other case studies in a number of key aspects, including planning processes, alternative agendas, acceptance of the temporary status and support by local authorities. The open conflicts that have frequently occurred between temporary occupants, land owners and planning authorities in European case studies, for example related to discordant development visions or anticipated permanent uses, have not occurred in Christchurch so far” (pg. 13).

Provenance
Andreas Wesener studied architecture in Bochum, Germany and the Bartlett School of Graduate Studies, University College London. He was awarded his doctorate from the Bauhaus-University in Weimar, Germany. Andreas has worked as an architect in the private sector, as a research associate for Birmingham City University, and as a research fellow for the Research Institute for Regional and Urban Development (ILS) in Aachen, Germany.

Wesener uses a variety of supporting arguments to explain the potential benefits and difficulties of temporarily using vacant spaces. The author uses examples from different European case studies, and also cites different sources that argue how temporary initiatives in vacant spaces can contribute to community resilience and empowerment:

- “CIOS may help empower the community as a whole by creating stronger resilience pathways linked to positive social learning processes made available to future generations (cf. Wilson 2013, 211 – 212)” (pg. 10).
- “Community-led action that transforms disaster-affected spaces may provide opportunities for positive emotions (Tidball and Krasny 2014, 10)” (pg. 10).
- “CIOS become public open spaces (on mostly privately owned land) that provide a stage for social encounters, for example through volunteer work; they are platforms for creating and strengthening social capital (Syben 2012, 30)” (pg. 11).

The author also uses two different local case studies to further support his argument. The two case studies – the no longer existing Pallet Pavilion and Greening the Rubble’s “relocatable garden” (which is now part of the Sound Garden) – were “transitional community-initiated open spaces” that have had positive benefits regarding community resilience and social cohesion (according to the users and organisers of the projects). The author cites different organisations and initiatives in Christchurch that have done similar projects with similar benefits and goals.

Objectivity
Wesener does not omit arguments or evidence that are contrary to his own. He understands that CIOS projects can have a negative reputation and that in some cases their initial objective of increasing social capital and community resilience may be lost to profit-oriented schemes. The author understands that further empirical substantiation may be needed to support that CIOS have a positive influence on community resilience.

Wesener also notes some previous criticisms of CIOS initiatives in Christchurch: “Not everyone shares the same positive view on temporary projects. Critics who perceive existing CIOS as “messy” and “shanty-style” have argued that Gap Filler “should be forced off the former Crowne Plaza Hotel
site (Harvie 2014)” (pg. 12). The author explains as well that if the Christchurch City Council (and public taxes) is supporting CIOS projects, public support of these projects may not be strong: “As the Christchurch rebuild progresses, community organisations may face increased scepticism, in particular if tax payers’ money remains a major source of funding. The limited lifespans of projects may raise concerns about their long-term values by asking if it is “worth investing in something we know will not endure (Vallance 2012, 402)” (pg. 12).

The study provides substantial arguments contrary to its main impetus, especially explaining the potential consequences of temporary initiatives in vacant spaces. The author has recently coined the term “transitional community-initiated open spaces”, and does not provide any arguments that critique this term. Since the term and the study have recently been published, there may not be any existing arguments against the validity of the term. The coining of this term may or may not provide additional contributions to academic and public evaluations of these initiatives, and thus far has not been widely used. The purpose of the author coining this term is unclear.

**Persuasiveness**

The author admits that there is a lack of research regarding temporary post-disaster urbanism in the form of (public) open spaces; however, his correlations with other temporary urbanism initiatives are valid and the comparisons are well researched and are not taken out of context. The author explains the differences between temporary urbanism initiatives in different European contexts, which are usually created by squatters in areas of declining economic development and high rates of underutilised spaces. On the other hand, the situation in Christchurch has been triggered by a post-disaster situation, and Wesener clearly distinguishes the two types of situations and how they differentiate in terms of political support and potential benefits and consequences.

He notes that the immediate support of the Christchurch City Council towards CIOS projects differs from the usually contrasting ideals and conflicts of temporary occupants in European cities versus the local public authorities and landowners in those cities. This differentiation provides the author with a way to compare the benefits and consequences of CIOS projects in different contexts.

The study’s objective is to explain how transitional CIOS projects can contribute to community resilience. The author provides supporting evidence as to how community resilience is improved in post-disaster situations, and his definition of transitional CIOS is pertinent to the kinds of initiatives that increase community resilience. Quantitative evidence in this study on how transitional CIOS projects have contributed to community wellbeing is limited. The use of information from media releases and organisation’s websites as supporting evidence is questionable, as it conveys the organisations’ stated, but perhaps not actual, intentions and impacts.

**Value in relation to community wellbeing**

This study has particular relevance to community resilience and placemaking. The arguments in the study do not regard any traditional art practices, but are relevant to post-disaster transitional creative initiatives. The study cites various examples of how certain “transitional CIOS” projects have contributed to community resilience, social capital, and community empowerment, experimentation, and innovation. The study provides analysis of why these CIOS projects are beneficial but the author argues they may also have limited impacts.

*Swaffield, Simon. “Place, Culture and Landscape after the Christchurch Earthquake”*  
Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study**: This paper focuses on the cultural landscape of Christchurch post-disaster. The study was published in 2013, and the questions posed by some of the arguments have more recently been responded to.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: The study does not necessarily focus on any particular organisations or events, but rather the wider relationships between culture and place.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the study is on the post-disaster cultural landscape of Christchurch. The study compares the political and cultural landscapes before and after the earthquakes.

- **Particular relevance**: The focus of this study has particular relevance to the political and cultural landscape of post-disaster Christchurch, social memory, and urban identity. The study does not necessarily focus on artistic and creative initiatives, but recognises how they influence the emerging landscapes of post-disaster Christchurch.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is not directly related to the benefits of any specific artistic or cultural activities. The study focuses rather on the changing relationships between culture and place in a post-disaster setting. In the case of this particular study, culture is “a distinctive way of living, combining values, practices and technologies” (pg. 1).

Study Description

This study focuses on how political and cultural structures and institutions have been re-placed in post-disaster Christchurch. It specifically focuses on the changing relationships between culture and place. Some of the main shifts include the reconfiguration of everyday life, the reconstitution of identities and memories, and the re-evaluation of future possibilities. The author notes that there have been various attempts to restore familiar patterns of use in the central city, as well as contradicting efforts to use the earthquakes as a way to modernise and implement a more centrally based political agenda.

Key Findings

This study analyses how the cultural and political landscapes have changed before and after the earthquakes. An important focus of the study is on social memory and urban identity, and how it has been used to replace culture and governance structures. Swaffield argues that there has been a “wider tension between public and private interests in heritage, between owners and insurers, and between those who seek to rebuild with continuity to the past, and those who seek a completely new start” (pg. 12). The study analyses how bottom-up programmes that aim to rebuild the cultural landscape of Christchurch in a way that retains values of the past in a sustainable and innovative way are met with contradictory top-down agendas that focus on a rebuild that instead provides economic stimulus for the wider national economy. The author argues that these contradictory forms of rebuilding Christchurch shape the landscape in a way that reflects the wider political economy of New Zealand more strongly than it reflects the social memory of Christchurch’s culture and heritage.
Provenance
Simon Swaffield is a Professor of Landscape Architecture in the School of Landscape Architecture at Lincoln University. The author provides arguments that the post-disaster landscape of Christchurch is being re-shaped by a wider national political economy agenda. The author constructively analyses the political economy of Christchurch and New Zealand pre-earthquakes, and argues that these agendas were facilitated post-disaster. Swaffield argues that governance structures post-disaster have been uneven and controversial, and create a lack of opportunity for public debate over the decisions being made. The author uses arguments made by JL Westcoat and DM Johnston in Political economies of landscape change: places of integrative power, that landscape is shaped and reshaped through the dynamics of political economy. The paper argues that this is true in Christchurch, and that the reshaping of the landscape in Christchurch is the result of national political agendas rather than the preservation of local culture and heritage.

Objectivity
This study examines how collective and individual memories can enrich the identity of particular places and the wider urban landscape of Christchurch. The author notes the importance of preserving these memories in order to rebuild a Christchurch that retains the cultural values of Christchurch before the earthquakes. Despite this importance, the author recognises the wider political agendas of institutions such as CERA, and notes that these collective memories and identities may be lost to national political economy agendas. The author still recognises grassroots efforts to retain these cultural values and memories, and effectively reveals how these contradictory programmes exist in Christchurch post-disaster.

Persuasiveness
The author’s analysis of the role of the national agenda of political economy of Christchurch and New Zealand provides an alternative perspective on how the cultural landscape of Christchurch is being re-shaped post-earthquakes. The author provides arguments that explain the decline of decentralisation and local autonomy in Christchurch in the years leading up to the earthquakes. Swaffield argues that the roles and objectives of CERA resemble the National government’s increase of control of local governance pre-earthquakes. This analysis provides an informative perspective of how the landscape of Christchurch is being re-shaped post-disaster.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study does not have particular relevance to how creative and artistic initiatives have contributed to community wellbeing in post-disaster Christchurch. It provides, however, an alternative perspective of how the landscape of Christchurch is being re-imagined post-earthquakes. This is important in terms of this literature review because it explains how the role of cultural and artistic initiatives are not necessarily prioritised in the agenda of CERA and the national interests of the rebuild. This study evaluates the bottom-up initiatives focused on place and community, versus a top-down government-led programme of economic recovery that benefits a wider national agenda.

Vallance, Suzanne. “Urban Resilience: Bouncing Back, Coping, Thriving”
Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** This study analyses and compares social and political structures that existed pre and post-disaster.

- **Methodology Used:** Participant observation of numerous public events and meetings, and unstructured interviews with active ‘community’ representatives.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The study examines the role of actors at state, regional/city/district, and community levels, including different civil society groups, non-governmental organisations, public authorities, and the central government emergency agency.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the study is on both post-earthquakes initiatives and ongoing activities and institutions.

- **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the social impacts of pre-disaster structures and institutions. It analyses the importance of post-disaster adaptive and participative approaches from community groups and public authorities. The study presents several “social fault-lines” that may either contribute to or hinder post-disaster community resilience.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is more closely related to post-disaster community resilience. The author compares pre- and post-disaster social and political structures in order to explain how community resilience has been facilitated or hindered.

Study Description
This study examines certain pre-existing and emerging “social fault-lines” that have contributed to or hindered community resilience in post-disaster Christchurch. The paper reflects on “the social structures and systems, activities, attitudes and decisions that have helped different Canterbury ‘communities’ along their road to recovery, and highlights some issues that have, unfortunately, held us back” (pg. 2). The author also evaluates the roles of both community members and public authorities regarding community resilience, and asks what these actors can do both before and after a disaster to promote resilience and facilitate recovery.

Key Findings
The study begins by providing several definitions of relevant terms in order to evaluate these terms in the local post-disaster Christchurch context. More specifically, the paper provides definitions of “community” and “resilience”, in order to explain the community resilience of post-disaster Christchurch. The focus of the paper is on three different definitions of “resilience”:

- “The way in which a system **bounces back** following a disturbance;

- The extent to which a system is able to self-organise or **cope with** a disturbance and restore functionality; and

- The ability to **adapt and thrive** in new conditions” (pg. 6).
The author then explains that in order for successful community resilience, there must be both an adaptive capacity (resilience within and among community members) and a participative capacity (resilience through engagement and relationships with others) present in the community. Therefore, community resilience depends not solely on efforts from individual community members and community groups, but also on the relationships that exist between those individuals and groups and other supporting structures such as public authorities. As the author notes, “the responsibility for participative capacity rests with formally appointed leaders, such as our Minister for Earthquake Recovery Gerry Brownlee, and the Mayors and CEOs of our local authorities” (pg. 17).

The study also provides examples of pre and post-disaster “social fault-lines” in Christchurch:

- Pre-disaster: “formal structures governance, the relationship between formal and informal structures, community development, the role and status of CSEs and NGOs, and the management of emergency funding pools” (pg. 17).

- Post-disaster: “leadership at the state, regional/city/district and community levels, information flows or ‘the currency of recovery’, and the value and management of temporary solutions” (pg. 17).

The author recommends that these pre-disaster social fault-lines be dealt with before a disaster in order to facilitate the community resilience post-disaster. If strong community leaders do not exist pre-disaster, these fault-lines may be exacerbated and more difficult to resolve. This study is relevant because it examines the capacities of a community to be resilient in a post-disaster situation. By providing an analysis of the strengths and weaknesses of post-disaster community resilience in Christchurch, the findings in this study can serve as a framework for how to appropriately support artistic and creative initiatives.

Provenance
Suzanne Vallance is a Senior Lecturer of Urban Studies at Lincoln University. Her research expertise includes urban sustainability, urban resilience, urban planning, community engagement, cities and settlements, and public space. Vallance has also contributed to several other post-disaster Christchurch studies regarding community resilience and disaster recovery.

This study provides extensive literature in order to define community resilience. The study also provides additional sources to explain methods of citizen participation in disaster recovery, community-level emergency management, and deliberative planning for disaster recovery. The author also conducts interviews with active community representatives from organisations and groups that she has had an ongoing involvement with. Her familiarity with these groups and individuals provides an informative perspective through participant observations and interviews.

Objectivity
This study explains the complexities of achieving successful community resilience post-disaster. It analyses pre-disaster social fault-lines in Christchurch and explains why they have had an impact on community resilience post-disaster. The study provides exemplary instances of effective post-disaster community resilience, but notes that there have been several structures that have hindered these efforts as well. The author effectively provides examples of pre- and post-disaster community resilience efforts and social structures, and highlights the difficulties that have occurred during both instances. The author does not solely provide examples of successful community
resilience initiatives, but also evaluates the political and social structures that have hindered these initiatives.

**Persuasiveness**
The author's familiarity and participation within active community groups contributes to an informative perspective of community resilience initiatives. The author also evaluates both pre and post-disaster political and social structures that have contributed to or hindered community resilience efforts. Identifying these weaknesses helps to recognise that the responsibility for community resilience lies not just within the community, but also with formally appointed recovery leaders. The study provides varying definitions of community resilience and effectively evaluates the local context in Christchurch utilising these definitions.

**Value in relation to community wellbeing**
This study does not have particular relevance to any specific post-disaster creative or artistic initiatives. It does, however, provide a comprehensive analysis of community resilience initiatives in pre- and post-disaster Christchurch. The study examines social and political structures that have contributed to or hindered community resilience. The identification of these pre- and post-disaster weaknesses may help facilitate disaster recovery and community resilience. This may also be important in regards to how to provide appropriate support to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives.

*Wilson, Geoff A. “Community resilience, social memory and the post-2010 Christchurch (New Zealand) earthquakes”*


**Brief Analysis**
- **Time period covered by the study:** This study evaluates experiences of community resilience in the wake of the post-2010 Christchurch earthquakes, and compares these experiences with previous examples of earthquakes in New Zealand (Wellington 1855, Murchison 1929, and Napier 1931)

- **Methodology Used:** Review of government statistics, secondary sources such as media and newspaper reports, internet-based information, and 16 formal and informal interviews.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This study does not focus on any particular organisations, although the interviewees were selected based upon their specific knowledge of earthquake-related responses, their involvement in government responses to the earthquakes, and their position as affected citizens.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of this study is on the social memory and community resilience in post-disaster Christchurch; however, it also examines examples of post-disaster community resilience that occurred in New Zealand before the 2010-2011 earthquakes in Christchurch.

- **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the impacts of pre-disaster social memory, specifically focusing on how to improve post-disaster community resilience and ensure positive adaptive capacities.
• *Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?* This study is specifically related to the role social memory has in contributing to stronger community resilience.

**Study Description**
This study evaluates community resilience pathways in post-disaster Christchurch. The study compares the pathway of post-disaster Christchurch residents to the residents of previous earthquakes in New Zealand. The author emphasises the importance that social memory (in this case specifically social memory related to past earthquake history) has in terms of strengthening community resilience. The study interviews 16 participants and evaluates their sense of community resilience, how past experiences in Christchurch prepared citizens for the most recent ones, and “how social memory was related to how respondents’ areas, friends and families had been affected and changed by the tremors” (pg. 208). The study reveals uncertainties about the future adaptive capacity of the Christchurch community.

**Key Findings**
The results of this paper come from the responses of the interviewees and supporting evidence on the impacts of social memory on community resilience. The study argues that the lack of significant pre-2010 earthquake social memory regarding earthquakes has been responsible for a relatively weak adaptive capacity among Christchurch citizens. While some citizens may benefit from individual resilience (emigrating from Christchurch and finding opportunities elsewhere), the collective resilience (overall well-functioning community) has been relatively lost. The consensuses among interviewees were “feelings of uncertainty, loss of control (especially among ‘orange zone’ residents awaiting final verdict on their houses), inability to cope and psychological stress among a wide cross-section of stakeholders” (pg. 210).

The author explains that an absence of ‘traumatic’ earthquakes pre-2010 contributes to a lack of a specific sort of social memory that would have better prepared residents for the earthquakes and strong community resilience. This ‘positive learning’ experience that would have contributed to an adaptive social memory did not occur in Christchurch, and as the author suggests, “both knowledge about how to cope with earthquakes and experience in post-disaster management were lacking in Christchurch” (pg. 211). According to the author and supporting evidence, in post-disaster areas with a poorly developed social memory regarding earthquakes, it is more difficult to adapt positive community resilience pathways due to a lack of learning processes before the disaster. This study is relevant to the literature review because it argues that despite the numerous adaptive responses of the Christchurch community, Cantabrians still may not have developed an appropriate level of resilience. Therefore, the study indirectly suggests that post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives have had limited beneficial impacts on community resilience and wellbeing.

**Provenance**
Geoff Wilson is a Professor of Human Geography at Plymouth University in Plymouth, United Kingdom. The arguments in this study are supported by external references that analyse separate examples of post-disaster community resilience. The study also includes interview responses from Christchurch residents and specific experts that explain the interviewee’s “socio-psychological problems associated with feelings of uncertainty, fear of future tremors and an inability to plan for the future” (pg. 210). The study utilises both external references and local knowledge and experiences to analyse pre-disaster social memory and post-disaster community resilience in Christchurch.
Objectivity
The author argues that the Christchurch community was ill prepared for the earthquakes (due to a lack of previous exposure), and that the continuing threat of future earthquakes and feelings of uncertainty from residents contributed to a loss of resilience. The author specifies that is important to distinguish between individual and collective resilience, and that individual resilience in Christchurch may have increased while the collective resilience may have not. According to the study and supporting references, collectively Christchurch residents have felt fatigued, stressed, and unable to proceed to be innovative and entrepreneurial. Although this may be the case with the majority of the Christchurch community, there are still examples of innovative and entrepreneurial initiatives that have been created post-disaster.

Persuasiveness
This study provides a thorough definition of community resilience and relates it to other post-disaster situations such as the Indian Ocean Tsunami (December 2004), the Haiti earthquake (January 2010), and the Japanese tsunami and nuclear disaster (March 2011). The author argues that research on community resilience focuses on how phenomena like climate change, globalisation, and natural hazards impact community resilience, with a lack of sufficient research into how social memory impacts community resilience. This study uses in-depth interviews with local Christchurch residents and experts to analyse the social memory of the Christchurch community and explains how its social memory impacts their ability to be resilient. Ultimately, the study suggests that, according to the responses of the interviewees, the social memory – or the accumulated wisdom, skills, and experience – of Cantabrians pre-disaster lacks sufficient exposure to natural disasters, and this impacts the ability of residents to be resilient.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has particular relevance to community resilience, and how social memory can impact the ability of residents to cope and adapt post-disaster. The study argues the importance of pre-disaster activities and knowledge, and how those experiences are essential for the ability of residents to be resilient. This study does not mention post-disaster creative initiatives, nor does it give many examples of community resilience. Rather, the study analyses the new knowledge that was gained by Cantabrians post-disaster, and argues that this knowledge gained through the resilience process may not be sufficient for future resilience strategies in the case of additional potential disaster situations in Christchurch.
SECTION C: Studies that have particular relevance to Health Benefits

Bidwell, Susan. “Evaluation of the Rockers of Ages Choirs”

Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** The study surveys participants of the Rockers of Ages Choir during one of the choir terms in 2012. The survey was held during one of the regular sessions in last week of March 2012, during a mid-session social break. The survey was meant to represent the benefits of the full term, which is two hours a week for eight weeks. MUSE Community Trust still holds these Rockers of Ages choir sessions in four locations: Linwood, St Albans, Kaiapoi, and Sumner.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The study focuses specifically on the Rockers of Ages choir programme, an initiative set up by the MUSE Community Trust. MUSE is a charitable trust run mostly by volunteers with contracted (paid) tutors and some contracted support staff.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? Although MUSE Community Trust was established before the earthquakes, the Rockers of Ages choir programme was set up in response to the earthquakes.**

- **Particular relevance:** The study has particular relevance to the health impacts of the participative singing Rockers of Ages choir group. It is meant to show the benefits of participative singing for the elderly through increased mental, physical, and emotional wellbeing. The study also notes how the choirs contribute to a sense of social and community integration for those involved.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This study is directly related to how the arts in Christchurch can contribute to community wellbeing. The Rockers of Ages choir was created in response to the stresses and disruptions of the earthquakes, and meant to give people the opportunity to come together for positive activities that strengthen community networks and resilience.**

Study Description

In response to the 2011 earthquakes, the MUSE Community Music Trust in Christchurch set up the Rockers of Ages choir. “Although the aftermath of the earthquake gave impetus to the project – “Sing your way out of the earthquake blues” was the by-line used to promote the choirs – the MUSE Trust had been planning for some time to organise choirs for older people, inspired in part by the movie Young at Heart, which featured an older person’s choir in the United States singing modern, popular songs” (pg. 3). This study evaluates the Rockers of Ages project, and conducts a study aimed to understand the benefits of participative singing for a relatively disadvantaged and vulnerable group of Christchurch citizens.
Key Findings

- “The Rockers of Ages project had been successful in meeting its initial modest aim of providing an enjoyable activity in a non-threatening supportive environment that would lift people’s spirits and give them something positive to focus on. Four choirs had been established and were flourishing with stable membership and engaged participants one year after inception. The choirs had attracted a significant amount of volunteer support from the communities involved as well as from Community and Public Health, and this had undoubtedly helped the choirs become established. The project was well timed and well targeted and had clearly reached the age demographic and the earthquake affected groups that it had originally aimed to through good local promotions, suitable times and venues” (pg. 17).

- “A total of 69 surveys were received, an 81.2% response rate from an estimated membership of 85 choir members” (pg. 8).

- “In Question Two, the mean response was only slightly lower with a mean of 4.4. Fifty-nine respondents (85.5%) rated their enjoyment of the social contact at 4 or 5 on the scale, eight at 3, and one at 2” (pg. 8).

- “Question Three asked participants to indicate whether the singing, the social contact, or the concerts were the most important for them, or whether all were equally important. This question was also completed by all respondents. Thirty six respondents (52.2%) indicated that they felt the singing was the most important part of attending the choir; one person chose the concerts as the most important (1.4%), while 32 (46.4%) indicated that the whole experience (singing, social contact, and concerts) was important” (pg. 8).

- “Participants were asked to indicate if they had experienced any of the positive changes listed in the study that had resulted from belonging to the choir. Over two thirds of those who answered this question (68.7%) indicated that attending the choir had increased the time they spent with other people; almost half (49.3%) said they had experienced an increase in overall wellbeing and 31.3% that membership had reduced their stress. There were two missing responses (2.9%)” (pg. 9).

Provenance

Susan Bidwell was previously employed in the Department of Population Health (University of Otago) as an Information Specialist with the New Zealand Health Technology Assessment Unit working on systematic reviews of evidence. Prior to her employment in the Department of Population Health, Susan worked as the Reference Librarian in the Canterbury Medical Library. Bidwell has also taught a session on literature searching skills on a number of the Diploma of Public Health papers with medical students, and other health practitioners.

The author provides a diversity of evidence and previous arguments that support her view that participative singing contributes to physical and mental wellbeing:

- “The Journal of the Royal Society for Promoting Health provides evidence of the physical, mental, and emotional benefits that may derive from singing (Hacking et al 2006; Skingley and Vella-Burrows 2010; Greaves and Farbus 2006)” (pg. 3).
“Singing fills both the qualities that are considered essential ingredients for wellbeing: hedonia (a state of pleasure) and eudaimonia (a sense of meaningfulness or engagement in life). This feeling of meaning and engagement is emerging as a hitherto under-recognised but crucial component of health promotion and one which is able to ‘... lead to transformative health experiences and enhanced quality of life’ (Berridge and Kingelback 2011)” (pg. 3).

“There have been a number of studies that have specifically focused on the effects of belonging to a singing group or choir for older people. The Sounds Lively! Choirs were introduced by the Isle of Wight Healthcare NHS Trust in 2002 for older people receiving its programmes of community healthcare (Eades and O’Connor 2008)” (pg. 3).

The methodology used included a survey distributed during one of the weekly sessions, as well as direct interviews with a majority of the choir members. People attending the choirs during their regular sessions in the last week of March 2012 were asked to fill in a simple survey during the mid-session social break. The survey aimed to gather information on the relative importance that members placed on the music and social components of the choir respectively, any benefits they believed they had gained from attending, any barriers to attending for themselves or others they knew of, and to gather demographic data on sex and age.

To add more depth and detail to the survey responses, a convenience sample of choir attendees was recruited at the time of the survey for interviewing individually. Those present on the day of the survey were asked to indicate on a separate sheet if they would be prepared to be interviewed about their experiences of participating in the choir.

Four staff from Community and Public Health were briefed on the approach to interviewing to ensure consistency. The interviews were restricted to a maximum of ten minutes so that they could be fitted in to the time available during the mid-session break of the respective choir sessions.

Objectivity
The author provides exhaustive evidence claiming the benefits of participatory singing on mental and physical health, community resilience, and personal empowerment. The author notes, however, that the evidence and arguments usually needed further research, and provided limitations and arguments against her own arguments:

“In spite of the accumulating evidence on the benefits of singing, a recent comprehensive review of the literature on singing, health and wellbeing (Gick 2010) concluded that the evidence, while promising, needed to be supported by further research “…to confirm preliminary findings of the health and wellbeing benefits of singing, determine their underlying mechanisms, and compare singing to other activities that may benefit health and wellbeing (Gick 2010, p. 28)” (pg. 6).

“One of the key problems in gathering this level of evidence is the difficulty in measuring emotional wellbeing and resilience. Many of the studies cited above relied on self report; others used standard validated measures designed to look for the presence or absence of mental illness rather than focusing on positive qualities that make up wellbeing and quality of life” (pg. 6).
• “This study had a number of obvious limitations. The results are based on self-report from participants who are a self-selected group and may not necessarily be the most disadvantaged from their respective communities. The choirs were set up as a response after the Christchurch earthquake of February 2011 and there was no consideration of an evaluation at the time of their inception. There was therefore no baseline survey of general wellbeing or social connectedness that could be compared with the same measurement a year later to show any change” (pg. 18).

Persuasiveness
The author’s survey methodology was well organised and executed. It received a high response rate, and the results provided sufficient data for the arguments of the studies. The survey asked multiple questions based on what the participants thought were the most important parts of joining the choir. Aside from having a high response rate with the surveys, the results showed that there were many positive changes that were felt from joining the Rockers of Ages Choir including sleeping better, reduced stress, increase in overall wellbeing, increase in time spent with others, and an increase of number of friends.

The individual interviews and additional comments in the surveys also contributed to some qualitative evidence of the uplifting experience of singing, increased social connectedness, the feeling of participating in meaningful achievements, and how choir participation contributed to restoration and healing:

• “This is a wonderful resource. I find the singing uplifting. It really feels like a supportive and caring extended family” (pg.13).

• “This has become a significant activity, which has a strong positive effect on my enjoyment and community involvement” (pg. 14).

• “I feel this is the most beneficial post-earthquake experience – by that I mean of all the post-quake helping things, this is by far the best for me” (pg. 16).

• “I was feeling quite distressed and anxious after the earthquake and now feel so much better and alive” (pg. 16).

The study also cites arguments from multiple other authors, and supports its own argument with convincing qualitative and quantitative data (survey responses and responses from interviews). This contributes to the validity of the author’s original argument, and also provides evidence of the benefits of an artistic post-disaster initiative that has had various impacts on community wellbeing in multiple suburbs of Christchurch. The age of the participants ranges from 40-65 years and over, and therefore does not reflect the wider age groups of the Christchurch population.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
The study provides quantitative and qualitative evidence that a post-disaster creative initiative – in this case the participation in the Rockers of the Ages Choir – contributed to the mental and physical health of the participants, as well as a stronger sense of social connectedness (therefore examining both the health and social impacts that are sought out in our own study). This is one of the studies that directly responds to the question of how creative and artistic post earthquakes initiatives can contribute to community wellbeing, especially regarding health benefits.
Egan, Candice J and Mark C. Quigley. “Dancing earthquake science assists recovery from the Christchurch earthquakes”  

Brief Analysis
• **Time period covered by the study:** Choreographies by both professional choreographers and Hagley Dance Company’s student dancers were developed beginning in August 2011. The seven-member dance company performed five shows (4 nightly and 1 matinee) of Move: A Seismic Journey at the Christchurch Body Festival from 27 to 30 September 2011. The surveys of the dancers and choreographers were conducted twenty-six months after the production of Move: A Seismic Journey.

• **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The study focuses on the choreographer and dancers of the Hagley Dance Company. The study also analyses the impacts that this performance had on the general audience.

• **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of the study is on a post-earthquake dance performance choreographed and performed by the Hagley Dance Company. The performance – which was called Move: A Seismic Journey – was created in response to the earthquakes.

• **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the health and social impacts of dance education and therapy programmes. The study argues that Move: A Seismic Journey was a performance that fits the criteria of dance education with therapeutic aspects. The study also argues that this performance was able to increase social cohesion among the performers, and even create a sense of community resilience and recovery among the general audience.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is directly related to how a post-disaster artistic initiative contributes to the social wellbeing and health of the Christchurch community. The study focuses on Move: A Seismic Journey, a Hagley Dance Company performance that was created in response to the earthquakes to help the community with therapeutic recovery and community resilience.

Study Description
This study analyses Hagley Dance Company’s performance Move: A Seismic Journey. In 2011, student dancers of the Hagley Dance Company and dance professionals choreographed the performance for the Christchurch Body Festival. Choreographic design was assisted by a professional earthquake scientist (Mark Quigley) and used human movement to represent earthquake-like impacts and processes. Some of the processes that were represented through the performance included “seismologic and geologic processes, building response, collapse and demolition, and earthquake-induced psychological experiences” (pg. 161). The study explains how the choreographies and dancers used properties, costumes, audio support, and movement to represent these natural processes, and the effects they have on human behaviour and wellbeing. As the author notes, the paper outlines the “context and theory behind the construction of this performance, highlighting in particular the use of geological and engineering concepts to develop dance choreographies that expressed scientific aspects of earthquakes in general and the Christchurch earthquakes in particular” (pg. 162).
The study also discusses the results from a survey that was conducted by the authors 26 months after the performance. The survey asked the choreographers and student dancers how the performance affected their ability to cope and recover from the earthquakes. The author explains that “the results were investigated to evaluate whether the participation in this production yielded any therapeutic aspects in terms of earthquake recovery” (pg. 162). In addition to the survey results the study includes different reviews of the show that state that the performance effectively represented a scientific study of the earthquakes through the medium of dance. The responses of the reviewers provided a proxy for the general audience, and the consensus among them was that they felt the performance had a therapeutic effect and they could relate to the emotions and representations of the dancers during the performance.

Key Findings
The study argues that the Move: A Seismic Journey performance had positive impacts for the dancers, choreographers, and general audience involved. The study explains that those who experienced the most significant benefits were the dancers that are residents of the Canterbury region. This is because they were the most involved in the performance and personally experienced the consequences of the earthquakes. The study explains how the combination of scientific-based empirical evidence with a creative activity such as dance promotes “aspects such as being imaginative, risk-taking, question-posing, question-responding, self-determination, innovation, playfulness, and immersion…” (pg. 181).

One of the main impacts for the dancers included an increased knowledge of earthquake science: “being able to link this traumatic experience with scientific knowledge encouraged them to contemplate their connections with nature, to regain self-control (or to acknowledge and thus cope with elements that are out of their control), and to validate their experiences with others, thereby empowering them and enhancing their recovery” (pg. 180). Other conclusions drawn from the survey results found that the dancers experienced “highly positive responses to questions pertaining to self-perceived recovery (iii), gaining closure (v), dealing with trauma (vi), and coping with the earthquakes (vii) through dancing and choreographing including several components of the hope recovery characteristic (believing recovery is possible, looking optimistically to the future, developing connections with nature, and making art)” (pg. 162).

In regards to the general audiences, the perspectives of certain reviewers were used to generalise the perspectives of the rest of the audience. The main impact of the performance on the general audience seemed to be a sense of empathy and understanding. The reviewers reported feeling that the performance enabled audiences to relate some of their traumatic experiences to the dance performance. These feelings had a beneficial effect on recovery and the performance also “created an environment that the reviewers (a proxy for the general audience) found exciting, uplifting, believable, enthralling, mesmerising, and effective for ‘feeling more normal’” (pg. 181).

Provenance
This study includes the expertise of a professional dance teacher and an associate professor of Geological Sciences. Candice Egan is the director of the Hagley Dance Company at Hagley Community College in Christchurch, New Zealand. The Hagley Dance Company is a full-time contemporary postsecondary dance course for students of 16 years of age or older. Egan also teaches high-school dance up to National Certificate of Educational Achievement (NCEA) accreditation. She is a board member of the Dance and Physical Theatre (DAPHT) Trust and has a
Bachelor of Arts and a Bachelor of Teaching from Deakin University. Mark Quigley is an associate professor of Geological Sciences at the University of Canterbury in Christchurch.

The methodology used in the study comprises different qualitative and quantitative data. The qualitative data sources include “the title and written descriptions of each dance piece, transcripts of verbal discussions of choreographic meaning with the choreographers, interpretations of some of the choreographic movements, comment sections of dancer and choreographer surveys, and the external reviews of *Move: A Seismic Journey*” (pg. 164). The qualitative analysis compared each piece of choreography in the performance to the recovery elements of Jacobson and Greenley (2001). The performance aimed to promote and evaluate recovery through several approaches: educational approaches, physical approaches, teamwork approaches, choreographic independence and creative approaches, and professional approaches. The interviews of the participants provided the study with thorough quantitative data, and the responses were organised by number values and statistical distributions of these values.

The study uses supporting arguments to explain the therapeutic benefits of dance production and performances. The study argues that *Move: A Seismic Journey* cannot be compared to traditional Dance Movement Therapy (DMT), but rather is an example of dance education with therapeutic aspects. The differences are highlighted in the paper using several supporting arguments. The contribution of Mark C. Quigley as an associate professor of Geological Sciences provides a legitimising framework to represent earthquake impacts through dance performance.

**Objectivity**
This study includes mostly supporting arguments and few arguments contrary to its own. The study does note, however, that the performance had a certain lack of expertise regarding professional dance therapists: “The statistically small data-set and lack of participating professional dance therapists or psychologists require that similar studies should be conducted before implementation into DMT practice, particularly in the case of more severely traumatised subjects following natural disasters” (pg. 181). The *Move: A Seismic Journey* performance is unique in that it uses dance performance to represent geological earthquake movements and processes, and the impacts those have on human behaviours and wellbeing. Therefore this study is analysing a specific performance that may not have been duplicated in many other circumstances and the amount of contrary evidence to claim that dance performances do not have therapeutic benefits in a post-disaster context is uncertain.

**Persuasiveness**
The arguments of the study that dance education and performances have therapeutic benefits in a post-disaster context are supported by various references. The methodology used compares different choreographed pieces with an already proven framework that explains concepts of recovery in behavioural health (Jacobson and Greenley 2001). The study also includes evidence from a variety of other sources: dancer and choreographer surveys and comments; professional reviews; personal experiences and observations of the dancers, choreographers, and general audiences. The use of geological and engineering concepts by the Hagley Dance Company to develop the dance choreographies in *Move: A Seismic Journey* creates a well-researched artistic expression of the scientific and psychological aspects of earthquakes. The study includes scientific characteristics of different aspects of earthquake science and explains how those scientific descriptions where represented through choreography in the performance.
Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has particular relevance to the social and health impacts of a single post-disaster artistic initiative. It argues that Move: A Seismic Journey, a dance performance created in response to the earthquakes, had therapeutic benefits for its participants and general audiences. Additionally, the study highlights how integrating dance with science can assist in recovery from natural disasters. More generally, the results of this study, along with previous studies on dance education programmes with therapeutic aspects and DMT practices, suggest that these sorts of programmes can help a population to cope and recover from the trauma associated with a post-disaster experience. The author also argues that the use of expressive movement and dance can act as a vehicle for personal integration, growth, and healing.

Joyce, Zita. “RadioQuake: Getting back ‘on air’ after the Christchurch earthquakes”

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study**: The study analyses the period after the earthquakes up until 2013. Interviews were carried out over a period of eighteen months in 2012 and 2013.

- **Methodology Used**: Semi-structured interviews, correlated literature, Facebook and Twitter posts and first-hand accounts of earthquake experiences preserved by the University of Canterbury’s CEISMIC Canterbury Earthquake Digital Archive.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: The study examines three local and independent Christchurch radio stations: Plains FM, Pulsar, and Tahu FM.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** Plains FM has been broadcasting since 1989; Tahu FM began broadcasting in 1991; and Pulzar was introduced in 2008.

- **Particular relevance**: This study evaluates the social and health impacts of local Christchurch radio stations in a post-disaster situation. The article explores how these radio stations returned to air through alternative and resilient approaches after being disrupted by the February 2011 earthquake.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is directly related to the social and health benefits of local radio stations after the earthquakes.

Study Description
This article analyses the resilient approaches of three local independent radio stations that had to abandon their central city workspaces after the 22 February earthquake. The study examines how these radio stations were able to return “to air through new combinations and interconnections of people, workspace, technology, content and transmission” (pg. 57). The study interviews the managers of each radio station, and recounts their experiences immediately before, during and after the September 2010 and February 2011 earthquakes. The study explains how the managers and their radio stations “demonstrate the importance of community support, institutional recognition and personal efficacy in enabling a radio station to be resilient enough to support broader community resilience” (pg. 68). The author argues that these independent radio stations
did not serve just an informational role to its audiences, but also contributed to community information seeking, solidarity and restoring community.

**Key Findings**
The author of this study interviewed the managers of three independent radio stations to document their experiences following the earthquakes, particularly regarding the resilience of their radio stations. The author evaluates certain aspects of each of these radio stations, including their change of workspaces, the wellbeing of the staff, the content of the radio stations post-disaster, and issues with transmission and broadcast technology. The following is a brief evaluation of each radio station according to the findings in the study:

- **Plains FM:**

  “Plains FM was able to fulfil its role as a community access broadcaster, providing space for multiple ethnic, interest and language communities in Christchurch to respond to the effects of the earthquake ... the most important informational function was gathering and passing on health and civil defence information to the different language groups catered to by the station” (pg. 63).

  “Plains FM lost a number of broadcasters as a result of the earthquakes, as people left the city or were unable to manage doing the radio show. Because the station’s primary source of income is the fees paid by broadcasters to host programmes, the number of broadcasters has a direct financial impact on the station, so the salaried staff could only be maintained because of an Earthquake Wage Subsidy offered by government for the first six weeks after the quake” (pg. 64).

  “The Quake Panel broadcast twice a week for five weeks, in which people involved in the rescue, civil defence and the processes of maintaining the city were brought together to talk about their experiences and what was happening in the city at the time” (pg. 64).

- **Tahu FM:**

  “Tahu FM serves a specific community: members of the Ngāi Tahu iwi around Te Wai Pounamu, the South Island. Its role is to support the language and culture of Ngāi Tahu, and the station plays an important role in the overall community infrastructure of the iwi. The September 2010 earthquake disrupted the station briefly, but the period after the earthquake was treated as a time to recover and look after each other rather than to restore the live broadcast system and the business as soon as possible” (pg. 64)

  “Broadcast support from Iwi Radio Network stations in the North Island reinforced the strength of the network, and the role of Tahu FM, within Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu. Within the network, Jones feels that the stations became stronger and more closely connected through the post-quake period, and the Tahu FM staff in particular felt more connected to the other stations” (pg. 65).

  “After the earthquake that meant that the staff of Tahu FM were actively working to support the people, driving around the ‘rickety old roads’ of Christchurch delivering donations and food. That created a direct connection with their audience ...” (pg. 66).
● **Pulzar:**

“Because of their commercial position, Pulzar FM was more affected by the September earthquake than Plains or Tahu FM. By 4 September 2010, the station had a strong advertiser base in the central city bars and venues ... Pretty much every booking that we had for the month of September, [was] cancelled” (pg. 67).

“Until May 2011 Pulzar operated from Poulson’s home, where the DJs would record their shows and voicebreaks, then remotely ‘upload them to the computer at the broadcast engineer’s house, which would then play them out to on air’. With this system, Pulzar broadcast semi-live through the period in which Plains FM was off air, and Tahu FM was rebroadcasting other iwi stations” (pg. 67).

“The station was heavily in debt and unable to access the equipment still trapped in their original studio in the city. Despite the debt and losses, Poulson and Akehurst relaunched the station, again, on 19 October 2012, from Akehurst’s home. They returned to air just within the time limit established in the licence conditions before forfeiting the frequency, but from a different transmitter site, the Kordia bill still unpaid. In October 2013, Pulzar FM celebrated its first ‘returniversary’, and they moved into a new studio at the end of that year” (pg. 68).

Each of these independent radio stations had different responses and difficulties to the post-disaster situation. Some of the stations were able to receive additional support from external relationships (i.e. Tahu FM with Ngāi Tahu), while others remained completely independent but still were capable of producing regular radio shows (i.e. Pulzar). The objectives of each of these radio stations were similar, which was to provide informational and emotional support to their audiences in a time of grief and despair. While the radio stations had to adapt their content and workspaces, each of them was able to proceed with continual support from its audience and even to create alternative methods of production.

**Provenance**

Zita Joyce is a Lecturer at the University of Canterbury in the Media and Communications department. Her interest in broadcasting and radio technologies stems from years of volunteer DJing at RDU, the University of Canterbury-based radio station, where she was also programme director from 1997 to 2000.

The study provides thorough supporting evidence regarding information systems and communities, radio communication with disaster-affected communities and the role of radio in disaster management. The author also interviews pertinent actors and conducts several interviews with the same actors during multiple crucial moments (directly after the earthquakes and several months after). The use of online sources such as Facebook and UC’s CEISMIC database also provided the author with pertinent information around people’s relationship with radio stations post-disaster.

**Objectivity**

This study does not provide extensive evidence that is contrary to its own arguments. The methodology of the study does, however, provide multiple perspectives from pertinent actors. The methodology of conducting multiple interviews with the same actors provides a timeline of comparative information. This comparative analysis provides perspectives of the managers of the independent radio stations examined both immediately after the earthquakes and several months
after. That way, the author of this study was able to see the progression of these radio stations through the eyes of those in charge.

**Persuasiveness**
The author provides supporting evidence and comparative case studies to analyse the role of radio stations in a post-disaster situation. The author cites examples from post-disaster New Orleans, Haiti and Japan. These comparative case studies provide supporting evidence regarding radio stations coping with depleted resources and emotional stress after a disaster. The interviews conducted in the study are also pertinent and provide contextual information for the results in the study.

**Value in relation to community wellbeing**
This study looks at how long-standing cultural organisations (independent radio stations) have contributed to community resilience, solidarity, and emotional wellbeing. According to the author, these independent radio stations and the people managing them made significant efforts to provide the services they delivered pre-disaster to their audiences immediately following the earthquakes. The author emphasizes that these radio stations provided more than just informational content after the earthquakes, also contributing to a sense of community connection that is vital in post-disaster situations. Additionally, the author explains that this research “is part of a broader project exploring the role of radio after the Christchurch earthquakes, which examines all of the networked and independent stations in Christchurch, aiming to follow the stations over a number of years as they move to more permanent workspaces” (pg. 61). This study, and subsequent related research, examines how independent radio stations have had post-disaster social and health impacts.

Louise Thornley et al. “Building community resilience: Learning from the Canterbury earthquakes”  

**Brief Analysis**
- **Time period covered by the study:** The fieldwork conducted in this study took place from May to July 2012, 15-17 months after the destructive February 2011 earthquake.

- **Methodology Used:** Focus-group discussions and direct interviews. Ninety community leaders and residents participated in the study; participants ranged in age from 21 to 79 years and were ethnically diverse.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This study analyses the resilience of specific Christchurch communities, including those in Lyttelton, Shirley and Inner City East. Additionally the study focuses on marae communities, migrant and refugee communities, and Christchurch Community House.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** All of the communities examined are communities that have formed and existed before the earthquakes.
• **Particular relevance**: This study is not directly related to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives; rather, it examines the importance of community participation in disaster planning and recovery. It also gives examples of the benefits of certain artistic and creative activities for the communities studied.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This study is related to post-disaster community resilience, especially regarding what increases a community’s ability to adapt after a disaster, analysing this from the perspective of post-disaster communities themselves.

**Study Description**

This study uses international and local literature about post-disaster community resilience to examine the resilience of six specific communities in Christchurch. The findings of the study confirm that community participation was vital for these communities and is also important in terms of official disaster responses. The study also focuses on factors that helped and hindered community resilience. The communities that were examined “were selected on advice from local experts and included some of the hardest hit communities in Canterbury” (pg. 1). Finally, the author provides suggestions for increasing community resilience, especially in post-disaster environments.

**Key Findings**

The selected communities examined in the study were chosen to ensure a diversity of geographic communities, ‘communities of interest’ (ethnic and workplace communities), earthquake impact, and socioeconomic and ethnic status. Some of the general findings include evidence of the importance of pre-existing community connectedness and infrastructure; the importance of having both informal, spontaneous support and formal disaster responses; the danger of limited community engagement in official decisions; the importance of cultural practices and values in assisting recovery; the importance of adaptation; and the importance of external support from local and central authorities.

Regarding the effects of community responses on wellbeing, many participants emphasised that community support had a powerful effect on wellbeing. The author notes that “Residents reported that just being together and helping one another provided reassurance, reduced feelings of fear and isolation, and gave a sense of belonging” (pg. 20). The findings of the study argue that community events (concerts, festivals and barbecues), spiritual practices, and contributing to community responses (both as volunteers and paid community workers) are all beneficial for wellbeing. The engagement in these sorts of activities counteracted feelings of helplessness, provided structure, purpose and meaning, and enhanced energy levels of the participants involved.

The study also notes the perspectives of participants regarding post-disaster creative and artistic initiatives: “Many felt that spontaneous public art and creativity brought ‘colour and life’ and positivity, and symbolised resilience and regeneration. One participant said that art was nourishing and could lift people’s spirits or challenge them to think differently. However, “a few residents saw creative and morale-boosting initiatives as an impractical use of time and energy when there were more urgent needs to address” (pg. 21).
Additionally, the study explains constraints to the effectiveness of community support: “Some community members reported they lacked awareness of community initiatives or did not have the energy or ‘headspace’ to participate in them because of ongoing earthquake-related problems. This limited the positive impact of the initiatives” (pg. 22).

Overall the study suggests that participation in community responses positively impacted personal wellbeing. The findings argue that engagement and participation in post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives contributed to positive social and health impacts, ultimately facilitating the process of community resilience among the communities studied.

Provenance
The selected communities that were researched in this study were chosen from an advisory group that guided the research. This advisory group was mostly comprised of individuals from the Canterbury District Health Board and the Mental Health Foundation. The advisory group ensured that the participants and communities involved in the research were relevant and came from different communities, socioeconomic backgrounds, and ethnicities. A total of 92 community leaders and residents participated in the case studies, ranging from the ages of 21 to 79 years.

The Health and Research Council of New Zealand and Canterbury Medical Research Foundation funded the study. Additionally the methodology included an international literature review that identified key findings on disaster resilience (particularly what helps and hinders community resilience) and mental well-being in relation to disasters. The fieldwork also consisted of voice-recorded group discussions and semi-structured interviews.

Objectivity
The participants from this study come from diverse communities, socioeconomic backgrounds, and ethnicities, providing an overview of community resilience from several perspectives. The study also recognises certain limitations of the research, including the scale of the earthquakes in regards to being capable of providing overviews of additional communities and research, selection bias of particular communities and recall bias of the participants. As noted in the study, “our findings present a ‘snapshot’ in time; other factors may have affected resilience in the immediate aftermath that participants then forgot or now take for granted” (pg. 16). Nevertheless, the study evaluates communities that have not been examined in other studies in this literature review, specifically marae communities and migrant and refugee communities.

Persuasiveness
The advisory group of this study was specifically chosen and included members from prominent health institutions in New Zealand. The communities chosen in the study were also meant to represent a range of demographics from different communities within Christchurch. As noted in the study, “These diverse communities were selected on advice from local experts and included some of the hardest hit communities in Canterbury” (pg. 1). The thorough fieldwork provided findings from these communities that reinforced pre-existing literature regarding post-disaster community resilience and wellbeing.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study has direct relevance to the social and health impacts of community resilience and post-disaster community responses. The findings of the study support international literature that argues the importance of community resilience in post-disaster environments. The study argues that participating in community support and responses enhanced individual and collective
wellbeing, and facilitated further community resilience and involvement. This study also provides perspectives from specific communities that are not significantly represented in the other studies in this literature review, especially marae communities and migrant and refugee communities.

**Canterbury Earthquake Recovery Authority. “Canterbury Wellbeing Index June 2015”**

**Brief Analysis**
- **Time period covered by the study:** The CERA Wellbeing Survey has been developed six-monthly since September 2012.

- **Methodology Used:** Literature review of international best practice “Designing indicators for measuring recovery from disasters” (undertaken by Canterbury District Health Board), and series of meetings with representatives of 28 agencies to identify the social indicators that should be tracked through the recovery.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** This survey covers a multitude of organisations and institutions throughout Christchurch that correspond to numerous sectors within the city.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The survey examines social indicators from individual citizens, organisations and institutions, most of which are long-standing, but also evaluates new post-disaster organisations.

- **Particular relevance:** This survey has particular relevance to the health, social and economic impacts of involvement in the arts. The survey also covers other social indicators that are not relevant to artistic and creative initiatives, however for the purpose of this literature review only the section about the involvement in the arts will be discussed.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** This survey identifies the social indicators that should be tracked during recovery, including involvement in the arts.

**Study Description**
This survey was developed in partnership with Christchurch City Council, Waimakariri District Council, Selwyn District Council, the Canterbury District Health Board, Ngai Tahu and the Natural Hazards Wellbeing Index, and this survey forms a significant part of the Canterbury Wellbeing Index. The Canterbury Wellbeing Index was developed by the Canterbury Earthquake Recovery (CERA) to track the progress of social recovery in post-disaster Christchurch. The Canterbury Wellbeing Index and the Canterbury Wellbeing Survey are collaborative projects across many governmental agencies and identify emerging trends and issues used to inform decision-making regarding social recovery.
Key Findings
This survey provides results from the Canterbury Wellbeing Index that evaluate several social indicators including social connectedness, safety, health, mental wellbeing, housing, economic wellbeing, and knowledge and skills. For the purpose of this literature review, only the section on social connectedness will be discussed, especially how participation and attendance of the arts contributes to health and social impacts. Overall, “levels of connectedness have been slowly decreasing in New Zealand cities. Despite significant population movement as a result of the earthquakes, people in greater Christchurch reported that levels of connectedness in their neighbourhoods decreased less between the pre earthquake period and April 2015 (a 5 per cent decrease) than across other New Zealand cities (a 10 per cent decrease)” (pg. 7). The survey also explains that the overall quality of life in greater Christchurch has decreased; the proportion of people reporting that they feel stressed always or most of the time has increased significantly; and the number of people entering mental health services has also increased since the earthquakes. These results and others are compared to national averages.

In terms of how the participation and attendance in the arts can contribute to post-disaster social and mental recovery, the survey provides a section on these results. The survey notes that “People attend and participate in the arts for pleasure, creative expression, personal growth and learning. Through participation in the arts, people are able to establish social ties and connect with their own and other cultures. When individuals gain such advantages, the wider public also benefits. For example, cultures have greater empathy and understanding towards each other and communities are more able to express and create common values and identity” (pg. 143). The survey explains that the earthquakes destroyed and disrupted much of the arts infrastructure, and that arts community organisations and practitioners have driven the recovery of the arts and cultural sectors, with support from funding agencies such as Creative New Zealand. Despite the challenges within the arts community, “90 per cent of Christchurch residents agree that arts and culture have a vital role to play in rebuilding the city” (pg. 143).

Provenance
This survey and the Canterbury Wellbeing Index are a collaborative project among numerous governmental agencies. “CERA requests and receives administrative and survey data from multiple agencies regularly to form the basis of the indicators in the Canterbury Wellbeing Index” (pg. 8). Also, “Draft indicators are subjected to peer review and quality assurance processes, and agencies responsible for the indicators review the content prior to public release” (pg. 8). The results from both this survey and the Canterbury Wellbeing Index are extensive and highlight the social indicators necessary for the recovery of the greater Christchurch.

Objectivity
The results from the Canterbury Wellbeing Survey accrue from administrative and survey data from numerous agencies, and represent a variety of governmental agencies within prominent sectors involved in the rebuild. The survey lacks any direct data from smaller arts or cultural organisations. There is, however, significant data that is received from Creative NZ, a funding agency that represents a number of these smaller organisations. Overall the Canterbury Wellbeing Survey and the Canterbury Wellbeing Index represent a wide variety of sectors to evaluate social indicators necessary for the recovery of greater Christchurch.
Persuasiveness
This survey provides bi-annual analyses of social indicators important for the recovery of greater Christchurch. The follow up of these indicators allows for up-to-date and comparative results on important social indicators including information on health, social connectedness, and economic wellbeing. The survey is collated by a multitude of pertinent governmental agencies, but may lack important information from smaller organisations and institutions. There is a specific section in the survey allocated for measuring the benefits of the participation and attendance in arts activities and organisations.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This survey has direct relevance to the health, social, and economic impacts of participating in and attending arts and cultural activities. The survey explains that “The innovation of the arts and cultural sectors in leading the recovery of the sector and in prioritising transitional activities within the central city has had a significant impact on the wellbeing of residents through the recovery” (pg. 146). The survey shows that despite the destruction and disruption of many arts and culture infrastructures, the arts community has been able to maintain people’s ability to participate in the arts and cultural sectors. The results of the survey also highlight that attendance in arts and cultural sectors has increased since the earthquakes, which is measured by the breadth of arts and culture opportunities available. This resilience and adaptation contributed to continued economic growth and cultural activities post-disaster.

Bidwell, Susan. “The arts in health: evidence from the international evidence”

Brief Analysis
- **Time period covered by the study:** The study is a literature review that includes selected studies limited to those published in the last ten years (from 2004 up to March 2014).

- **Methodology used:** This literature review only includes studies that report on arts programmes in music, drama, dance or visual arts in community settings, including community mental health settings.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** The literature review analyses international studies that cover a wide range of artistic organisations, events, programmes, and initiatives that were created to have beneficial impacts to the participants’ mental and physical health and wellbeing.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The focus of this study is on ongoing artistic activities that have been beneficial to participants’ health and wellbeing.

- **Particular relevance:** This literature review has particular relevance to the health impacts of art-based initiatives and practices. The literature review analyses different studies that argue that certain arts practices have contributed to participants’ health and wellbeing. The aim of the literature review is to demonstrate that participation in the arts is receiving increasing attention for its health promoting potential.
• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience/placemaking? This study is not directly related to the benefits of post-disaster arts and culture activities. The literature review focuses on the mental and physical health benefits of participation in arts, but not necessarily in a post-disaster context.

Study Description
This literature review analyses over twenty international representative studies that evaluate different types of arts programmes and their contribution to participants’ health and wellbeing. The different programmes included are general arts programmes, music programmes, visual arts programmes, dance, drama, and movement-based creative expression programmes, and arts programmes in the service of health promotion. The overall consensus among these studies is that exposure to and participation in creative activities is life enhancing and can assist greater wellbeing. The literature review provides a brief outline of theories and quantitative and qualitative methodologies that are used to evaluate the health and wellbeing benefits of participating in these arts programmes.

Key Findings
The literature review gives several key findings that are specific to each of the different arts programmes. Each study also develops or utilises certain methodologies, and the literature review evaluates the strengths and weaknesses of these methodologies. The review also notes the difficulties in evaluating the participation in arts and its benefits to health and wellbeing. Several key points were mentioned in the study:

• Increased number of studies regarding health benefits of the arts: “Increasing interest in the contribution of the arts to the wider dimensions of health is apparent in the growing number of studies and associated commentary in the international academic literature. Perspectives in Public Health (2013), Journal of Health Psychology (2008), Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing (2007) and Journal of the Royal Society for the Promotion of Health (2006) have all issued special sections on the topic in the last few years, and in 2009, a new journal Arts in Health was launched” (pg.4).

• Engagement in arts increases wellbeing: “One of the important aspects of engaging in creative arts is that it provides an opportunity for continually mastering new skills and more difficult material. It therefore fills both the aspects of experience considered essential for wellbeing: hedonia (enjoyment or pleasure) and eudaimonia (a sense of meaningfulness or engagement in life) (Berridge and Kringlebach, 2011)” (pg. 5).

• Participation in arts increases social cohesion: “The arts are a way of connecting with others; participating in a meaningful group activity with likeminded people has additional social benefits in reducing isolation and building networks of friends. Having social contacts and taking part in activities outside the home are known to be factors that help protect against physical and mental decline as people age (Hammerman-Rozenberg et al., 2005; Harris and Thoresen, 2005; Robb et al., 2008)” (pg. 6).
Engagement in arts increases self-confidence: “Evidence from both quantitative and qualitative studies shows that there can be significant benefits to psychosocial health, improved self-esteem, confidence, self-efficacy and overall quality of life. Improved social contact and improved social support through the making of new friends have also been widely reported (pg. 16).”

Difficulties evaluating the benefits of the participation in arts: “One of the barriers to developing an evidence base for the positive effect of participation in the arts on health and wellbeing has been the difficulty of measuring outcomes in terms that are meaningful to policy makers and funders as well as artists and participants. Much of the difficulty lies in the underlying tension between the philosophical differences of the creative arts and health care systems, and whether the programmes should aim primarily for artistic or social objectives” (pg. 16).

Provenance
Susan Bidwell was previously employed in the Department of Population Health (University of Otago) as an Information Specialist with the New Zealand Health Technology Assessment Unit working on systematic reviews of evidence. Prior to her employment in the Department of Population Health Susan worked as the Reference Librarian in the Canterbury Medical Library. Bidwell has also taught a session on literature searching skills on a number of the Diploma of Public Health papers with medical students, and other health practitioners.

The literature review contains a multitude of studies that argue that participation in artistic initiatives and programmes contributes to some form of physical, mental or social wellbeing. The analysis of each of these studies also includes a brief description of the methodologies used in the study, and may be useful for choosing a methodology to evaluate the benefits of the participation in arts. Some of the methods used include the SF36 Quality of Life questionnaire, Geriatric Depression Scale, Basic Psychological Needs Scale, Individual Empowerment Assessment (IEA), and the mental health CORE (Clinical Outcomes in Routine Evaluation) measure. Many of these studies used established health measures in combination with traditional academic methods (surveys, direct interviews, participant observation, etc.) to evaluate the participation in arts in the most thorough way possible.

Objectivity
One of the main challenges that is noted in the literature review is the difficulty in the evaluation of how arts programmes benefit health and wellbeing. The wide range of studies each conducted their research with different methods, and the author of the literature review notes that it is difficult to create a consensus on the best way of evaluating these programmes. As noted in the literature review, “One of the barriers to developing an evidence base for the positive effect of participation in the arts on health and wellbeing has been the difficulty of measuring outcomes in terms that are meaningful to policy makers and funders as well as artists and participants” (pg. 16). The author also notes that evaluation methods are usually not well developed and lack practical detail. Although the literature review contains a multitude of studies that present the benefits of certain arts programmes, it is well recognised that the evaluation methods used in these studies may still lack efficiency.
Persuasiveness
This study provides a comprehensive review of the evaluation of the participation in the arts and the potential benefits of these engagements. The literature review provides examples from different arts programmes, which gives a general overview of different arts practices and their specific benefits. The evaluation of different methodologies and their strengths and weaknesses also allows the reader to potentially utilise one of these methodologies to evaluate a certain arts programme. It is also important that the author notes the difficulties of measuring the benefits of arts programmes, especially due to external factors such as attrition, socio-economic status, educational backgrounds, and significant philosophical differences between the arts sector and the health sector. This literature review is comprehensive, provides a variety of contrasting methodologies and studies, and notes the difficulties of evaluating different arts programmes.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study does not have particular relevance to post-disaster artistic or creative initiatives in Christchurch. The literature review does, however, provide international evidence on how to evaluate the impacts of arts and culture initiatives. Therefore, the literature review has significant relevance on how to measure the benefits of arts and culture activities, and the methodologies used in these studies can be adopted for further research. Among other benefits, the literature review provides examples of how different arts programmes contribute to increased mental health, social cohesion, self-confidence, a sense of accomplishment, and overall quality of life.
SECTION D: Studies that have particular relevance to Economic Benefits

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre. “Christchurch Arts Audience Development Research”

Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** The data in this study was collected in May 2013 and analyses current Canterbury cultural consumption markets as well as potential cultural consumption markets.

- **Methodology Used:** Culture Segments market segmentation system

- **Organisations / events covered by the study:** A variety of national and Canterbury venues, including music venues, theatres, arts venues / events, dance venues / organisations, cultural festivals, and events in vacant spaces.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The study uses an already existing methodology from Morris Hargreaves McIntyre called Culture Segments. This methodology can be applied to any city’s arts and culture sector. In the case of this study, the methodology was applied to Canterbury cultural audiences post earthquakes, and does not compare itself to any pre-earthquakes data or any ongoing information. The survey of this report does, however, ask Canterbury residents about their cultural consumption both before and after the 2011 earthquakes, and their interest in attending in the future.

- **Particular relevance:** This study has particular relevance to the cultural and economic benefits of artistic and creative organisations. The report is a framework that arts and culture organisations can use to improve their organisation’s marketing, sales, and networking. This is beneficial for the economic growth of Cantabrian arts and culture organisations, as well as the overall cultural sector in Christchurch.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking?** The report does not specifically state the benefits that arts and culture have in a post-disaster environment; however, they do give recommendations to organisations that have the potential to do so. By providing local arts organisations recommendations to increase audience numbers, the report indirectly benefits the cultural and economic wellbeing of Christchurch.

Study Description

This report was conducted by the Christchurch Arts Audience Development (CAAD) Trust in collaboration with Morris Hargreaves McIntyre. The data used is provided by CAAD.

The report quantifies and profiles the current and potential market for the Canterbury region, positions organisations within its competitive environment and goes on to make evidence-based recommendations for developing new and deeper relationships with audiences. The report also includes data about art form consumption (size of the total market for each art form within Canterbury), changes in the behaviours of Canterbury residents regarding art form consumption since the 2011 earthquake, and reasons for attending events more frequently or less frequently.
Key Findings
The study lists its own key findings regarding the behaviours of Canterbury’s cultural and artistic consumers and participants. These include:

- Most residents have resumed some cultural activity since the earthquake.

- The breadth and frequency of that cultural activity is much reduced. Reasons for a reduction of attendance include a significant reduction in provision, the dislocation of established venues, and audiences making “earthquake-conscious choices” (i.e. being less comfortable in larger buildings).

- Levels of engagement have now fallen below the national average. The report shows that “just under two thirds of the current Canterbury arts market are either ‘one-off treaters or creatures of habit’, meaning that their attendance and willingness to experiment is likely to be limited” (pg. 33).

- New cultural offers, new patterns of activity, and new audiences are emerging. Examples include pop-up events in vacant spaces and outdoor events. These events are likely to attract certain segments of the market.

- There is a groundswell of opinion that supports and values arts organisations. This data comes from “informal feedback from Christchurch arts organisations who say their audiences have been vocally appreciative of their resilient efforts to continue staging events despite the many challenges they face” (pg. 10). A whole section of the report is dedicated to exploring awareness, attendance, and interest at national and local venues.

- The potential market is huge, as is the potential crossover of audiences. The potential culture market is defined as “Canterbury residents aged over 15 who were either culturally active before the 2011 earthquake or are interested in attending a cultural event in the future” (pg. 8).

Provenance
The Christchurch Arts Audience Development (CAAD) Project is governed by the CAAD Trust and operated by a consortium of Christchurch-based organisations led by the CAAD steering group. The steering group – made up of representatives from Canterbury Museum, Christchurch Arts Festival, Christchurch Art Gallery Te Puna o Waiwhetu, Christchurch and Canterbury Tourism, Christchurch Symphony Orchestra, Dance and Performance, New Zealand IceFest, SCAPE Public Art and Word Christchurch – acts together to make the arts part of everyday life for the people of Christchurch and Canterbury.

Morris Hargreaves McIntyre is a strategic research consultancy working within the culture, heritage, leisure, media, and charities sectors. Their focus is to help organisations develop enhanced consumer focus. They work to help cultural organisations become more creative in the way in which they are managed, more audience focused, more engaging, able to deliver greater impact and, as a result, more successful and sustainable.
Morris Hargreaves McIntyre’s *Culture Segments* is a market segmentation system that has been applied to several cities worldwide. Creative New Zealand adopted the system to understand the New Zealand cultural market and people’s cultural values and motivation. The segments are distinguished from one another by strong beliefs about the role that art and culture play in people’s lives, enabling organisations to understand what motivates them and develop strategies to engage them more deeply.

All data used in this study is taken from Morris Hargreaves McIntyre’s Audience Atlas Canterbury – a representative population of adults (aged over 15) who are in the market for arts, culture, and leisure activities and events. The data was collected in May 2013 using an online survey methodology, and is based on a sample of 600 respondents.

Their data and arguments are supported by information gathered from a variety of venues in the Canterbury region, as well as surveys from a carefully weighted percentage of the local Canterbury population involved in the market for arts and culture.

**Objectivity**
The results and evidence-based recommendations of this report are based significantly on Morris Hargreaves McIntyre’s *Culture Segments* segmentation system. It does not include any other arguments or methodologies from additional authors or research consultancy firms.

The types of art forms and venues analysed in the study are meant to represent a variety of institutions and organisations. The Cantabrians surveyed also consist of people of various ages, socio-economic profiles, and household situations. Those surveyed tended to be of New Zealand European ethnicities (77% of the population surveyed). The report also includes a variety of different national and local venues and arts organisations to assess residents’ attendance and awareness. These include traditional venues and events such as the Canterbury Museum, Isaac Theatre Royal, and the New Zealand International Film Festival, as well as more contemporary and post-earthquakes organisations and events like Gap Filler, FESTA, and Quake City.

**Persuasiveness**
This report uses a segmentation system that Morris Hargreaves McIntyre has used in other cities and a system that is supposedly innovative and more advanced than other segmentation systems: “*Culture Segments* is designed to be more subtle, granular and sophisticated than existing segmentation systems” (pg. 5). The report does not, however, refer to any other segmentation systems to compare to, nor does it use any other type of systems in its analysis.

Since Morris Hargreaves McIntyre conducted this report, it is understandable that they do not refer to any other systems, and that they depend on their own methodology for the results of this study. At points, however, they do promote this system, and even suggest to arts organisations to purchase the *Culture Segments* “Golden Questions”: “By including the *Culture Segments* ‘Golden Questions’ in any questionnaires or feedback forms, they can, for a small cost, profile those responses by segment and better understand who is doing what and who is thinking what in their own audience” (pg. 13). This promotion undermines the objectivity of the report, even though the additional payment of *Culture Segments* resources may be useful for arts organisations. Other then these “Golden Questions”, the majority of *Culture Segments* resources are free of charge.
Overall their segmentation system may help arts organisations organise potential audiences and consumers into diverse groups (or segments) of individuals with shared needs. These different segments vary depending on how actively individuals are involved in cultural consumption (highly active cultural consumers versus those for whom arts and culture is a low priority); the types of cultural consumption (e.g. sports versus music); and their reasons for cultural consumption (leisure, passion, relaxation, intellectual stimulation, etc.). Although the report does not provide any additional or contrasting arguments and methodologies, the one provided is thorough and valuable to Christchurch arts organisations.

**Value in relation to community wellbeing**

Unlike other studies that show the direct impacts or benefits that a specific arts organisation has had on the community wellbeing in Christchurch post earthquakes, this study provides a framework for arts organisations to improve their organisational structure and growth. The study also analyses the success of different arts organisations and evaluates their current markets. In regards to these markets, the study examines their consumer behaviours and categorises Cantabrian cultural consumers. The study argues that although new artistic and creative offerings are emerging, levels of engagement have reduced.

Organisations can use the market segmentation system with their media-planning agency to increase effectiveness. It uses a small set of “Golden Questions”, which can easily be included in audience surveys or databases to evaluate the success of campaigns and better understand existing audiences. The system can also be used to recruit focus group respondents and build online panels to explore your brand, test marketing campaigns and inform product development. If arts organisations can use this segmentation system to improve their structures, this could in turn provide additional benefits to the community wellbeing in Christchurch (through an increase of audiences / consumers and an increase in residents’ engagement of potentially beneficial art forms).

Cooper, Craig. “Christchurch Venue Overview and Assessment Report”

**Brief Analysis**

- **Time period covered by the study**: The Ministry for Culture and Heritage (MCH) commissioned this report in December 2013. Final fieldwork was conducted in January 2014.

- **Methodology Used**: Direct interviews, telephone interviews, site visits.

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: This report examines performing arts venues in Christchurch since the earthquakes. The report differentiates between Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3, and Tier 4 venues, which are different according to the services they provide and for whom they provide them. Some of these venues include the Isaac Theatre Royal, The Arts Centre Christchurch, Court Theatre, Music Centre of Christchurch, Douglas Lilburn Auditorium, and the James Hay Theatre.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The majority of the venues examined in the report are long-standing venues and institutions; however, the report also reviews the venues planned in the CCRP’s Performing Arts Precinct (PAP).
• **Particular relevance**: This study has particular relevance to the economic and cultural impacts of performing arts venues. It focuses on the importance of considering different types of performing arts venue in the PAP and in Christchurch in general.

• **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience/placemaking?** This report is related to the benefits of performing arts venues for the cultural sector of Christchurch. It outlines the different needs for specific types of performing arts venues in post-disaster Christchurch.

**Study Description**
This report gives an overview of the existing and planned performance arts venues of post-disaster Christchurch. The report analyses the CCRP’s PAP, and reviews what sorts of venues are necessary in Christchurch according to the current context (during the time the research was conducted). The report proposes an Optimum Facilities Matrix, which is “intended to assist decision making and to inform the CERA Planning and Community Toolset (PACT)” (pg. 2). The Optimum Facilities Matrix suggests the criteria for performing arts venues that a city the size of Christchurch would need to have a successful performing arts sector. The report concludes with recommendations for the performing arts sector of Christchurch on what types of venues are needed according to the existing and planned performance arts venues in the city.

**Key Findings**
This report provides an Optimum Facilities Matrix for performing arts venues in Christchurch, and separates the different kinds of venues into Tier 1, Tier 2, Tier 3, and Tier 4 venues. Tier 1 venues are purpose built, provide clean access for performing arts presentations and are specifically constructed to deliver mid- to large-scale theatrical events. Tier 2 venues are purpose built as well but are built as a venue for performance within an education organisation. Tier 3 venues are fit for purpose, meaning they are “well suited for the presentation of a specific kind of event, but suitability may be limited to certain performance genre” (pg. 6). Tier 4 venues are found spaces, “a location whose primary purpose is not for presentation of performing arts but that has been selected for a specific event, often with the deliberate intention of providing an unusual or unique artistic experience” (pg. 6). The existing and planned performance arts venues are organised within this framework of venues from the Optimum Facilities Matrix.

Within the Optimum Facilities Matrix the following venue types are outlined, and examples for each of them are provided: A large auditorium for 2000+ attendees; mid-size seated auditorium for traditional/symphonic/chamber music; theatre for staged productions for 1200+ attendees; dedicated theatre company venue; mid-size contemporary music venue seated/standing; community theatre venue; dance/physical theatre flexible ‘black box’; and an outdoor amphitheatre. The report emphasises the importance for particular attention towards a mid-size seated auditorium for traditional/symphonic/chamber music and a mid-size contemporary music venue seated/standing. The report argues that both types of venues are currently missing and are not yet highlighted within the CCRP’s PAP. The study concludes by providing suggestions on what kind of existing venues can be used as performance arts venues, and what kinds of venues will be necessary for a successful performing arts sector in Christchurch.
Provenance
The Ministry for Culture and Heritage commissioned this report in December 2013 under advice from the wider Joint Agency Group (JAG) group. The interviewees of the report consisted of several artistic directors and chief executives of pertinent performing arts venues in Christchurch. The Optimum Facilities Matrix for Christchurch was developed prior to the CCRP, and was submitted to Christchurch City Council in August 2013 and continues to guide decision making for performing arts venues since then. The report provides a detailed understanding of the restrictions of the venues listed in the CERA Planning and Community Toolset (PACT), and provides relevant information to guide future investment in performing arts venue infrastructures.

Objectivity
The interviewees from this report come from several prominent performing arts organisations in Christchurch. This allows for an informative perspective on what requirements are needed in terms of performing arts infrastructure in Christchurch. The report does note multiple areas that were not considered in the paper, including the provision of venues that are not listed on the Optimum Facilities Matrix, venues that may fulfil a need identified in the Optimum Facilities Matrix but sit outside the CBD, and facilities that may have the potential to address some of the need identified but are currently listed for demolition.

Persuasiveness
This report provides an informative Optimum Facilities Matrix that identifies the needs for performing arts venues in Christchurch. The report highlights what sorts of venues are necessary according to interviews with prominent actors involved in the performing arts sector in Christchurch. The report concludes with recommendations according to what venues already exist and according to which venues are planned within the CCRP’s PAP. These recommendations are “intended to help populate the CERA Planning and Community Toolset (PACT) and assist venue developers and users in their decision making” (pg. 3). The report provides an organised list of the performing arts venues necessary according to the needs of audiences and producers.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This report does not have direct relevance to the impacts of artistic and creative initiatives. The report does, however, outline the necessary criteria for performing arts venues in Christchurch. The recommendations in the study include fostering comprehensive operating models and organisational structures for each facility, continuing to recognise the benefits that accrue from the creation of clusters of facilities, supporting the development of black box theatre spaces for contemporary performances, and ensuring the provision of mid-sized venues according to consultation with arts sector groups. Although the report does not have direct relevance about how artistic and creative initiatives can contribute to community wellbeing, the recommendations from this report may support the sorts of initiatives that could have positive benefits. More specifically, the recommendations provided in this report would facilitate the promotion of cultural clusters and performance venues that can contribute to economic growth and cultural and social capital.

Brief Analysis

- **Time period covered by the study:** The data compared in this report is collated from the years 2006 to 2014.

- **Methodology Used:** Available national-level data, international literature.

- **Organisations/events covered by the study:** All arts-related activities covered by the Arts Council of New Zealand Toi Aotearoa Act 1994. The report does not mention any specific organisations or enterprises, but evaluates certain sectors as a whole.

- **When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated?** The information regarding the history of the organisations or enterprises examined in the study is not specified.

- **Particular relevance:** This report has particular relevance to the economic impacts of relevant arts-related activities and industries.

- **Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience/placemaking?** This report does not have particular relevance to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. The report provides an analysis of the economic benefits of arts-related activities and industries.

Study Description

This report was commissioned by Creative New Zealand and the Ministry for Culture and Heritage and conducted by economic research and analysis firm Infometrics. The report uses available national-level datasets from Statistics New Zealand. The data used for this report had to be relevant to the arts, which includes activities that involve creation for a unique or distinctive experience. Secondly, the researchers had to be confident that the datasets were overwhelmingly arts-related. The report uses an Input-Output framework to provide an overall economic analysis of the arts in New Zealand.

Key Findings

This report uses an Input-Output framework to provide an economic analysis of the arts in New Zealand. This “Input-Output table provides an internally consistent measure of sales and purchases within an industry” (pg. 11). The main areas of research examine the value added from the following industries: book publishing; professional photographic services; arts education; museum operation; performing arts operations; creative artists, musicians, writers and performers; and performing arts venue operations. The report notes that “The research also excluded some specific data categories – first, those related to creative design (because they were mostly geared to mass commercial production); and second, categories relating to the film industry (because it wasn’t possible to isolate the relevant data adequately)” (pg. 6). The research uses a cautious approach in deciding the criteria for the activities included in the report, and may underestimate the economic characteristics of the arts sector by excluding certain industries and/or activities.

The results of the report examine arts-related employment (including both employees and self-employed artists); household spending on the arts; sales and value-added data from each industry; and government support of the arts through funding (both central and local governments). The value-added data is measured “by subtracting the inputs that are used in the production of a good or service – inputs such as paper, energy, legal services and transport” (pg. 18). The report notes
that government funding for the arts is hard to quantify because it is usually under the criteria for cultural activities and generally not under any specific arts sector. The report ultimately provides estimates of the economic value of each artistic activity and industry.

Provenance
Infometrics provides industry, regional, and general economic analysis and forecasts that assist organisations in making their planning, policy, and strategic decisions. The datasets collated for the study were provided by Statistics New Zealand, a national research group that provides individuals, community groups, businesses, and government agencies economic, environmental, fiscal, population, and social statistics. The results may be out-dated and/or not directly pertinent to Christchurch’s post-disaster context.

Objectivity
The report lists several limitations of the research including exclusion of certain industries that could be considered among the artistic activities and industries examined in the study. Additionally, the report notes that “Measuring the economic contribution of the arts more accurately would require more and better data, including an updating of the 2006/07 IO table to provide a more recent estimate. In particular, it would be very useful to have better information on donations, subscriptions, and funding by local and central government, corporates, and households (pg. 28). The report also suggests that an awareness of the time New Zealanders spend engaging in the arts would also strengthen further research. Overall, the report emphasises its own limitations and provides suggestions for further areas of research.

Persuasiveness
The data in this report comes from trustworthy sources including Statistics New Zealand. The results, however, do not have any particular relevance to post-disaster Christchurch. Additionally, the report highlights several limitations including the exclusion of certain artistic and creative industries that may be relevant. The economic benefits noted in the report are regarding New Zealand as a whole and not specific to any particular regions or metropolitan areas. The report does provide pertinent recommendations for further areas of study.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This report does not have any particular relevance to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. Although the report does not examine any post-disaster artistic or creative initiatives, it reveals some limitations of government funding of arts and culture, and provides recommendations for facilitating funding of these initiatives. Overall, the report attempts to evaluate the economic impacts of arts and cultural activities in New Zealand, and provide relevant recommendations.

Allan, Corey et al. “Value and culture: An economic framework”

Brief Analysis
• **Time period covered by the study:** This study does not have any particular timeframe, but was published in August 2013.

• **Methodology Used:** Unavailable
• Organisations / events covered by the study: This study does not examine any particular organisations or events.

• When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? Unavailable

• Particular relevance: This study has particular relevance to the economic value of cultural goods, and provides a framework to analyse cultural goods using economic theories.

• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This study is not directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, nor is it related to community resilience / placemaking. Rather this study is an economic framework for measuring the value of cultural goods.

Study Description
This paper outlines the concept of economic value within a cultural context. The paper uses traditional economic theories to measure cultural goods; however, it emphasises that value includes any direct or indirect benefit to an individual created by an artistic or creative activity. The study analyses the economic values of cultural goods to both consumers and producers of cultural goods. Additionally, the study outlines techniques used to estimate the value of culture. Finally, the study explains the non-market instrumental values of cultural goods through the externalities that cultural goods can potentially produce.

Key Findings
This study initially describes economic perspectives on value, both in general and specifically within the cultural context. It first describes fundamental economic theory, and explains the definition of utilitarian economic theory, which states that individuals purchase goods based on maximising utility (wellbeing) through cost-benefit analysis. This assumes that “individuals have full knowledge of their preferences, that these preferences are stable over time, and that all goods are comparable in terms of their values” (pg. 11). The paper also analyses the economic perspectives on value within the cultural context, based upon the following types of value provided by cultural goods:

• Non-monetary return to producers: The non-monetary satisfaction derived from the production of cultural goods and services.

• Market use value: The value derived from the consumption of cultural goods and services purchased on the market.

• Non-market use values: The value derived from consumption of cultural goods and services not purchased on the market.

• Option value: The value an individual places on themselves or others having the option to consume and enjoy a cultural good at some point in the future, if the future provision depends on continued provision in the present economic perspectives on value, both in general and specifically within the cultural context.

• Existence value: The value an individual derives from knowing that a good exists, even though they will not consume the good.
• **Bequest value:** The value an individual derives from knowing that a good will be preserved for future generations to enjoy.

• **Instrumental values:** Benefits that accrue to people other than the producer or consumer as an indirect benefit from provision of the cultural service.

The study then analyses these values in regards to both consumers and producers. Additionally the study examines the instrumental values (positive externalities) of cultural goods, which “refers to the benefits which cultural goods provide to the wider society, i.e., to persons beyond the immediate consumer or producer of the cultural good” (pg. 19). These instrumental values include social cohesion and its associated benefits, a stronger democracy and the ability to attract talented people (i.e. the creative class). Ultimately the study provides approaches for implementing an economic perspective to estimate the value of cultural goods.

**Provenance**

This paper was commissioned and funded by the Ministry for Culture and Heritage. The authors of the study are from Motu Economic and Public Policy Research. Motu Economic and Public Policy Research is an independent non-profit economic and public policy research institute in New Zealand. This public policy research institute evaluates urban and regional economics, environmental issues, human rights, productivity and innovation, wellbeing, and macroeconomics. The study provides an extensive amount of supporting evidence that also analyses the economic benefits of cultural goods.

**Objectivity**

This study analyses the economic value of cultural goods, from both a traditional economic perspective (utilitarianism) and less traditional perspectives (behaviourism and instrumental value). It also evaluates the direct and non-direct values of cultural goods to both consumers and producers. The suggestions given are evaluated considering particular contexts, and each suggestion includes its own strengths and weaknesses. The study notes: “The (potential) failure of some of the economic assumptions suggests that economic valuation techniques, while valuable (and greatly superior to conventional impact analyses), should not be the sole method for determining funding allocations within the cultural sector” (pg. 39). The study admits that individuals active within the cultural sector contain the most in-depth knowledge about their own sector, and that these suggestions should be used solely as complements to pre-existing techniques of producing cultural goods.

**Persuasiveness**

This study contains an extensive amount of international literature and supporting evidence. The suggestions and findings in the study come from numerous other economic frameworks and research regarding the benefits of cultural goods and the arts. The understanding of consumers and producers of cultural goods is relevant and the direct and indirect value of cultural goods to these individuals is well researched. As noted in the study, “Indirect market and non-market use values arise because the participation in cultural or artistic activities can provide additional benefits to the individual other than the immediate experience attained while participating in the activity” (pg. 16). The authors of the study recognise that the values and suggestions provided in the study are not applicable to all art forms, or to everyone engaged in artistic or cultural activities.
Value in relation to community wellbeing
This study does not directly analyse a post-disaster artistic or creative initiative. It does, however, evaluate the economic impacts of artistic and creative initiatives. The findings from this framework could be useful for local arts organisations and local arts advisors. The study may enable arts organisations or individuals who are engaged in artistic or cultural initiatives to better understand the market and instrumental values of participation in the arts. Although this study does not relate to any specific post-disaster artistic or creative initiatives, it can provide a reference to consumers and producers of cultural goods for a better understanding of value in the cultural context.


Brief Analysis
• Time period covered by the study: This review was conducted between July and September 2013.

• Methodology Used: Evidence review based on an international literature review of 90 reports.

• Organisations / events covered by the study: This evidence review does not focus on any specific organisations.

• When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? The criteria for the reports used in this review were that they had to be published after 2010.

• Particular relevance: This review has particular relevance regarding the social, cultural, economic, and health impacts of artistic and creative initiatives. The study does not have any specific relevance to post-disaster initiatives in Christchurch.

• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This review is related to the wider benefits of arts and culture activities, but not in terms of any post-disaster contexts.

Study Description
This evidence review gathers international evidence from 90 reports regarding the social, cultural, educational, economic, and health impacts of arts and culture activities. Arts Council England commissioned this report based on a strategic framework developed in 2011 and finalised in 2013 called Great art and culture for everyone. This strategy aimed to focus on the work of Arts Council England over the next 10 years and encourage partnerships and shared purpose across arts and cultural sectors. This study aims to “assess the strength of the evidence base between 2010-13 about the economic, social, health and wellbeing, education, lifelong learning, and environmental impacts and outcomes of arts and culture in England” (pg. 10). Additionally, the study aims to assess specific methodologies and approaches that evaluate the direct and instrumental impacts of arts and culture.

Key Findings
Based upon international reports, this review collates the results and evidence that highlights the social, cultural, educational, economic, and health impacts of arts and culture activities. The aim of the review is to highlight evidence and research gaps, in order to complete further studies and
assess the research in relation to the goals set out in *Great art and culture for everyone*. The evidence review reveals numerous examples of how arts and culture activities contribute to the following key areas:

- **Economy**: The review identifies five ways in which arts and culture contributes to national and regional economies: “attracting visitors; creating jobs and developing skills; attracting and retaining businesses revitalising places; and developing talent” (pg. 7). Additionally, arts and culture activities can have spillover impacts into other sectors (such as tourism), contribute to household incomes, and promote skills development and networking.

- **Health and wellbeing**: “These studies show that arts and cultural activities can have a positive impact on the symptoms of conditions, for example improved cognition, physical stability, or self-esteem, and the ability of people to manage them, for example through changes in behaviour and increased social contact” (pg. 26). Individuals with certain health conditions such as dementia, depression, and Parkinson’s disease have also reported positive interventions through the arts.

- **Social**: “There is strong evidence that participation in the arts can contribute to community cohesion, reduce social exclusion and isolation, and/or make communities feel safer and stronger” (pg. 33). Additionally, the review notes that children and young people who have participated in arts and cultural activities more frequently engage in volunteering initiatives and group activities.

- **Education**: The review reveals multiple reports arguing that participation in structured arts activities increases socio-cognitive skills (empathy, adaptive emotion regulation, theory of mind), builds inward-looking self-esteem and self-awareness, and facilitates discussion in children around certain topics such as identity and citizenship. As noted above, participation in structured arts practices also contributed to outward-looking social confidence and connectedness, leading to increased engagement in volunteering and group activities.

Although this review provides international evidence about the direct and instrumental values of participation in arts and culture activities, it also reveals multiple evidence gaps. This includes evidence regarding the role of small-scale, publicly funded organisations in shaping talent development and long-term artistic careers; the instrumental impact of participation in arts among different population groups in different settings and contexts; a lack of statistical work on drivers of engagement and impact of arts and cultural engagement. The review lists several other evidence gaps, and provides recommendations for further areas of study.

**Provenance**

This evidence review contains results from numerous reports regarding the social, cultural, educational, economic, and health impacts of arts and culture activities. Arts Council England had certain criteria for the reports chosen. Firstly, the reports had to be published after 2010 and a had to be a “research study, outcome or process evaluation based on scientific principles containing primary data gathered using sound methodologies or robust analyses of secondary data” (pg. 13). Secondly, the reports were chosen based upon their relevance to particular themes including “the economy; creative and cultural industries; health and wellbeing; educational attainment and development; citizenship; crime; tourism; international development; environment and sustainability; and science and technology” (pg. 13). The research author and organisation had no vested interests in the research topic and had previously conducted robust, independent research.
Objectivity
The authors of the evidence review note that due to the robust nature of the research, some reports have been missed and are not included in the report. Additionally, the review notes that “We were clear from the outset that this review would focus on research and evaluation studies that present evidence from practice and practical examples of impact, rather than more discursive material that presents opinions, theories and ideas. Therefore we chose to exclude the following sources from this review: policy and strategy documents; sector and public consultations; and think pieces or critical commentary” (pg. 13). The review also highlights numerous gaps in evidence and research, in terms of underexplored topics and improvements for methodological approaches.

Persuasiveness
The reports chosen for this evidence review were selected based upon a clear and robust set of research questions and methodologies. The evidence review uses an extensive amount of reports to examine the values of arts and culture activities. Initially the authors sourced 500 reports, and the number was finally reduced to 90 based on the criteria above. The reports in this evidence review highlight both the intrinsic and instrumental impacts of arts and culture activities.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This evidence review does not have particular relevance to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. The review does, however, highlight numerous examples of how arts and culture activities provide social, cultural, educational, economic, and health impacts to participants. Although these benefits are not necessarily specifically relevant to the post-disaster context in Christchurch, the findings from the reports included in this review are pertinent and can be used to examine post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. More specifically, this evidence review provides areas for further study and recommendations regarding specific methodologies that could be useful for potential studies commissioned by MCH or other arts organisations, agencies, and institutions. Finally, the review makes recommendations for further research regarding the role of small-scale, publicly funded organisations in shaping talent development and long-term artistic careers, something that may be particularly relevant in the post-disaster context in Christchurch.

BOP Consulting. “Measuring the economic benefits of arts and culture”

**Brief Analysis**

- **Time period covered by the study**: The study draws upon materials and case studies from 2005-2012.

- **Methodology Used**: This report provides several research methodologies for arts and cultural organisations, including Economic Impact Assessment (EIA), Economic Footprint Analysis, Contingent Valuation (CV), and Social Return on Investment (SROI).

- **Organisations / events covered by the study**: This report evaluates certain research methodologies by examining particular case studies in the United Kingdom. Some of these organisations include BBC, Anvil Arts, AV Festival, Bolton museums, libraries and archives, and Tyne and Wear Museums.
• When were the activities or organisations that are examined in the study initiated? The case study organisations were each initiated during different periods, and none of them are post-disaster initiatives created in response to the Canterbury earthquakes.

• Particular relevance: This report measures the economic, social, and cultural impacts of arts and cultural organisations. The report suggests different research methodologies that can be used by arts and cultural organisations to evaluate the impacts of their initiatives.

• Is the study directly related to the benefits of arts and culture activities created after the Earthquakes, or is it more closely related to community resilience / placemaking? This study is related to the economic benefits of arts and cultural organisations, but in a general sense rather than discussing specific post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives. The organisations evaluated are organisations that exist within the United Kingdom.

Study Description
This report was conducted by BOP Consulting, an international consultancy specialising in culture and the creative economy. The report suggests certain research methodologies to arts and cultural organisations that may facilitate economic, social, and cultural assessments of their initiatives. The report examines the results of certain case studies of organisations that have previously used these methods. The two kinds of methodologies are spending-measure techniques (actual spending by organisations, audiences, and performers) and valuation techniques (evaluate the wider social and cultural benefits). The report ultimately provides a decision tree to help organisations decide which option would work best in their circumstances.

Key Findings
This report examines the benefits, risks, and limitations of certain research methodologies that evaluate the economic benefits of arts or cultural organisations. Each of the arts or cultural organisations used these particular research methods for certain outcomes; however, BOP’s report discusses the impact that these evaluation techniques had for the organisations post-study. Some organisations commissioned external research consultants to conduct the study for their organisation. A brief description of each methodology is provided below:

• Economic impact assessment (EIA): evaluates the pulling power and multiplier effect of arts and cultural organisations. “There are therefore three types of impact stemming from the spending of arts organisations: direct impacts, such as spending on goods from local suppliers; indirect impacts, such as spending by audience members in local restaurants; and induced impacts – the ‘multiplied’ effects of this spending within the local economy” (pg. 7).

• Economic footprint analysis: “focuses on measuring the size of an organisation’s activities, and comparing it with the national economy as a whole” (pg. 14). This evaluation technique uses employment and Gross Value Added (GVA) to measure the impacts of organisations within particular regions. “GVA is an estimate of the value generated for the UK economy as a whole by the organisation’s activities. It thus differs from EIA, which focuses on a locality or region. In essence, GVA measures the value an organisation ‘adds’ to its inputs in the course of making its outputs” (pg. 15).

• Contingent valuation (stated preference model): “aims to estimate the extent to which consumers benefit from a product or service, over and above the price they pay for it” (pg. 19).
Social return on investment (SROI): “aims to be a type of ‘social accounting’, which includes non-economic costs and benefits. At its heart, SROI is a way of understanding the value of an organisation’s activities based on their effects on the organisation’s stakeholders and audiences” (pg. 24).

The report evaluates the benefits, risks, and limitations of each of these techniques according to case studies of specific organisations that have used these approaches to measure the impacts of their activities. The majority of these techniques require primary as well as secondary data, extensive research expertise, and stakeholder involvement in order to conduct a credible evaluation. If organisations do not have the capacity to commission research, the report also suggests additional toolkits that facilitate the arts and cultural organisations to measure the economic value of their activities.

Provenance
The report was written by BOP Consulting, and commissioned by the Arts Council England. It recommends evaluation techniques that have been widely used by organisations within the cultural sector. The report notes that “There are other methods for measuring the wider benefits of arts and culture. This guide focuses on these two because they both try to assess benefits in ways that can be converted into monetary values” (pg. 3). The case study organisations that were chosen are only from the United Kingdom, however, and none of them are within New Zealand. The report evaluates the benefits, risks, and limitations of each of these evaluation techniques according the results from the case study organisations.

Objectivity
This report emphasises the risks and limitations of each of the evaluation techniques recommended. The report also notes that these evaluation techniques are not the approaches available to measure the impacts of arts or cultural activities. The report also suggests additional toolkits that may measure the economic benefits of artistic and creative initiatives in case of a lack of capacity to commission research. The report mentions that, although there are some economic impact assessments that make claims and suggest techniques that may not be credible, the techniques suggested in this report are the most utilised and referred to.

Persuasiveness
This report provides several evaluation techniques and toolkits to measure the economic benefits of arts and cultural organisations. Compared to other papers in this literature review that suggest impact assessment techniques, this report provides several techniques that can be used in specific contexts. According to the report, the techniques and toolkits suggested are some of the better-known approaches for the arts and cultural sector.

Value in relation to community wellbeing
This report does not have particular relevance to post-disaster artistic and creative initiatives, nor does it relate to either a New Zealand or Christchurch context. The report does, however, provide several evaluation techniques for artistic and creative organisations to gauge the economic benefits of their activities. The report includes case study organisations that have successfully utilised these evaluation techniques, and emphasises that each of these techniques should be used properly according to specific contexts. This report can serve as a framework for arts and cultural organisations to measure the economic, social, and cultural benefits of their initiatives.